

CITY OF NEWBURGH
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
123 Grand Street, Newburgh, New York 12550

Michele Basch, Chairperson
Omar E. Balbuena-Palma, Secretary
Phone: (845) 569-7380 Fax: (845) 569-9700

MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting of May 8, 2018

The monthly meeting of the City of Newburgh Architectural Review Commission was held on Tuesday, May 8, 2018 at 6:30 p.m. at the Activity Center, 401 Washington Street, Newburgh, NY 12550.

Members Present: Michele Basch, Chairperson
Christopher Hanson
Jim Hoekema
Hannah Des Cognets
James Kelly

Members Absent: Isaac Diggs
Jeff Wilkinson

Also Present: Jeremy Kaufman, Assistant Corporation Counsel
Omar E. Balbuena-Palma, Secretary to the Land Use Boards

The meeting was called to order at 6:35 p.m. after a quorum was confirmed.

Minutes of the April 10, 2018 Meeting

Mr. Hanson moved to approve the minutes from the April 10, 2018 meeting as submitted.
Ms. Des Cognets seconded the motion.
The motion was approved unanimously.

CONSENT AGENDA

AR 2018-20 100 Third Street
To paint the exterior walls Jet Black (Benjamin Moore), the door Lichen Green (Benjamin Moore) and the window frame, trim and inset panel Collingwood (Benjamin Moore).
Applicant/Owner: Shayla Sellars (SASRE Properties, LLC) / Ali C. Hocek & Cynthia Corsiglia (100 Third St. LLC)

AR 2018-21 164 Grand Street
To replace the slate roof in-kind.
Applicant/Owner: Julie Tremblay

AR 2018-27

263 Grand Street

To paint the brick Olive Gray (Valspar), the trim Silver Dust (Valspar) and the Brownstone Trim in Brooklyn Brownstone (Valspar).

Applicant/Owner: Hans Obel Jensen

Mr. Hanson moved to approve the Consent Agenda.

Ms. Basch seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously.

OLD BUSINESS

AR 2018-19

321 Liberty Street

To install a new sign in front of the building.

Applicant/Owner: Mohammed Alshaikh / 321 Liberty St. LLC

The Applicant did not appear for the meeting. The application was tabled until the June 12, 2018 ARC meeting.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

AR 2018-22

133 Johnston Street

To replace 14 windows with vinyl windows.

Applicant/Owner: Scott McKinney / Lisa & Joseph Blanding

Scott McKinney, Applicant and Project Coordinator from Power Home Remodeling, appeared before the Board. He said the building has a mix of vinyl and wood windows and the intent is to replace all of the windows. He said the proposed windows have a different top sash.

Ms. Basch confirmed the proposed windows are 6/1 vinyl windows and said vinyl windows take up more window space and have less glazing than wooden windows. She said the proposed windows do not fit within the character of the neighborhood and the replacement windows should match the previous window style.

Mr. Kelly said the adjacent buildings at 135 & 133 Johnston Street have 2/2 windows and the replacement windows should be 2/2 also.

Mr. Hanson confirmed the proposed windows do not hold paint and said the replacement windows should be made from a paintable material. He asked if clad windows were considered.

The Project Coordinator said his company does not sell clad windows.

Ms. Des Cognets said vinyl windows may be installed on parts of the building not visible from the street.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Ms. Basch suggested repairing the existing windows or consideration of 2/2 clad wood windows.

The Project Coordinator said wooden windows are too expensive.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel clarified no financial information was submitted for consideration.

Mr. Hanson said he does not feel comfortable approving vinyl windows that do not hold paint. He said the Owner should consider repairing the existing windows or replacing the windows with 2/2 wood clad windows that fit into the existing window opening.

The application was tabled and the Applicant was informed to submit additional information for the Board's consideration.

AR 2018-23

9 Lilly Street

To replace 12 windows with vinyl windows.

Applicant/Owner: Samantha N. Page

Samantha Page, Property Owner, appeared and Scott McKinney, Project Coordinator from Power Home Remodeling, remained before the Board. The Project Coordinator said the existing windows are vinyl windows and the Owner has agreed to replace the windows in-kind.

The Owner said the current windows are in disrepair and there are no existing wooden windows on the property.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said the property lies within the Colonial Terraces Design District and said in-kind replacement of vinyl windows are acceptable if they meet the Colonial Terraces Design Standards. He said the Board may consider the visual and aesthetic compatibility with surrounding properties and whether the building is a contributing member of the district.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Ms. Des Cognets confirmed the window grids will remain the same.

Mr. Hanson said the color and style of the replacement windows fit within the Colonial Terraces Design District.

Mr. Hoekema moved to approve the application as submitted.

Ms. Basch seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll call vote.

AR 2018-24

2 Bush Avenue

Seeking ratification of the erection of a fence without ARC approval.

Applicant/Owner: Nadia Balbuena

Nadia Balbuena, Property Owner, appeared before the Board. She said a person was shot and killed near her home and gave a brief history of other safety-related incidents in her neighborhood. She erected a fence behind an existing Boxwood hedge in order to keep her children and dog safe. She said the fence is located on a corner lot with a gate on Third Street and requested to keep the existing fence which was erected without ARC approval.

Ms. Basch clarified that the fence is made out of wood and is taller than the hedge by approximately 1 foot.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Brian Flannery, 5 Norton Street, said the intent of the guidelines was to allow the ARC to approve rear yard fences only, up to 6 feet tall.

There was no one else present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Ms. Basch asked if the Owner is comfortable with a shorter fence.

The Owner said she is comfortable with a slightly shorter fence.

The Board discussed the fence height and determined a height of 4 feet was appropriate under the circumstances.

Ms. Basch said a 4-foot fence satisfies the guidelines and provides reasonable security.

Mr. Hoekema confirmed that the Owner intends to screen the fence entirely with the Boxwood hedge.

Mr. Hanson moved to approve the application, subject to the following conditions.

- Reduce the height of the existing fence to 4 feet
- Assure that the boxwood hedge does not exceed the height of the fence

Mr. Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll call vote.

AR 2018-25

38 Liberty Street WH

To replace the roof, the front porch, the windows and front door.

Applicant/Owner: Charles Ortiz / Veronica Heights LLC

Charles Ortiz, Property Owner, appeared before the Board. The Owner said the roof needs to be replaced and the façade needs to be restored. He said the intent is to install architectural shingles on the roof, repair/repoint the brick, paint the building, rebuild the porch to its original form and replace the windows and door.

Ms. Des Cognets said she needs additional details on the windows and door.

The Owner submitted the Trimline window spec sheet (which was made part of the record) and said the existing door is in disrepair. He said the proposed door will be a divided wood double door with glass panels.

Mr. Hanson said replacing the slate roof with architectural shingles does not fit the style of the neighborhood.

Mr. Kelly said the slate roof looks to be in repairable condition.

Ms. Basch informed the Owner to look into tax credits by the State Historic Preservation Office to mitigate the project costs.

The Owner said he will look into repairing the roof and tax credits. He requested a vote on the roof to begin work on the project.

Mr. Hanson clarified that the door will be sized to the original opening.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Julius Walls, Reverend for the A.M.E. Zion Church of Newburgh at 111 Washington Street, said tax credits help with financing.

There was no one else present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Hanson moved to approve the application, subject to the following conditions.

- Windows will be 1/1 clad wood Trimline Legends DR-200 with no dividers painted black
- Building will be painted Extra White 257-C1 (Sherwin Williams), Aurora Brown 2837 (Sherwin Williams), and Black Magic 6991 (Sherwin Williams) per application specs
- Front door will be a divided wood double door with glass panels, sized to the original opening
- Repair/repoint the brick
- Repair/replace the porch per application specs
- Repair/replace the roof portion visible from Liberty Street in-kind.

Ms. Basch seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll call vote.

AR 2018-26 111 Washington Street
To demolish the church.
Applicant/Owner: Milton Stubbs, Pastor / A.M.E. Zion Church of
Newburgh

Pastor Milton Stubbs and Reverend Julius Walls appeared, both representing the Property Owner. Mr. Walls submitted a letter for consideration (made part of the record) and gave a brief narrative on the project. He highlighted the following:

- The building is growing increasingly expensive to maintain at a rate the Church cannot afford;
- The Church requests approval to demolish the building;
- Architectural features of existing building will be salvaged;
- Construction of a modern church with handicap accessibility and flexible uses;
- Construction of approximately 50 apartments with a community space.

Mr. Kelly clarified that the approval requested is to demolish the existing structure and incorporate salvaged features such as: doors, bells, etc.

Reverend Walls stated that the building is not a historic building in that it is not part of any Federal or State historic register.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel confirmed that information, but clarified that the City deemed the building to have historic character and contribute to the aesthetic of the historic district. He said in addition to ARC approval, the Applicant will eventually require some type of approval by the Planning Board, especially in connection with the proposed apartment use.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel then said for ARC purposes and for the proposed demolition, the Applicant must follow the criteria found in §300-42 of the City Code.

Mr. Walls said the project architects/engineers will not invest additional time or resources on the project until the demolition approval is secured. He said they are requesting approval on the condition that they return with a fully-developed plan later on.

Mr. Hanson said he cannot approve a demolition without elevation drawings and additional information.

Mr. Hoekema said additional information for consideration should be submitted that addresses the criteria found within §300-42 of the City Code. He said the plan does not have to be fully developed but a concept plan should be provided with a narrative.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said the revised application should directly address the requirements in §300-42 (B). The revised application should also submit a replacement project plan per §300-42(C). The replacement project plan needed to be at least a narrative “vision” plan

that illustrated more details about the Applicant's plan to replace the existing structure. The ARC could then conditionally approve the demolition but impose a waiting period of up to 120 days for additional detail/information, per §300-42(D)(2).

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Dmitry Pavlov, 146 Third Street, said additional information should be provided that demonstrates demolishing is more cost-effective than repair and the Applicant should propose alternative methods than simply demolishing the building. He said the impact on people attending the Church should be taken into consideration as well.

Naomi Hersson-Ringskog, said the Owner should look into the New York State program called Sacred Sites and religious-assistance development firms in New York City for help on the project.

There was no one else present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The application was tabled and the Applicant was informed to submit additional information for consideration for the June 12, 2018 ARC meeting.

With no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 8:30 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Omar E. Balbuena-Palma
Secretary to the Land Use Boards