

CITY OF NEWBURGH

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION

123 Grand Street, Newburgh, New York 12550

Michele Basch, Chairperson

Omar E. Balbuena-Palma, Secretary

Phone: (845) 569-7380 Fax: (845) 569-9700

MINUTES

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION

Meeting of April 10, 2018

The monthly meeting of the City of Newburgh Architectural Review Commission was held on Tuesday, April 10, 2018 at 6:30 p.m. at the Activity Center, 401 Washington Street, Newburgh, NY 12550.

Members Present: Michele Basch, Chairperson
Christopher Hanson
Isaac Diggs
Jeff Wilkinson
Jim Hoekema
Hannah Des Cognets
James Kelly

Also Present: Jeremy Kaufman, Assistant Corporation Counsel
Omar E. Balbuena-Palma, Secretary to the Land Use Boards

The meeting was called to order at 6:35 p.m. after a quorum was confirmed.

Minutes of the March 13, 2018 Meeting

Mr. Hoekema moved to approve the minutes from the March 13, 2018 meeting as submitted.
Mr. Diggs seconded the motion.
The motion was approved unanimously.

CONSENT AGENDA

AR 2018-17 16 Henry Avenue
To replace all of the windows in-kind.
Applicant/Owner: Michael Brennan / Joseph and Claire Carmody

Mr. Hanson moved to approve the Consent Agenda.
Mr. Kelly seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

AR 2018-02

107 Broadway

Application to remove the existing gable roof, low-slope roof and framing area of the original theater house and install a new low-slope roof; repair the damaged masonry; and install a new parapet and parapet cap.

Applicant/Owner: Lisa Silverstone / Safe Harbors of the Hudson

Sabeen Hasan, Project Architect, and Ramona Monteverde, Director of Operations, appeared before the Board. The Project Architect gave a brief overview of the project and highlighted the following:

- Added details to 107 Broadway to blend in with the neighborhood
- Added emphasize to the end cap of 107 Broadway
- Extended the top of the brick parapet wall
- New brick and mortar will match the existing masonry
- Stage house will be reclad in corrugated metal
- Penthouse roofing will be kept, edge trim will be painted to match corrugated metal
- Install new metal siding
- Stormwater will be funneled to bioswale
- Downspout will be have a 5-inch diameter
- Accessory metal will be painted Dark Bronze

Ms. Monteverde said the interior of the stage house is good condition.

Mr. Kelly confirmed there are no proposed cisterns.

Mr. Hanson confirmed the proposed downspouts connect to the existing drainage.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel reminded the Board that Ms. Monteverde is a member of the City Council, but that she was present at the meeting solely in her capacity as a member of Safe Harbors. He said Ms. Monteverde's presence should not be considered as advocacy by the City for or against the project. He instructed the Board to view Ms. Monteverde's presence just as it would any other applicant and that the Board should evaluate the application on its merits only..

Mr. Hoekema moved to approve the application as submitted.

Ms. Basch seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll call vote.

AR 2018-16

66 Johnston Street

Application to install a new porch and front door; new vinyl windows and to repair/replace the cornice.

Applicant/Owner: Lu Nicaj / M & N Newburgh Development, LLC

Lu Nicaj, Applicant and Member of M & N Newburgh Development LLC, Owner, appeared before the Board. He gave a brief overview of the project and said he is proposing to install new Anderson windows with a custom arch top.

Ms. Basch said she is hesitant to approve custom arch tops filled in with wood and not glass. She confirmed the existing windows are not repairable.

Mr. Nicaj said he doesn't understand why his windows are not acceptable replacements.

Ms. Basch read the Window Replacement guidelines found in page 7 of the Design Guidelines for Newburgh's East End Historic District.

Mr. Hanson said the proposed windows do not match the original size and type of window.

Mr. Nicaj said the original type of windows are very expensive. He said one window is approximately \$1,500.00 and he owns several buildings that will require similar types of windows.

The Board suggested that Mr. Nicaj submit an application to the State Historic Preservation Office ("SHPO") to obtain financial assistance.

Mr. Diggs said arched windows will add value to the building and are required if an application is submitted to SHPO.

Mr. Hanson added that the difference in price will be minimal.

Ms. Des Cognets said the current drawings show a discrepancy between the existing windows and proposed windows. She said the drawings should be revised to accurately represent the proposed window type, color and style. She said the door replacement should complement the building style and the proposed windows should be able to hold paint.

Mr. Wilkinson said the door should be made of wood and the revised plan should include details on the trim.

Mr. Kelly said the building most likely had a double door in the front with a transom on top.

Mr. Nicaj said the existing door frame is too narrow for a double door.

Mr. Kelly said the existing door is not original to the building and a larger double door with a glass transom on top can be accommodated. He drew a sketch and presented it to Mr. Nicaj for reference (which was made part of the record).

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Anthony Dobler, Project Contractor for 76 Henry Avenue, said adding glass to an arch window frame is expensive.

There was no one else present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Ms. Basch said she is comfortable approving the porch and railing portion of the application.

Mr. Nicaj said he wants to move forward on the project and agreed to install new arch windows that match the window frame and a double door with a transom.

Mr. Hanson moved to approve the application, subject to the following conditions.

- Install a new porch and railings per application specs
- Install new 2/2 Anderson 200 series windows or similar with glazing that matches the brick arch top
- Install a new, full width (48 inches) double door with a glass transom over the top. Each solid door will be divided into 4 panels as per the sketch.

Ms. Basch seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll call vote.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

AR 2018-09

76 Henry Avenue

To replace all front, side and rear windows on the brick part of the building with vinyl windows.

Applicant/Owner: Anthony Dobler / Merault Almonor

Merault Almonor, Property Owner, and Anthony Dobler, Project Contractor, appeared before the Board. The Owner said the intent is to replace the windows with energy efficient windows.

Ms. Basch clarified there are no existing window arches on the front and side of the building. She clarified the window arches on the rear are fill-in arches.

Mr. Hanson said the window material should be wood or wood clad 1/1 windows. He said vinyl windows are not as durable as wooden windows and the proportions do not accurately match the original windows. He said vinyl windows may be installed on parts of the building not visible from the street.

Ms. Des Cognets clarified that according to the Historic Guidelines, synthetic material windows are acceptable, such as vinyl, provided that the replacement windows are able to hold paint.

The Board discussed the porch, door and columns of 76 Henry Avenue.

Mr. Diggs clarified that the Owner must return with a separate application for a determination on those portions of the building.

Mr. Kelly moved to approve the application, subject to the following conditions.

- Replace all visible windows from the street with wood or wood clad 1/1 windows that fit into the existing window opening.

Mr. Hoekema seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll call vote.

AR 2018-18**199 South Street**

Application to replace all the windows; repair/replace the brick and cornice; paint the building using colors from the Benjamin Moore color palette.

Applicant/Owner: David Edward Fishel

David Fishel, Property Owner, appeared before the Board. The Owner said the intent is to renovate the vacant building, install new windows, and paint the building. He said the masonry will be repaired/replaced with appropriately colored mortar and the wooden storefront will be replaced with a glass storefront. He said the corbels will be repaired and painted in a dark grey color.

Mr. Diggs asked if the windows were vinyl or vinyl clad windows.

The Owner said the vinyl windows have aluminum cladding and he does not understand why vinyl windows are generally not allowed in the Historic District.

Ms. Basch read the Window Replacement guidelines found in page 7 of the Design Guidelines for Newburgh's East End Historic District. She said synthetic windows generally do not hold paint.

Mr. Hanson added that the top window panel in vinyl windows are usually bigger than the bottom window panel to compensate for its reduced durability and the sash lines do not match. He said the Owner may want to provide additional window documentation to address these issues.

Mr. Hoekema asked why the first floor color of the building is different from the remaining floors.

The Owner said the brick is currently painted and he intends to preserve this feature.

Mr. Hanson said he is comfortable approving a different color on the ground floor.

Mr. Wilkinson said he is comfortable approving a modern approach to the storefront but accurate details are missing from the application and he requires a façade drawing in order to make a determination on the application.

The Owner agreed to submit a line drawing with additional details on the storefront, the lighting and windows.

The Owner requested that his application be tabled. The Board asked the Owner to submit façade drawings for the Board's consideration and attend the May 8, 2018 ARC meeting.

AR 2018-19**321 Liberty Street**

To install a new sign in front of the building.

Applicant/Owner: Mohammed Alshaikh / 321 Liberty St. LLC

Mohammed Alshaikh, Applicant, and Rhonda Turner appeared before the Board. The Applicant said the intent is to install a new sign on the wall of 321 Liberty Street. He said the proposed sign

was previously purchased and he was not aware that ARC approval was required for installation. He said brick clips will be used to hang the sign.

Ms. Basch read the Signs & Awnings guidelines found in page 18 of the Design Guidelines for Newburgh's East End Historic District. She clarified the proposed lettering is made of plastic with internal lighting.

Mr. Hoekema said the Board cannot approve plastic-faced, internally-lit cabinet type signs.

Ms. Des Cognets said she admires the Applicant's enthusiasm and she would feel comfortable if the plastic lettering is removed and replaced with painted vinyl lettering. She asked if the Applicant is open to installing a blade sign.

Mr. Hanson agreed and said a blade sign would probably attract more customers.

Mr. Diggs said he would feel comfortable approving the application if the Applicant returned with additional details of the sign.

The Owner requested that his application be tabled. The Applicant was informed to submit additional details for the Board's consideration and attend the May 8, 2018 ARC meeting.

With no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 8:20 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Omar E. Balbuena-Palma
Secretary to the Land Use Boards