

CITY OF NEWBURGH
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
123 Grand Street, Newburgh, New York 12550

Michele Basch, Chairperson
Omar E. Balbuena-Palma, Secretary
Phone: (845) 569-7380 Fax: (845) 569-9700

MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting of January 8, 2019

The monthly meeting of the City of Newburgh Architectural Review Commission (“ARC”) was held on Tuesday, January 8, 2019 at 6:30 p.m. at the Activity Center, 401 Washington Street, Newburgh, NY 12550.

Members Present: Michele Basch, Chairperson
Jeff Wilkinson (arrived at 6:36 p.m.)
Hannah Des Cognets
Jim Hoekema
James Kelly

Members Absent: Christopher Hanson
Isaac Diggs

Also Present: Jeremy Kaufman, Assistant Corporation Counsel
Omar E. Balbuena-Palma, Secretary to the Land Use Boards

Minutes of the December 11, 2018 Meeting

Mr. Hoekema moved to approve the minutes from the December 11, 2018 meeting as submitted.
Mr. Kelly seconded the motion.
The motion was approved unanimously.

OLD BUSINESS

AR 2018-75

Applicant: SASRE Properties LLC
Owner: Nina Abney Chanel
Location: 12 Forsythe Place

Application to replace the windows, doors, rear deck and replace the exterior shingles with wooden slats.

Shayla Sellars, Construction Manager for SASRE Properties LLC, appeared before the Board representing the Property Owner.

The Construction Manager gave a brief review of the project, including:

- Remove the deteriorated cedar shingles and install cedar horizontal wood slats;
- Replace all windows and doors;
- Install a new rear deck to replace the existing deck.

The Construction Manager said at the December 11, 2018 ARC meeting, the ARC requested elevations of the proposal. She said her client asked for alternatives that did not require installing 3/1 windows. She said she was unable to find any historic pictures of the windows and asked if the existing windows may be replaced with a wood/composite material in the same style. She said approximately four (4), 1/1 windows were replaced in the rear.

Ms. Des Cognets said the Owner is allowed to repair any existing windows without approval by the ARC but will require an application if the Property Owner intends to change the window color. She said the painting application may be placed on the consent agenda without an appearance by the Property Owner. She said the Property Owner also has the option to replace the windows in-kind without ARC approval.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel affirmed Ms. Des Cognets statements and said window repair is preferable to window replacement per the East End Historic District Design Guidelines.

Jeff Wilkinson arrived at 6:36 p.m. to the meeting.

The Construction Manager asked if there were additional details the ARC wanted addressed.

Ms. Basch said the ARC requested elevation drawings to clarify the details of the proposal.

Mr. Wilkinson said drawings for the deck proposal will be required by the Building Department.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said the Building Department will not approve a Building Permit application for exterior work in the East End Historic District until the Applicant obtains approval by the ARC. He said the design aspects submitted for ARC approval should be similar to the any building permit application.

The Construction Manager agreed to submit elevation drawings for the proposal.

Ms. Basch said the Construction Manager should discuss the window options with the Property Owner and submit the determination as part of the elevation drawings.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said the Construction Manager should ask additional questions to address any other concerns on the project.

Mr. Wilkinson said the overall project seems acceptable but due to the amount of proposed work, the details need to be on elevation drawings.

The Board tabled the application and informed the Applicant to return with a drawing/rendering of the modifications that includes addressing window repair/replacement.

AR 2018-81

Applicant: Joseph Ariano
Owner: Joseph Ariano
Location: 48 & 50 City Terrace

Application to amend the approved windows and doors.

Joseph Ariano, Property Owner, appeared before the Board.

The Property Owner said he received ARC approval at the December 11, 2018 ARC meeting. He requested an amendment based on comments he subsequently received from the State Historic Preservation Office (“SHPO”) on December 27, 2018. He gave a brief overview of the amendments, including:

- Proposing new construction windows, custom sized to fit brick-to-brick in the rough opening;
- Remove existing wood window casings. Windows would remain 1/1 aluminum clad double hung, painted Desert Tan;
- Proposing salvaged front doors in Italianate style;
- Front doors modified to fit the original door opening and painted Wenge AF-180 (Benjamin Moore)

Mr. Wilkinson confirmed that the windows would be a full replacement installed in the rough window opening, instead of an insert unit.

Ms. Basch clarified that seven (7) windows will be installed brick-to-brick.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said the public should have a chance to comment on the application in light of the new information.

The Chairperson re-opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Wilkinson said the amendment request adequately addresses the SHPO comment letter.

Mr. Wilkinson moved to accept the amendment request, subject to the following conditions:

- Install seven (7) 1/1 aluminum clad double hung windows painted Desert Tan, custom sized to fit in the existing brick-to-brick opening, per the State Historic Preservation Office comment letter dated December 27, 2018;
- Install a modified Italianate style door within the original door opening painted Wenge AF-180 (Benjamin Moore) per application specs;
- Applicant shall satisfy remaining comments set forth in the State Historic Preservation Office comment letter dated December 27, 2018.

Ms. Basch seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

The Chairperson said applications AR 2018-85, AR 2018-86, AR 2018-88, and AR 2018-90 will be presented by the Applicant together and the Board will vote on each application separately.

AR 2018-85

Applicant: Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh
Owner: Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh
Location: 116 William Street

Application to alter the first floor façade and remove the entry door and attached steps; install new siding, windows and double door; repair/replace sidewalk and curb per the City of Newburgh Streetscape Standards; and paint the exterior using colors from the Benjamin Moore color palette.

AR 2018-86

Applicant: Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh
Owner: Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh
Location: 118 William Street

Application to alter the first floor façade and remove the entry door and attached steps; install new siding, windows and double door; repair/replace sidewalk and curb per the City of Newburgh Streetscape Standards; and paint the exterior using colors from the Benjamin Moore color palette.

AR 2018-88

Applicant: Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh
Owner: Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh
Location: 124 William Street

Application to remove the second floor porch and adjust the first floor facade; install new siding, windows, concrete stoop and double door; repair/replace sidewalk and curb per the City of Newburgh Streetscape Standards; and paint the exterior using colors from the Benjamin Moore color palette.

AR 2018-90

Applicant: Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh
Owner: Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh
Location: 128 William Street

Application to modify the first floor façade and remove the basement entry door; install new windows and double door; repair/replace sidewalk and curb per the City of Newburgh Streetscape Standards; and paint the exterior using colors from the Benjamin Moore color palette.

Chris Schuck, Construction Manager for Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh, appeared before the Board on behalf of the Property Owner.

The Construction Manager said Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh owns 116, 118, 122, 124, 126 and 128 William Street. He said the Board approved applications AR 2018-87 and AR 2018-89 for 122 and 126 William Street at the December 11, 2018 meeting. He said the proposals on the remaining applications were revised to obtain a commercial look to address the concerns of the Board. He gave an overview of the changes and highlighted the following for 116 William Street:

- Remove one (1) entry door, accompanying stoop and existing siding from the first floor;
- Install three (3) new window openings on the first floor;
- Install Hardie panels with trimmed moldings in Newburyport Blue HC-155 (Benjamin Moore) and Hale Navy HC-154 (Benjamin Moore) on the first floor;
- Install matching cashmere colored 2/2 Marvin integrity double hung windows on the first floor and on the existing second floor window openings;
- Existing arches above the windows to remain;
- Repair/replace cornice brackets in-kind painted Hale Navy HC-154 (Benjamin Moore);
- Repair/replace cornice in-kind painted Philadelphia Crème HC-30 (Benjamin Moore);
- Repair/repoint and repaint brick in Jackson Tan HC-46 (Benjamin Moore);
- Install overhang to maintain a storefront look in between first and second floor;
- Replace damaged front door with new single door painted Hale Navy HC-154 (Benjamin Moore);
- Repair remaining concrete stoop;
- Repair sidewalk and curb as necessary per City of Newburgh Streetscape Standards.

The Construction Manager said the proposals for 118, 124 and 128 William Street were substantially the same as 116 William Street. He asked for feedback on the proposed overhang.

Mr. Kelly said the original style of building would have had a small overhang above the decorative brickwork on the doorway.

The Construction Manager confirmed the overhang would not cover the decorative brickwork.

Mr. Wilkinson said he is not certain whether the overhang is required. He said the brick may be left exposed.

Ms. Basch confirmed there is brick behind the overhang.

Mr. Wilkinson said the boxed-in section of the first floor may be recessed so that the brick can have a one (1) inch reveal.

Mr. Kelly said the first floor extension on the façade of 124 William Street is not original to the building and it should be removed.

Mr. Wilkinson said the second floor porch at 124 William Street should also be removed.

With respect to application AR 2018-85 (for 116 William Street)

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Wilkinson moved to approve the application as submitted subject to the following conditions:

- Remove one (1) entry door, accompanying stoop and existing siding from the first floor;
- Install three (3) new window openings on the first floor per application specs;
- Install Hardie panels with trimmed moldings in Newburyport Blue HC-155 (Benjamin Moore) and Hale Navy HC-154 (Benjamin Moore) on the first floor per application specs;
- Install matching cashmere colored 2/2 Marvin Integrity (brand) double hung windows on the first floor and on the existing second floor window openings per application specs;
- Existing arches above the windows to remain;
- Repair/replace cornice brackets in-kind painted Hale Navy HC-154 (Benjamin Moore);
- Repair/replace cornice in-kind painted Philadelphia Crème HC-30 (Benjamin Moore);
- Repair/repoint and repaint brick in Jackson Tan HC-46 (Benjamin Moore) per application specs;
- Horizontal headpiece for the overhang will be inset with the storefront assembly to leave the brick exposed above;
- Replace damaged front door with new single door painted Hale Navy HC-154 (Benjamin Moore) per application specs;
- Repair remaining concrete stoop;
- Repair or replace sidewalk and curb as determined by City staff and per City of Newburgh Streetscape Standards.

Ms. Basch seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

With respect to application AR 2018-86 (for 118 William Street)

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Ms. Des Cognets moved to approve the application as submitted subject to the following conditions:

- Remove one (1) entry door, accompanying stoop and existing siding from the first floor;
- Install three (3) new window openings on the first floor per application specs;
- Install Hardie panels with trimmed moldings in Country Redwood HC-183 (Benjamin Moore) and Newburyport Blue HC-155 (Benjamin Moore) on the first floor per application specs;
- Install matching cashmere colored 2/2 Marvin integrity double hung windows on the first floor and on the existing second floor window openings per application specs;
- Existing arches above the windows to remain;
- Repair/replace cornice brackets in-kind painted Country Redwood HC-183 (Benjamin Moore);
- Repair/replace cornice in-kind painted Philadelphia Crème HC-30 (Benjamin Moore);
- Repair/repoint and repaint brick in Jackson Tan HC-46 (Benjamin Moore) per application specs;
- Horizontal headpiece for the overhang will be inset with the storefront assembly to leave the brick exposed above;
- Replace damaged front door with new single door painted Newburyport Blue HC-155 (Benjamin Moore) per application specs;
- Repair remaining concrete stoop;
- Repair or replace sidewalk and curb as determined by City staff and per City of Newburgh Streetscape Standards.

Mr. Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

With respect to application AR 2018-88 (for 124 William Street)

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Ms. Des Cognets moved to approve the application as submitted subject to the following conditions:

- Remove existing second floor porch and first floor extension on the façade per application specs;
- Install four (4) new window openings, a door opening and a concrete stoop per application specs;
- Install Hardie panels with trimmed moldings in Van Dusen Blue HC-156 (Benjamin Moore) and Newburyport Blue HC-155 (Benjamin Moore) on the first floor per application specs;
- Install matching cashmere colored 2/2 Marvin integrity double hung windows on the first floor and on the second floor window openings per application specs;
- Existing arches above the windows to remain;
- Repair/replace cornice brackets in-kind painted Newburyport Blue HC-155 (Benjamin Moore);
- Repair/replace cornice in-kind painted Philadelphia Crème HC-30 (Benjamin Moore);
- Repair/repoint and repaint brick in Jackson Tan HC-46 (Benjamin Moore) per application specs;
- Horizontal headpiece for the overhang will be inset with the storefront assembly to leave the brick exposed above;
- Replace damaged front door with new single door painted Newburyport Blue HC-155 (Benjamin Moore) per application specs;
- Repair or replace sidewalk and curb as determined by City staff and per City of Newburgh Streetscape Standards.

Ms. Basch seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

With respect to application AR 2018-90 (for 128 William Street)

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Ms. Basch said confirmed the arch above the existing door opening will be maintained.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel confirmed the Applicant will submit revised drawings for the record.

Ms. Basch moved to approve the application as submitted subject to the following conditions:

- Install matching cashmere colored 2/2 Marvin integrity double hung windows on the first floor and on the second floor window openings per application specs;

- Install Hardie panels with trimmed moldings in Van Dusen Blue HC-156 (Benjamin Moore) and Newburyport Blue HC-155 (Benjamin Moore) on the first floor per application specs;
- Existing arches above the windows and door to remain;
- Repair/replace cornice brackets in-kind painted Van Dusen Blue HC-156 (Benjamin Moore);
- Repair/replace cornice in-kind painted Philadelphia Crème HC-30 (Benjamin Moore);
- Repair/repoint the existing brick;
- Horizontal headpiece for the overhang will be inset with the storefront assembly to leave the brick exposed above;
- Replace damaged front door with new double-door and transom painted Newburyport Blue HC-155 (Benjamin Moore) per application specs;
- Repair or replace sidewalk and curb as determined by City staff and per City of Newburgh Streetscape Standards.

Ms. Des Cognets seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

PUBIC HEARINGS

AR 2018-57

Applicant: John Wood
Owner: John Wood
Location: 57 Liberty Street WH

Application to replace all the windows with aluminum clad wood windows.

John Wood, Property Owner, appeared before the Board.

Mr. Wood said the intent is to replace all of the windows with 1/1 aluminum wood clad windows painted black to match the existing style.

Ms. Des Cognets confirmed the existing windows are 1/1 windows.

Ms. Basch clarified the windows will be Anderson 400 series windows.

Mr. Wilkinson confirmed the windows will be installed to fit the full masonry opening.

Mr. Wood said he would like to rebuild the porch and install a fence on the property. He said the Secretary to the Land Use Boards advised him to consult the Building Inspector to determine if the rebuild required ARC approval, as the proposed work may not be visible from the street. He believed that approximately six (6) feet of wooden fencing would be visible from the street with a gate.

Mr. Wilkinson said the Board should focus on the window application now and consider the fence and porch later.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Ms. Des Cognets moved to approve the application as submitted.

- Replace all of the windows with Anderson 400 series 1/1 aluminum wood clad windows to fit the existing masonry opening.

Mr. Hoekema seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2019-01

Applicant: SASRE Properties, LLC. (Shayla Sellars)

Owner: Andrew G. Murphy

Location: 47 S. Miller Street

Application to rebuild the porch and install new light fixtures; replace the windows, doors and siding; and paint the exterior using colors from the Benjamin Moore color palette.

Shayla Sellars, Construction Manager for SASRE Properties LLC, appeared before the Board representing the Property Owner.

The Construction Manager said the intent is to replace the siding with cedar siding, replace the windows and rebuild the porch. She asked if the submitted elevation drawings and narrative were sufficient for approval.

Mr. Wilkinson said the window details along with the door details are not clearly displayed on the elevation drawings. He said the drawings should be revised to include those details.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said the information provided to the ARC will be reviewed by the Building Department and they will need to see all of the construction details together.

Mr. Kelly said the 6/6 window in the alley is in good condition and has lasted a long time. He said it would be a shame if it were removed. He suggested salvaging the window or repurposing it.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel asked whether the 6/6 window is visible from the street.

Ms. Basch said the Applicant should consult the Property Owner for a determination on the 6/6 window. She informed the Construction Manager that the 6/6 window has a historic value to it and should be repurposed. She asked for a clarification on the window details.

The Construction Manager clarified that the proposed windows will be 2/2 aluminum-clad windows. She said the Property Owner will be consulted regarding the 6/6 window and the drawings will be revised to include the requested details.

Ms. Des Cognets clarified the window manufacturer will be Weathershield.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel confirmed the intent is to replace all of the windows on the building with 2/2 window aluminum-clad windows except for two (2) smaller windows on the third floor.

The Construction Manager said the smaller windows will be replaced with 1/1 aluminum-clad windows.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Ms. Basch moved to accept the following portions of the application, subject to the following conditions:

- Remove the aluminum siding and restore the existing cedar siding underneath in Stonington Gray HC-170 (Benjamin Moore);
- Replace the windows on the upper floors of the West and South elevations with 2/2 aluminum clad windows painted Essex Green HC-188 (Benjamin Moore);
- Replace the smaller windows on the South elevation with 1/1 aluminum clad windows painted Essex Green HC-188 (Benjamin Moore);
- The Applicant must return for a determination regarding the deck rebuild, the windows under the deck, the window on the southeast corner, the light fixtures, and the doors.

Ms. Des Cognets seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2019-02

Applicant: Luis Gualpa
Owner: Luis Gualpa
Location: 380 Liberty Street

Application to rebuild the porch; replace the windows and doors; install a metal fence; and paint the modifications Berry Brown PPU24-02 (BEHR).

Luis Gualpa, Property Owner, appeared with Hector Gualpa, who acted as Luis Gualpa's translator, before the Board.

Hector Gualpa said the intent is to install four (4) 1/1 windows, replace the main entrance door, install a metal fence on the front of the building and paint the modifications Berry Brown PPU24-02 (BEHR).

Mr. Wilkinson confirmed the window replacements will be from the Anderson 200 series windows. He suggested replacing 1/1 windows with 2/2 windows.

Hector Gualpa said the top floor windows are 1/1 windows and the intent is to match those windows.

Ms. Basch clarified that the three (3) existing windows on the top floor will not be replaced and only four (4) windows will be replaced on the building.

Hector Gualpa confirmed that two (2) windows on the basement and two (2) windows on the first floor will be replaced.

Mr. Kelly said the windows should be 2/2 windows and the entry door should be a double door. He said the original building did not originally have a single door.

Ms. Des Cognets said she is concerned about approving the vinyl windows mentioned in the elevation drawings.

Ms. Basch clarified that the proposed windows are wood interior vinyl clad windows. She said full vinyl windows are not acceptable in the Historic District. She said full vinyl windows reduce light filtration and warp over time but vinyl clad windows are acceptable since the interior is made of wood. She suggested donating any replaced windows.

Ms. Des Cognets said the filled-in part of the entry door should be removed to allow the installation of a double door.

Hector Gualpa said the building is safer with a single entry door made of metal.

Ms. Basch said the Applicant should consider alternative doors for the entry. She said a solid wood door with side panels or a solid wood double door is just as secure as a metal door. She said the

Applicant should return after considering the alternatives. She asked what material will be used for the staircase.

Hector Gualpa said the porch will be constructed using pressure treated wood and painted Berry Brown PPU24-02 (Behr).

Mr. Wilkinson said concrete blocks are not required for the porch. He said the porch should be constructed using only wood.

Ms. Des Cognets said the metal railing may be up to 40 inches per the East End Historic District Guidelines.

Hector Gualpa said the fence is proposed to be four (4) feet high.

Mr. Hoekema said he does not mind a fence height of four feet.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Kelly moved to accept the following portions of the application, subject to the following conditions:

- Replace two (2) windows on the basement and two (2) windows on the first floor facade with 1/1 vinyl clad double hung windows painted Berry Brown PPU24-02 (BEHR);
- Install a black, four-foot tall metal fence in the front of the building per application specs;
- Install a pressure-treated wood only porch (i.e. no masonry) per application specs;
- The Applicant must return for a determination regarding the door.

Ms. Des Cognets seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2019-03

Applicant: Erick Cooney
Owner: Red Javelin Holdings LLC.
Location: 10 Farrington Street

Application to replace the existing porch hand railings with wrought iron railings painted using colors from the Benjamin Moore color palette.

Erick Cooney, Applicant, appeared before the Board.

Mr. Cooney said the intent is to stabilize the front porch and install wrought iron railings identical to the railings next door at 12 Farrington Street.

Ms. Des Cognets confirmed there are no additional changes.

Mr. Wilkinson said stabilizing the steps and adding wrought iron railings is a positive improvement to the neighborhood.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Ms. Basch moved to approve the application as submitted.

- Stabilize the steps;
- Install wrought iron railings with a 1¾" wide molded cap rail identical to 12 Farrington street per application picture;
- The Applicant has the option to paint the railings Black HC-190 (Benjamin Moore) or Heritage Red HC-181 (Benjamin Moore).

Mr. Hoekema seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

With no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 8:00 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Omar E. Balbuena-Palma
Secretary to the Land Use Boards