

CITY OF NEWBURGH

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION

123 Grand Street, Newburgh, New York 12550

Michele Basch, Chairperson

Omar E. Balbuena-Palma, Secretary

Phone: (845) 569-7380 Fax: (845) 569-0188

MINUTES

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION

Meeting of June 9, 2020

The monthly meeting of the City of Newburgh Architectural Review Commission ("ARC") was held on Tuesday, June 9, 2020 at 6:30 p.m. using Zoom videoconference.

Members Present: Michele Basch, Chairperson
Hannah Des Cognets
Christopher Hanson
Jim Hoekema
James Kelly
Jeff Wilkinson (arrived at 7:42 p.m.)
Reggie Young

Also Present: Jeremy Kaufman, Assistant Corporation Counsel
Omar E. Balbuena-Palma, Secretary to the Land Use Boards

Minutes of the March 10, 2020 Meeting

Mr. Hoekema moved to approve the minutes from the March 10, 2020 meeting as submitted.
Ms. Basch seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously.

CONSENT AGENDA

AR 2020-20

Applicant: Scott Raffaele
Owner: 17 William, LLC
Location: 17 William Street

Application to paint the exterior of the building using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

Mr. Kelly said the existing brick color appears to be the natural brick color and he is hesitant to approve painting over it.

Ms. Basch said she is not in favor of painting the lintels either. She said she does not have an issue with allowing the owner painting over the existing wood.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said the Board may approve a portion of the application.

Mr. Hoekema moved to approve the application subject to the following condition:

- Paint the wooden exterior of the building;
- Applicant must return for a determination regarding painting the brick and masonry portion of the application.

Ms. Basch seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously.

OLD BUSINESS

AR 2019-93

Applicant: Virgilio Cruz

Owner: Virgilio Cruz and Martha Cruz

Location: 80 Overlook Place

Returning for a determination on the fence in front of the building.

The Applicant could not attend the meeting. The Applicant requested the Board table his application.

The Board tabled the application until the July 14, 2020 ARC meeting.

AR 2020-3

Applicant: Z3 Consultants, Inc.

Owner: M & N Newburgh Dev. LLC

Location: 39 Lutheran Street

Application to install new windows and a front entry door.

The Applicant could not attend the meeting. The Applicant requested the Board table his application.

The Board tabled the application until the July 14, 2020 ARC meeting.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

AR 2020-19

Applicant: Eli Vaknin
Owner: 5 Liberty LLC
Location: 5 Liberty Street WH

Application to repair/replace the existing porch; remove the brick paint and paint the window bays using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

Eli Vaknin, Applicant, appeared before the Board representing the property owner.

The Applicant gave a brief overview of the project and highlighted the following.

- Exterior will be painted using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette;
- Existing paint on the brick will be removed;
- Replace the porch.

My. Young said he does not have any information on the arched door on the lower level of the Liberty Street side. He said the door appears to be original and asked if there is a proposed plan for the door.

The Applicant said he has no plans for the existing door.

Mr. Young said the Applicant should preserve those doors to the extent possible.

Mr. Kelly said the doors would've been stained a dark color and not originally painted. He said the existing porch is not original to the building and was added later on. He said he has a few photographs of the building available.

The Applicant requested the photographs for reference.

Mr. Kelly agreed to forward the photographs.

Mr. Young said the Applicant should take care when repointing the building. He asked if the chimney is used to vent the boiler.

The Applicant said he is unsure if the chimney is still active.

The Chairperson confirmed the porch will be repaired where possible and replaced per the submitted drawings.

Mr. Kelly asked if the porch will be extended.

The Applicant said the porch will maintain the existing footprint.

Mr. Hanson clarified there is a modification on the last section of the porch steps. He confirmed the stairs will extend to the sidewalk.

Mr. Kelly asked for a clarification on the balustrades. He advised the Applicant to install balustrades that are heavier and stronger than what is typically sold in commercial chains.

Mr. Young asked the Board if the column under the porch should be screened with a lattice. He said plywood appears to connect the columns together.

The Applicant said he is unsure what that space was utilized for but it appears to be just an empty space underneath the porch.

Mr. Young said the Applicant may consider removing the plywood and opening up the space under the porch.

Mr. Hanson said the Board can leave that portion open for consideration by the Applicant.

Mr. Kelly said he is in favor of opening up the space under the porch.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson said the porch needs additional detail and suggested granting a partial approval on the application.

Mr. Kelly said he found an original photograph of the building and clarified that there was an enclosed porch originally constructed. He said the porch originally had turned balustrades.

Mr. Young asked if the porch had a post on top of each brick column.

Mr. Kelly said he is unsure because of the lattice on the porch.

Mr. Hanson says the bump out is similar to the bump outs on Renwick Street.

Mr. Young asked if the windows will be replaced. He said the original windows on the bay are unique.

The Applicant said there is no intention to replace the windows at this time.

Mr. Young said based on the photograph, it appears that the porch had a column on each end and a smaller post incorporated on the railing that sat on top of each of the columns.

Mr. Kelly said the porch probably had snap in/out glass panels for the winter.

The Chairperson said the Board has discussed the porch design extensively and requested a motion on the items the Board is comfortable approving.

Mr. Hanson confirmed the Applicant intends to install turned spindles. He requested additional details for the porch.

Mr. Kelly moved to approve the application, subject to the following conditions:

- Remove the paint from the lower portion of the building to expose the natural brick color;
- Paint the exterior of the building using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette per application specs;
- Applicant must return for a determination on the porch.

Ms. Basch seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2020-21

Applicant: James A. Gibbons

Owner: 144 Tercera Corp.

Location: 86 Lander Street

Application to install new windows, roof, doors and porch; repoint the brick; and paint the exterior using colors from the BEHR color palette.

James Gibbons, Applicant, appeared before the Board representing the property owner.

The Applicant said he is open to any suggestions by the Board and gave a brief overview of the project. He highlighted the following:

- Building recently purchased from the Newburgh Community Land Bank;
- Consultant's recommendation was to demolish the existing building;
- Building lacks a roof and is in desperate need of repair;
- Intent is to save the existing shell and completely restore the building back to its original condition;
- Existing windows appear to have a 6/6 configuration;
- Proposing to install:
 - 6/6 Pella or Pella equivalent windows on the entire building for consistency;
 - New roof, porch and doors;
- Building will be stabilized, repointed and then painted.

Mr. Kelly said the building was constructed circa 1855-1860 and the window configuration on the second and third floor should be 6/6. He said the eyebrow windows on the top floor and basement would've been different.

Mr. Hanson asked for a clarification on the window configuration for the top floor and basement floor.

Mr. Kelly said the building may have had 3/3 or 2/2 windows installed on those floors. He asked if the stoop will be similar to the stoops found at 130 & 132 Third Street.

The Applicant said the intent is to match the look of the stoop at 132 Third Street.

Mr. Hoekema asked if the proposed color is part of the Benjamin Moore or Sherwin Williams Historic color palette.

The Chairperson clarified the Applicant is free to utilize any vendor for the color since they offer color-matching services.

The Applicant said he is looking to paint the building a dark brown color.

Mr. Kelly suggested painting the building to match the Church color at the corner of Third Street and Liberty Street.

Mr. Young advised the Applicant to utilize mineral paint and to utilize lime mortar for any repointing.

The Chairperson confirmed the windows will be wooden windows and the proposed window configuration for the first and second floor will be 6/6.

The Applicant said he is open to installing 2/2 or 3/3 windows on the top floor and basement.

The Chairperson said the Applicant should return with an alternative color.

Mr. Kelly said the window configuration on the top floor and basement should be 2/2.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Alvin Moonesar, 69-79 William Street, said he is in favor of the application. He said the Applicant is taking on a difficult challenge in restoring the building.

There was no one else present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Kelly moved to approve the application, subject to the following conditions:

- Install wooden Pella windows (or equivalent) on the façade and right side elevation per application specs;
 - 2/2 windows on the basement;
 - 6/6 windows on the first and second floor;
 - 2/2 windows on the third floor, with existing window opening on the third floor of the “right side elevation” to be a wooden 6/6 arched window;
- Repoint the brick using lime mortar;
- Applicant must return for a determination on the paint and stoop.

Ms. Basch seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

Jeff Wilkinson joined the meeting at 7:42 p.m.

AR 2020-22

Applicant: Govinda M. Davis
Owner: George Davis
Location: 286 Liberty Street

Application to replace the mansard roof and the rear patio roof; repair the yankee gutters and replacing the downspouts.

Govinda Davis, Applicant, and Tom Hazard, contractor, appeared before the Board on behalf of the property owner.

The Applicant said her father grew ill and passed away the previous year. She said during her father's illness, maintenance on the building suffered and now she intends to repair the building. She gave a brief overview of the project and said the roof and the rear porch will be replaced.

Ms. Des Cognets said the rear is not visible from the street and the Applicant is free to replace the rear porch so long as the work meets the Building Code. She asked for the proposed design of the synthetic slate and if the design matches the building roof next door.

Mr. Hanson said the beveled edge profile most closely resembles the roof design next door. He said the difference is that the design next door is a hexagon while the beveled edge design is an octagon. He said the proposed design is acceptable.

Mr. Kelly asked if the mansard roof is failing and needs replacement.

The Applicant said the rear roof portion has suffered significant water damage and needs replacement.

Mr. Kelly said it is more economical to spot replace the slate, if the framing is in good condition.

The contractor said the existing roof cannot be spot replaced and needs a full replacement.

Mr. Wilkinson said if the slate is original to the building, it is nearing the end of its life cycle. He said the beveled edge design is fine.

Mr. Kelly confirmed the dimensions of the roof will remain the same. He said the windows on the dormers are not appropriate to the building and suggested installing alternative windows. He said the Applicant is not required to replace the dormer windows now but she can review the correct style of windows at 188 Liberty Street.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson confirmed the yankee gutters, downspouts and flashing will be made out of copper. She said the patio on the rear is not under ARC purview and they will not vote on that portion of the application.

Mr. Hoekema moved to approve the application as submitted, subject to the following condition:

- Replace the existing mansard roof with synthetic slate and with a beveled edge profile, per application specs.

Mr. Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2020-33

Applicant: TWSTH LLC

Owner: TWSTH LLC

Location: 311 Liberty Street

Application to replace the windows and door; paint the exterior using colors from the Benjamin Moore color palette.

Mian Ye, Applicant, appeared with Cyan Hamill before the Board representing the property owner.

Mr. Hamill gave a brief overview of the project and said the intent is to replace the windows and doors and paint the exterior of the building.

The Chairperson confirmed the brick paint will be removed and the natural brick color will be left. She asked for additional details on the proposed window.

Mr. Hamill said they intend to install Anderson 100 series wooden windows on the building.

Mr. Wilkinson clarified the windows on the outside are made out of Fibrex with wood on the interior.

Mr. Kelly said the Applicant may install 1/1 or 2/2 windows on the building.

Ms. Des Cognets asked if the proposed color removal product, Peel Away, works effectively on the brick and if the intent is to remove the lintel paint as well.

Mr. Young said the product should work well but the Applicant may want to test it first to be certain.

The Applicant confirmed he intends to strip the paint from the lintels. He said the door will be replaced with a six-panel Anderson door painted to match the cornice.

The Chairperson confirmed the transom and building number will remain as is.

Mr. Young said the building used to have a double door.

Mr. Kelly agreed and said the building would benefit from double doors with a glass inset or matching panels. He said similar buildings may be found on Farrington Street and Liberty Street.

Mr. Hanson asked if the building has a vestibule.

Mr. Hamill said there is no interior door for a vestibule.

Mr. Wilkinson said the interior door was probably removed and encouraged the installation of a double door with glass.

Mr. Kelly said he is willing to approve a double door that fits the true opening.

The Chairperson confirmed the fire escape will be repainted in the same color and will not be removed. She confirmed the basement windows will be 1/1 windows.

Mr. Wilkinson clarified the stoop portion is not part of the application.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Young moved to approve the application, subject to the following condition:

- Install 1/1 Anderson 100 Series windows on the façade per application specs;
- Repoint the brick;
- Remove the paint from the building brick and lintels to expose the natural color;
- Paint the exterior of the building using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette per application specs;
- Applicant must return for a determination on the entry door.

Ms. Basch seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2020-34

Applicant: Jonathan Powell, AIA
Owner: 185 Liberty Street LLC
Location: 185 Liberty Street

Application to repair/replace the porch, cornice and windows; install a double door; repoint the brick and paint the exterior of the building using colors from the Benjamin Moore color palette.

Jonathan Powell, Applicant, appeared before the Board on behalf of the property owner, with Naomi Hersson-Ringskog and Samuel Ottenhoff.

The Applicant gave a brief overview of the project and highlighted the following:

- Part 1 of State Historic Preservation Office application was approved;
- Windows will be replaced with Marvin double hung windows;
- Repointing the brick;
- Restoring the slate roof, porch and cornice in-kind;
- Installing a salvaged double door;
- Painting the exterior of the building using colors from the Benjamin Moore color palette.

Mr. Kelly asked if the windows will be 1/1.

The Applicant said the existing window configurations are not consistent and the intent is to install 1/1 windows throughout the building.

Mr. Wilkinson commended the Applicant for his thoroughness on the submitted drawings.

The Applicant said the existing front door and sidelights will be removed and replaced with a double door. He said the panels at the bottom of the doors would match the style of the window bay panels. He said the window bars will be removed from the building and the missing portion of the existing porch will be rebuilt to match the remainder of the existing porch. He said the existing iron railing next to the porch will be replaced with a 19th century railing from salvage and painted black.

The Chairperson said the Applicant must return if they change their mind on the roof.

Mr. Kelly said 1/1 windows are not appropriate to the building. He said he must recuse himself from voting on the application.

Mr. Wilkinson said the State Historic Preservation Office will review the window configuration and the Board may wait to see their determination. He said he is comfortable approving the 1/1 windows.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Hanson asked if the Applicant is comfortable installing 2/2 or 4/4 windows instead.

Mr. Ottenhoff said they have no preference on the window configuration. He said the intent is to install historically accurate windows.

Mr. Hoekema motioned to approve the application as submitted subject to the following condition:

- Applicant has the option to install 2/2 or 4/4 windows;

Ms. Basch seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote (James Kelly recused).

AR 2020-35

Applicant: Edouard Pierre

Owner: Edouard Pierre

Location: 376 Liberty Street Rear

Application to add a new roof overhang and install a new deck, windows, doors, siding and trim.

Edouard Pierre, property owner, appeared before the Board with Phillippe Pierre.

Phillippe Pierre said the property was recently purchased from the City of Newburgh and the proposed renovations to the building are barely visible from the street since the landlocked parcel is behind 84 Clinton Street. He said the intent is to replace the roof, windows, siding and door. He said the building is relatively new and generic.

Mr. Hoekema said the building is non-contributing to the East End Historic District and barely visible from the street.

Phillippe Pierre said the building can be viewed through a small alleyway and in order to access the building, people need to pass through the neighbor's property.

Ms. Basch asked if the application requires ARC approval since it's not really visible.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel clarified that the application was determined to be visible from the street by the Building Department/ The Board is free to consider full visibility from the street and the fact that the building is non-contributing, among other factors, in deciding whether to approve the application.

Mr. Wilkinson asked when the building was constructed.

Phillippe Pierre said the building was probably constructed in 2003.

Mr. Hanson confirmed the building was constructed in the 21st century. He said he is inclined to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson said she agrees with the comments by the Board.

Ms. Des Cognets moved to approve the application as submitted.

Ms. Basch seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2020-36

Applicant: David Fishel

Owner: David Fishel

Location: 179 Dubois Street

Application to install a new gate and fence and repave the driveway.

David Fishel, property owner, appeared before the Board.

The property owner gave a brief overview of the project and said the intent is to repair the existing retaining wall, repave the driveway, and install a new gate and fence for his recently adopted dog.

Mr. Hoekema confirmed the proposed gate swings on a couple hinges.

The Chairperson confirmed the gate will be a custom steel gate, painted black, hinging on the building side and filled in with cedar planks.

Mr. Hanson confirmed the gate will swing in towards the property.

The property owner said the gate will swing in because otherwise it will impede the entry door on the building.

Mr. Kelly confirmed the height of the gate will be six feet and the column on the wall would be six feet and four inches.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Hanson moved to approve the application as submitted.
Mr. Hoekema seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2020-37

Applicant: Jeff Wilkinson
Owner: Newburgh Community Land Bank, Inc.
Location: 27 Johnston Street

Jeff Wilkinson recused himself from application AR 2020-37.

Application to install new windows, new stoop; remove the awnings; repair/replace the cornice; repoint the brick; and paint the exterior of the building using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

Jeff Wilkinson, Applicant, appeared before the Board on behalf of the property owner with Jennifer Welles and Lisa Daily.

The Applicant gave a brief overview of the project and highlighted the following:

- Installing new 2/2 aluminum clad wood windows;
- Restoring the stoop and stairs;
- Removing existing paint from brick;
- Repointing the brick;
- Installing a dark stained double door;
- Painting the exterior using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

The Applicant said the intent is to renovate the building and then sell the building as a two-family dwelling.

Mr. Hoekema said has no concerns on the application.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Ms. Basch moved to approve the application as submitted.
Mr. Kelly seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2020-38

Applicant: Felderi Santiago
Owner: 9 Carson Realty Partners LLC
Location: 9 Carson Avenue

Application to install a new door; repair/replace the siding and front porch; and paint the exterior of the building using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

Felderer Santiago, Applicant, appeared before the Board on behalf of the property owner, along with Eulogio Santiago.

The Applicant said the property was purchased approximately 9 months ago and it has been vacant for at least 20 years. He said the intent is to replicate the original conditions of the building and install a new door, porch and siding. He said the exterior will be painted using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

The Chairperson confirmed the existing windows will be repaired and no new windows are proposed.

Mr. Hanson asked if the Applicant intends to install balustrades with spindles on the porch.

The Applicant said the intent is to replicate the conditions on the submitted photograph but he has no issue with modifying the proposal to add balustrades.

Mr. Wilkinson said he is concerned with the door proposal. He said the Applicant should be aware of the Streetscape Standards if he intends to do any sidewalk work.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said the Building Department will review if additional sidewalk work is required as part of a final Certificate of Occupancy/Release of Covenant request. He said only if the Applicant intends to deviate from the Sidewalk Standards, they must return for approval to the ARC.

Mr. Hanson said the proposed door should match the door style at 7 Carson Avenue.

Mr. Wilkinson said a simple door with a panel would be preferred.

Ms. Des Cognets agreed.

Eulogio Santiago agreed to revise the door proposal and balustrade to comply with the suggestions by the Board.

Mr. Wilkinson clarified that a balustrade is required for the project.

Mr. Hanson said the porch balustrade should match the style found at 6 Carson Avenue.

Mr. Young said a thick balustrade with a turned spindle should be installed.

Mr. Kelly asked for the siding material.

Eulogio Santiago said they have sufficient material leftover from the rear of the building.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Hanson moved to approve the application as submitted, subject to the following conditions:

- Porch balustrade must match the style found at 6 Carson Avenue;
- Install a new wooden door matching the door style at 7 Carson Avenue.

Mr. Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

With no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 9:15 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Omar E. Balbuena-Palma
Secretary to the Land Use Boards