

CITY OF NEWBURGH

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION

123 Grand Street, Newburgh, New York 12550

Michele Basch, Chairperson

Omar E. Balbuena-Palma, Secretary

Phone: (845) 569-7380 Fax: (845) 569-0188

MINUTES

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION

Meeting of December 8, 2020

The monthly meeting of the City of Newburgh Architectural Review Commission ("ARC") was held on Tuesday, December 8, 2020 at 6:30 p.m. using Zoom videoconference.

Members Present: Michele Basch, Chairperson
Christopher Hanson
Hannah Des Cognets
Jim Hoekema
James Kelly (arrived at 7:10 p.m.)
Jeff Wilkinson
Reggie Young

Also Present: Jeremy Kaufman, Assistant Corporation Counsel
Omar E. Balbuena-Palma, Secretary to the Land Use Boards

Minutes of the November 10, 2020 Meeting

A vote on the November minutes were tabled until the January meeting.

OLD BUSINESS

AR 2020-68

Applicant: GRCGNY
Owner: 123-127 South William St LLC
Location: 123 South William Street

Returning for a determination on the sidewalk.

Christopher Berg, Project Architect from Berg + Moss Architects, appeared before the Board on behalf of the property owner.

The Project Architect gave a brief review of the project and said the application was revised to address the City Engineer's comment letter. He said the applicant proposes to plant six trees, reset the bluestone, and install new concrete sidewalks utilizing concrete curbing instead of granite curbing.

Mr. Young requested a clarification on the proposed trees for planting.

The Project Architect said the applicant proposes to plant six (6) lilac trees (a/k/a Syringa Reticulata).

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said the Applicant may choose the type of tree to plant from a list of approved trees in the City Code.

The Project Architect said they are willing to plant any tree the Board prefers.

The Chairperson suggested planting Cherry Blossom trees.

The Project Architect asked if they must commit to planting a specific type of tree.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said the process to plant a tree is not part of ARC consideration or authority. Planting of any proposed trees in the public right of way must be reviewed by the Superintendent of Public Works.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Hoekema moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2020-72

Applicant: Judice Management LLC

Owner: Judice Management LLC

Location: 520 Liberty Street

Application to demolish the building and reconstruct a new building that matches the existing style.

Michael Henderson, Project Architect, appeared before the Board on behalf of the property owner.

The Project Architect said he provided additional details on the drawings for consideration since the last meeting.

Mr. Wilkinson said the application looks complete.

Mr. Hanson asked why the window over the entry door was removed.

The Project Architect said the area above the entry door will be a closet and a window would not make sense.

Mr. Hanson said the Applicant may install a smaller window instead.

Mr. Young said installing a window is aesthetically pleasing.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson commended the Applicant for providing the requested details on the drawings.

Mr. Hanson moved to approve the application as submitted subject to the following condition:

- Applicant must install a new window above the front door that matches the dimensions of the original window (applicant is required to submit a photo of the existing window as part of a building permit application for reference).

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

Mr. Kelly arrived to the meeting at 7:10 p.m.

AR 2020-87

Applicant: Anthony Williams

Owner: Michele A. Williams

Location: 130 Lander Street

Application to install new light fixtures and replace the stoop.

Anthony Williams, Applicant, appeared before the Board with the property owner, Michele Williams.

The Applicant gave a brief overview of the project and said the intent is to repair/replace the front steps and install two new solar light fixtures in front of the building. He said the stairs need to be replaced for safety reasons.

The property owner said the light fixtures will make the property more appealing.

The Chairperson asked if the solar lights will function on days when the sun is blocked from view.

The Applicant said the proposed solar lights are motion activated and reviews indicate they should function even when sun is blocked from view.

The property owner said the solar lights dim when there is no one nearby.

The Applicant said the intent is to replace the stairs as well.

Mr. Wilkinson said the existing stairs appear to be made out of wood. He said the proposed design of the stairs may not be in compliance with the Building Code.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said if the approved design of the porch is not compliant with the Building Code, the Building Department will advise the Applicant, and the Applicant may have to revise the plan and that revision may require a subsequent appearance before the Board.

The Applicant said the existing stairs do not extend to the sidewalk. He said the intent is to extend the stairs by 30-inches to match the length of the stairs on the buildings nearby.

The Applicant said the intent is to replace the railing as shown on an image provided through the Zoom screen share.

Mr. Young asked if the stairs will be angled to include dual posts at the top of the stairs.

The Applicant said they are unable to include dual posts at the top of the stairs without changing the design because there isn't enough room to include additional posts. He said the Newell posts will be at the bottom of the stairs.

Mr. Kelly said the proposed Newell posts and balustrades are too thin. He said the posts should be thicker. He said the railing was thicker when the building was constructed around 1875.

Mr. Hanson said the Applicant should install 6 x 6 newel posts with 2-2½ inch spindles.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson moved to approved the application as submitted, subject to the following conditions:

- Install two solar light fixtures on the sides of the entry door per application specs;
- Replace the entry steps per application specs;
 - Stairs must have 6 x 6 newel posts and 2 x 2 balustrades.

Mr. Hoekema seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll call-vote.

AR 2020-88

Applicant: Anthony Williams
Owner: Greenheart Holdings, LLC
Location: 131 Lander Street

Application to install new light fixtures and replace the entry doors.

Anthony Williams, Applicant, remained before the Board on behalf of the property owner with Michele Williams.

The Applicant gave a brief overview of the project and said the intent is to install new steel doors with new solar light fixtures in front of the building. He said the light fixtures will match the light fixtures at 130 Lander Street.

Mr. Kelly confirmed a steel door is currently installed on the property. He said the building would've had double doors originally installed with a transom above. He said the door appears to be an in-kind replacement from the current, existing door.

Mr. Hoekema clarified the intent is to replace the steel door with another steel door and not to replace the entire entryway.

The Chairperson said the Applicant is proposing an in-kind door replacement.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Kelly said the Board encourages the Applicant to renovate the building back to its original condition.

The Chairperson asked if the Applicant is willing to consider installing a double door. She said the Board may include that option in the decision letter.

The Applicant agreed to consider the option.

The Chairperson moved to approve the application as submitted subject to the following condition:

- Applicant has the option to install a wooden double door with a transom at the top of the stairs.

Mr. Hoekema seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

AR 2020-91

Applicant: Anthony Williams
Owner: 146 Johnston St LLC
Location: 146 Johnston Street

Application to replace the doors and stoop; install new light fixtures and paint the cornice and soffits.

Anthony Williams, Applicant, remained before the Board on behalf of the property owner with Michele Williams.

The Applicant gave a brief overview of the project and said the intent is to repair/replace the porch, install new solar light fixtures in front of the building and paint the soffit and cornice. He said the light fixtures will match the light fixtures at 130 Lander Street.

Mr. Kelly confirmed the soffit is currently clad in aluminum.

Mr. Wilkinson said the aluminum should be removed.

Ms. Williams agreed to remove the aluminum.

Mr. Wilkinson said the property would've had double doors originally installed with a transom, like the previous application. He said the Applicant is allowed to replace the door in-kind but the Board strongly encourages the replacement of the door with a double-door.

Ms. Williams said she was not aware that the building originally had double doors but she is willing to explore the feasibility of installing a double door.

Mr. Kelly said the building was constructed circa 1890.

The Chairperson said the aluminum covering on the cornice should be removed.

Mr. Hanson said the Applicant may choose a grey color from the Historical color palette to paint the original cornice underneath the aluminum instead of painting the aluminum.

Ms. Williams asked if the ARC had any preference in color.

The Board said the Applicant is free to choose any color from the historical color palette.

Mr. Wilkinson said the stairs should be thicker with square balusters.

Mr. Kelly said the Newell posts should be 6 x 6 with two-inch balustrades.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Kelly moved to approve the application as submitted subject to the following conditions:

- Aluminum flashing at the soffit must be removed;
- Replace the entry doors in-kind per application specs;
 - Applicant has the option to install a wooden double door with a transom at the top of the stairs instead;
- Replace the entry stairs per application specs;
 - Stairs must have 6 x 6 newel posts and 2 x 2 balustrades.
 - Applicant has the option to install 6 x 6 squared newel posts with lambs' tongue chamfered corners instead of the ball top newel posts.

Mr. Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2020-92

Applicant: Denis Cruz & Doris L. Alicea

Owner: Denis Cruz & Doris L. Alicea

Location: 35 Liberty Street WH

Application to ratify the existing steps.

The Applicant did not appear. The Board tabled the application until the next ARC meeting.

AR 2020-93

Applicant: Arleen Perez

Owner: Arleen Perez

Location: 287 Third Street

Application to replace the windows.

Arleen Perez, property owner, appeared before the Board.

The property owner gave a brief overview of the project and said the intent is to install new aluminum, double hung 6/6 windows on the building. She said the building was purchased from the City of Newburgh and the existing windows are white vinyl double hung windows that are not original to the building.

Mr. Kelly said the proposed windows have false muntins that he is not in favor of approving. He said the building would've originally had 1/1 or 2/2 windows.

The Chairperson read the window replacement guidelines from the East End Historic District Design Guidelines for the benefit of the Applicant and the public.

Mr. Hanson said he is in favor of installing either 1/1 or 2/2 windows.

Mr. Wilkinson said the proposed windows should be aluminum clad windows.

The Applicant said she is open to installing 1/1 clad wood windows.

The Chairperson said the Applicant should submit a specification sheet for the new windows.

Mr. Kelly said the windows should extend the full opening of the window from brick to brick.

The Chairperson clarified the proposed windows must fit into the existing window opening as viewed from the outside and extend from brick to brick.

The Application was tabled and the Applicant was informed to submit a spec sheet for the windows in order to attend the next ARC meeting.

AR 2020-94

Applicant: Arleen Perez

Owner: 357 Liberty Corp.

Location: 357 Liberty Street

Application to replace the windows.

Arleen Perez, Applicant, remained before the Board on behalf of the property owner.

The Applicant said the intent is to install 6/6 aluminum windows on the building.

Mr. Kelly said 6/6 windows with false muntins are not appropriate to the building.

The Applicant said she can install 1/1 windows.

Mr. Kelly said the Applicant should submit a spec sheet for consideration.

Mr. Wilkinson asked if the rolling door will remain in place. He said the Applicant should return with clear details for consideration.

The Applicant said the rolling door will remain in place.

Mr. Young said the windows are arched top windows.

Mr. Kelly said the Applicant should install arched windows. He asked what is behind the rolling doors.

The Applicant said a wooden door with glass is behind the rolling door.

Mr. Kelly said he is interested to see what is behind the rolling door.

The Application was tabled and the Applicant was informed to submit a spec sheet for the windows and any other exterior modifications in order to attend the next ARC meeting.

AR 2020-95

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects PC

Owner: Newburgh SHG 1 LLC

Location: 157 Broadway

Application to replace the windows and doors; repair the cornice; repoint the brick; install new light fixtures and paint the exterior of the building using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said applications AR 2020-95 through AR 2020-105 will be presented by the same Applicant.

The Board decided to consider as many applications as possible, with a meeting cutoff time at 9:30 p.m., and discuss scheduling a special meeting for any unfinished Board business.

Chris Berg, Applicant from Berg + Moss Architects PC, appeared before the Board on behalf of the property owner with Adam Shayanfekr.

The Applicant gave a brief overview of the application and highlighted the following:

- Replacing all of the windows;
- Installing new light fixtures;
- Painting the building using colors from the Benjamin Moore historic color palette;
- Upgrading the existing cornice;
- Replacing the front doors.

Mr. Wilkinson confirmed the proposed windows are Andersen Fibrex 100 series windows. He said windows from the Andersen 400 series are preferred.

Mr. Young said the cost difference to install the higher quality 400 series windows is minimal and the Board should encourage the Applicant to install a higher-grade window.

Mr. Hanson said he views windows with longevity in mind and the Applicant should install higher quality windows because they are more cost effective in the long run.

The Applicant said he needs to review the feasibility of the higher priced windows.

Mr. Kelly said he is in favor of installing the 400 series windows,

The Chairperson read the window replacement guidelines from the East End Historic District Design Guidelines for the benefit of the Applicant and the public. She clarified that the proposed windows must be able to hold paint.

The Applicant said it's possible to paint aluminum windows but the paint may not properly adhere to the material.

Mr. Hanson said Fibrex 400 series windows are able to hold paint.

Mr. Young confirmed there is a horizontal shaft in between the building at 157 Broadway.

The Applicant said the bay window will be divided into three separate windows.

Mr. Young asked for additional details on the wooden lintel.

The Applicant said he may have to replace the wooden lintel with a brick lintel in a darker color.

The Chairperson confirmed the intent is to paint the entire building utilizing dark colors.

Mr. Kelly said Senator Hamilton Fish launched his campaign from this building in 1942 and the bay window, though not original, has been in existence for approximately 80-100 years. He said the bay window may be considered historical.

The Applicant said he is in favor of keeping the bay windows with a small lintel above.

The Chairperson asked for the intent of the basement windows.

The Applicant said the intent is to install two awning windows on the basement.

Mr. Young suggested installing a double door.

Ms. Des Cognets agreed with Mr. Young.

Mr. Kelly said the building may have had a double door entry.

The Applicant said the entryway appears to be too narrow for a double door.

Mr. Kelly said the building was probably constructed circa 1890.

Mr. Shayanfekr clarified the building was constructed in 1910.

Mr. Kelly said it's possible the building may have originally had a single door installed.

The Applicant said they are in favor of installing a single door.

The Chairperson asked if the Applicant intends to install a new third-floor window on the side elevation.

The Applicant said a third-floor window will be installed and it was accidentally omitted from the drawings.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson moved to approve the application as submitted subject to the following conditions:

- Install new Andersen Wood or Fibrex windows on the building per application specs;
 - Install new side windows on the second and third floor bump out;
 - Awning window glazing configurations in the basement will be side-by-side;
- Install a transom above the three first-floor windows;
- Install new light fixtures per application specs;
- Repoint the brick;
- Install new entry doors per application specs;
 - Applicant has the option to install an entry door with glazing at the top of the stairs;
- Paint the exterior using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette per application specs.

Mr. Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed 5-1.

Mr. Wilkinson voted against the application.

Mr. Young abstained.

AR 2020-96

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects PC

Owner: Newburgh SHG 3 LLC

Location: 181 Broadway

Application to replace the windows and doors; repair the cornice; modify the storefront; install new light fixtures and a new signage band; repoint the brick and paint the exterior of the building using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

Chris Berg, Applicant from Berg + Moss Architects PC, remained before the Board on behalf of the property owner with Adam Shayanfekr.

The Applicant said the lot was previously subdivided and the footprint of the building occupies the entire lot. He said the intent is to renovate the building per the submitted drawings.

Mr. Kelly said 181 Broadway was constructed circa 1847 and it is one of the oldest building on Broadway. He said the building would've originally had 6/6 windows installed and the cornice would not have had a fascia. He said the corbels would've been directly installed to the brick and it would've had a simple yankee gutter.

The Applicant said they intend to paint the building green and will revise the plan to remove the fascia piece from the cornice. He said they do not intend to install yankee gutters and asked if a six-inch half round gutter is acceptable.

Mr. Kelly said half round gutters are better than seamless gutters.

The Applicant said they intend to modify the storefront and asked if installing a mural on the side of the building is acceptable.

Mr. Kelly said he is not in favor of the mural because it may become an advertising block later.

Ms. Des Cognets said a mural is different than installing a sign.

The Applicant said there is a drainage issue on the rear of the roof that needs to be addressed.

Mr. Kelly said the Applicant should look into removing the gutter from the side elevation.

Mr. Young said the Applicant may install a gutter made out of zinc.

The Applicant said they were proposing to install a steel gutter but they are open to installing a gutter made out of zinc.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Wilkinson said there should be a glass transom above the entry door and below the signboard.

Mr. Kelly said the building should have a transom with a Greek revival door.

Mr. Wilkinson said he has no issues with installing 2/2 windows but the storefront needs some modification. He said he is not in favor of the gutter's location and the Applicant should look for an alternative location. He said a better construction material for the gutter would suffice if an alternative location is not feasible.

Mr. Kelly said the building used to house Madam Charlotte, a Tarot card reader in 1944. He confirmed the Applicant is proposing to install Andersen 100 series windows.

The Applicant said the entire storefront will be new and they will consider installing a transom above the entry door. He said they will submit a separate application regarding signage and the mural later.

Mr. Kelly confirmed the Applicant is proposing to install Andersen 100 series windows.

Mr. Wilkinson said he is not in favor of the proposed windows. He said the proposed windows are not durable.

The Chairperson asked the Applicant if he is willing to install higher quality windows.

Mr. Young said the Applicant should install higher quality windows.

The Applicant said he understands the window concern and he will consult the property owner.

Mr. Hanson asked if the Applicant is applying for historic tax credits.

The Applicant said they are not applying for historic tax credits.

The Chairperson asked for a motion on the application.

Mr. Wilkinson said he is in favor of tabling the application. He said the Applicant should submit revised details for consideration.

Mr. Young said there are too many modifications needed to the drawing and the Applicant should return with updated drawings.

Mr. Kelly said the roofline looks inappropriate without a fascia. He said the Applicant should install a soffit with small corbels instead.

The application was tabled and the Applicant was informed to submit a revised drawing for consideration at the next ARC meeting.

Special Meeting Discussion

The Board discussed holding a special meeting for the remaining agenda items and collectively agreed to hold a special meeting on Thursday, December 17 beginning at 6: 30 p.m.

Mr. Hanson said he will not be able to attend a December 17 ARC meeting,

With no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 10:00 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Omar E. Balbuena-Palma
Secretary to the Land Use Boards