

CITY OF NEWBURGH
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
123 Grand Street, Newburgh, New York 12550

Michele Basch, Chairperson
Omar E. Balbuena-Palma, Secretary
Phone: (845) 569-7380 Fax: (845) 569-0188

MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting of August 11, 2020

The monthly meeting of the City of Newburgh Architectural Review Commission (“ARC”) was held on Tuesday, August 11, 2020 at 6:30 p.m. using Zoom videoconference.

Members Present: Michele Basch, Chairperson
Hannah Des Cognets
Jim Hoekema
James Kelly
Jeff Wilkinson

Absent: Christopher Hanson
Reggie Young

Also Present: Jeremy Kaufman, Assistant Corporation Counsel
Omar E. Balbuena-Palma, Secretary to the Land Use Boards

Minutes of the July 14, 2020 Meeting

Mr. Hoekema moved to approve the minutes from the July 14, 2020 meeting as submitted.
Mr. Kelly seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously.

CONSENT AGENDA

AR 2020-54

Applicant: Dub Flo, LLC
Owner: Dub Flo, LLC
Location: 117 Liberty Street

Application to paint the exterior of the building using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

AR 2020-55

Applicant: Anthony White & Karon White
Owner: Anthony White & Karon White
Location: 82 Clinton Street

Application to paint the siding Amherst Gray (Benjamin Moore HC-167).

Mr. Wilkinson said the original siding at 117 Liberty Street must remain.

Mr. Kelly said only the vinyl portion of the building at 82 Clinton Street will be painted.

Mr. Hoekema moved to approve the Consent Agenda as submitted.

Mr. Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously.

AMENDMENT REQUEST

AR 2019-06

Applicant: Dwight D. Johns, Inc.

Owner: Dwight D. Johns, Inc.

Location: 43 Beacon Street

Amendment request to revise the windows and exterior plan.

Christopher Berg, Project Architect, from Berg + Moss Architects, P.C., and Sophia Larig, appeared before the Board on behalf of the property owner.

The Project Architect said the new property owners are requesting the following modifications to the existing approval letter:

- Removing existing vinyl siding and restoring the cedar shingles underneath;
- New window configurations;
- New porch details.

Mr. Kelly said the building used to be called the Washington Heights Club.

The Project Architect said he was not aware that the building was a social club but understood the building was not originally a residential building based on the floor layout.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Wilkinson moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

OLD BUSINESS

AR 2019-15

Applicant: Phoebe Sudrow
Owner: Phoebe Sudrow
Location: 95 Liberty Street WH

Returning for a determination on the porch.

Phoebe Sudrow, property owner, appeared before the Board.

The property owner said additional details were submitted for the front porch and displayed a new sketch of the front porch.

Mr. Wilkinson said the new sketch shows a gable roof on the front porch but a hip roof is more appropriate. He said the original hip roof is better for water run-off.

Mr. Hoekema said the submitted drawing appears to show a hip roof and conflicts with the sketch.

The Applicant said the porch was destroyed by the recent storms. She said the imprint of the porch roof appears to be for a gable roof and not a hip roof. She said she believes a hip roof is not original to the building.

Mr. Wilkinson said a gable roof would conflict with the windows above the porch.

Mr. Kelly said installing a gable roof would prove to be difficult. He said he does not have an original picture of the building and requested an image of the existing building without the porch for consideration.

The Applicant said she does not have a clear picture readily available but she does have the image on her cellphone. She said she is not opposed to installing a hip roof but believes a gable roof is better because it would match the roof style of the building.

Mr. Kelly confirmed the intent is to install a new porch with a gable roof and remove the portion of the porch previously connected to the window bay. He said he is not opposed to the idea but he would require a detailed drawing before voting on the application.

Mr. Wilkinson agreed.

The Chairperson said the Applicant's proposal for the roof does not match what the Applicant submitted. She said the Applicant should submit a detailed plan for the porch.

The Applicant requested restoring the porch as it was originally submitted.

Mr. Kelly said he is not opposed to that request either but the Applicant needs to provide the details in a drawing. He said the Applicant should provide an illustration to showcase the look of the porch with the proposed balusters, the posts, the railing spread and the composition.

The Applicant requested to table the application.

The Application was tabled and the Applicant was informed to submit a revised plan for consideration by August 25 in order to attend the next ARC meeting on September 8, 2020.

AR 2019-93

Applicant: Virgilio Cruz
Owner: Virgilio Cruz and Martha Cruz
Location: 80 Overlook Place

Returning for a determination on the fence in front of the building.

The Applicant could not attend the meeting.

The Board tabled the application until the September 8, 2020 ARC meeting.

AR 2020-04

Applicant: Jamie L Crisafulli
Owner: Jamie L Crisafulli
Location: 28 Spring Street

Returning for a determination on the stoop.

Jamie Crisafulli, property owner, appeared before the Board.

The property owner said the intent is to replace the steps on the side of the building. She said the initial request was for an in-kind replacement but now she is proposing to install a wooden porch and extend the porch to match the width of the building.

The Chairperson confirmed the existing stoop will be replaced.

The property owner said the proposed porch is bigger than the existing concrete porch.

Mr. Kelly confirmed the submitted renderings are not accurate and clarified the Applicant will follow the architectural drawings submitted. He asked for the intent on the side of the porch roof.

The property owner said she is not sure but she is open to installing a wooden insert on the side of the porch roof.

Mr. Wilkinson said a siding infill is acceptable.

Mr. Kelly said the porch should be set in from the corner of the building and the porch roof should follow the same.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Gail Fulton said she used to live at 95 Liberty Street WH. She said she may have old photographs of the building for consideration.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Kelly asked if the porch door will be replaced.

The property owner said she does not have a proposal ready for the door will not be replaced at this time.

Mr. Kelly moved to approve the application subject to the following conditions:

- Remove the existing porch and install a wooden porch that is slightly inset from the corners of the building;
- Applicant has the option to infill the side of the porch line;
- Applicant must return for a determination on the door.

Mr. Hoekema seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2020-40

Applicant: Brian Pringle & Jessica Pringle

Owner: Brian Pringle & Jessica Pringle

Location: 11 Bush Avenue

Returning for a determination on the driveway and shed.

The Applicant for Application AR 2020-40 was not present upon first call of the Chairperson. The application was tabled for a second call.

AR 2020-45

Applicant: Runner I, LLC

Owner: Runner I, LLC

Location: 8 Farrington Street

Returning for a determination on the windows and paint.

Erik Cooney, Applicant, appeared before the Board on behalf of the property owner.

The Applicant said the intent is to replace the vinyl windows with new aluminum-clad wood windows from the Weathershield Signature Series and paint the cornice in a Benjamin Moore Historic Color.

Mr. Hoekema said the application is acceptable to him.

Mr. Kelly asked if the infilled portion of the existing windows will be preserved or if the proposed windows will fit the original window aperture.

The Applicant said the windows will be installed to fit the original window aperture and he may change the paint color later. He apologized for not including the paint removal product – Peel-away by Dumond – as he believed that ARC approval was not required for it.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel clarified that the Applicant is required to contact the Building Department first to determine if a building permit or ARC approval is required for exterior work. He said the Applicant is not allowed to skip steps in the review process.

The Applicant said he understands and asked if the Board will include the paint removal product in the decision letter.

The Chairperson said they will include the product in the decision letter.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson moved to approve the application as submitted subject to the following conditions:

- Install new, jet-black, 1/1 aluminum-clad wood windows that fit the original window aperture;
- Paint the cornice and window sills in Brewster Gray (Benjamin Moore HC-162);
- Applicant may use Peel-away by Dumond to remove the existing paint color.

Mr. Hoekema seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2020-46

Applicant: 111 Johnston, LLC
Owner: 111 Johnston, LLC
Location: 111 Johnston Street

Returning for a determination on the windows.

Erik Cooney, Applicant, remained before the Board on behalf of the property owner.

The Applicant said the intent is to replace all street facing vinyl windows with jet-black, 2/2 aluminum-clad wood windows approved for application AR 2020-45 (8 Farrington Street).

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Kelly said the proposed windows should fit the original window aperture.

The Applicant said he will not reduce the existing window openings.

Mr. Hoekema moved to approve the application as submitted, subject to the following condition:

- Install new, jet-black, 2/2 aluminum-clad wood windows that fit the original window aperture.

Mr. Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2020-47

Applicant: 233 Kings Highway, LLC

Owner: 233 Kings Highway, LLC

Location: 233 Liberty Street

Returning for a determination on the windows.

Erik Cooney, Applicant, remained before the Board on behalf of the property owner.

The Applicant said the intent is to replace the damaged windows with new aluminum-clad wood windows in obsidian from the Weathershield Signature Series and to paint the exterior.

Mr. Kelly asked if the proposed windows will be true, divided-light windows.

The Applicant said he does not know if the windows are true divided light windows.

Mr. Kelly said the proposed windows should be 2/2 with true-divided lights.

Mr. Wilkinson said the proposed window is a simulated divided light window. He asked for a spec sheet from the Applicant.

The Chairperson said the Board may specify the window type in the approval letter and said the spec sheet should be submitted to the Secretary.

The Applicant agreed.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Kelly moved to approve the application as submitted, subject to the following conditions:

- Windows in the enclosed porch on the second floor should be true, 2/2, divided-light windows;
- Applicant must submit a specifications sheet to the Secretary.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2020-18

Applicant: Donna Osborne

Owner: South Miller Housing LLC

Location: 8 South Miller Street (f.k.a. 8-10 South Miller Street)

Application to replace all of the windows.

The Applicant could not attend the meeting.

The Board tabled the application until the September 8, 2020 ARC meeting.

AR 2020-53

Applicant: Nelson Tabares

Owner: Alba Lucia Lujan

Location: 100 Beacon Street

Application to replace two windows; install a new door; replace the roof and paint the exterior of the building.

Nelson Tabares, Applicant, and Kevindaryán Luján appeared before the Board on behalf of the property owner.

The Applicant said the intent is to renovate the garage and replace the roof, two rear windows, and install a new door opening where a window opening currently exists. He said the garage will then be painted.

Mr. Hoekema asked if the four entry doors to the garage will be replaced.

Mr. Luján said they are not proposing to replace the four entry doors at this time. He said the four entry doors will be repaired and repainted the same yellow color along with the rest of the garage.

He said a new door will be installed on the east side of the garage where a window opening currently exists and two windows will be installed on the north side of the garage. He said architectural shingles will be installed on the roof.

Mr. Wilkinson confirmed the garage is made out of concrete.

Mr. Hoekema confirmed all of the window openings are currently covered by plywood. He said the north side is not visible from the street.

Ms. Des Cognets said she is generally against approving fiberglass doors but given the circumstances, she feels comfortable approving the door.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Ms. Des Cognets moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2020-56

Applicant: Andrew G. Murphy
Owner: Andrew G. Murphy
Location: 47 South Miller Street

Application to install a new fence and gate.

Andrew G. Murphy, property owner, appeared before the Board.

The property owner gave a brief overview of the application and said the intent is to install a new gate in front of the building with a fence on top of the retaining wall for safety reasons and a security fence on the rear. He said the gate would serve as a receptacle for his mail and the fence on the rear would barely be visible from the street.

Mr. Kelly confirmed the Applicant was referred to the ARC for approval from the Building Department.

The Chairperson said the proposed fencing would make exiting the property difficult in the event of an emergency.

The property owner said the gate would not be locked and he will discuss the egress requirements with the Building Department.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Kelly moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2020-57

Applicant: Michael Lavan
Owner: Edris C. Davis
Location: 35 Johnes Street

Application to repair/replace the door, cornice and front stoop; ratify the existing windows and repoint the brick.

Michael Lavan, Applicant, Edris C. Davis, property owner, and Vincente Varela, Project Architect, appeared before the Board.

The property owner said the property was purchased in February and they were unaware they were required to obtain ARC approval for any exterior work. She said they renovated the roof and installed new windows prior to receiving a stop work order and they intend to renovate the building as it currently exists.

The Applicant said they are not changing anything on the building and they are looking to restore the building. He said the porch would remain as is.

The Chairperson asked for additional details on the windows.

The Applicant said the windows were replaced with Anderson windows.

Mr. Kelly clarified the Applicant never obtained a Building Permit nor ARC approval for any of the completed exterior work. He said the installed 8/8 vinyl windows are inappropriate to the building.

Mr. Wilkinson asked for a current photograph of the building. He said the building would've probably had 1/1 windows originally installed.

Mr. Kelly said the building may have had 2/2 or 1/1 windows originally installed but not 8/8 windows.

Mr. Wilkinson said 8/8 windows are not acceptable windows on the building.

The Project Architect said the property owner is open to rectifying the concerns of the Board.

Mr. Kelly said the Applicant should always contact the Building Department first prior to performing any exterior work.

Mr. Wilkinson said the drawings are vague and additional details are needed. He said the cornice work is not detailed in the drawings.

Mr. Lavan said nothing has been done on the exterior besides replacing the windows.

The Project Architect said the most of the building will be restored back to its original condition.

Mr. Kelly said replacing the windows with 8/8 vinyl windows is significantly modifying the building. He said the lack of details on the drawings render him unable to vote on the application. He said the details of any proposed work should be included in the drawings.

The Chairperson reiterated that vinyl windows are not acceptable. She said the Applicant should revise the windows and provide additional details on the porch and cornice.

Mr. Wilkinson said the Applicant should review the East End Historic District Design Guidelines for further guidance.

The Application was tabled and the Applicant was informed to submit revised information in order to attend the next ARC meeting on September 8, 2020.

AR 2020-58

Applicant: James Kelly
Owner: Tyler C. Roebuck
Location: 127 Montgomery Street

Mr. Kelly recused himself from application AR 2020-58.

Application to rebuild the soffit, yankee gutters and replace the corbels.

James Kelly, Applicant, appeared before the Board on behalf of the property owner.

The Applicant gave a brief overview of the project and said the intent is to rebuild the soffit, Yankee gutters and replace the corbels. He said the previous approval expired and he is requesting approval to finish the project.

Mr. Hoekema asked for the duration of the ARC approval.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said the approval is valid for two years.

Mr. Wilkinson confirmed the Applicant is requesting an approval for work that was previously approved but never completed. He said he has no further questions.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Hoekema moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2020-59

Applicant: Jeff Wilkinson

Owner: 129 Montgomery St., LLC

Location: 129 Montgomery Street

Mr. Wilkinson recused himself from application AR 2020-59.

Application to replace the windows, doors, roof and siding; install a new entry stone and a new rear wooden porch; repair the chimney and paint the exterior of the building using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

Jeff Wilkinson, Applicant, and Zachary Ruttenberg appeared before the Board on behalf of the property owner.

The Applicant gave a brief overview of the project and highlighted the following:

- Building constructed circa 1820;
- Received Part 1 approval from the State Historic Preservation Office;
- ZBA approval obtained for project.
- Installing new siding, windows, roof, doors, and fence;
- Complying with the Streetscape Standards;
- Painting the exterior using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

Mr. Hoekema said he has no questions on the application.

The Chairperson commended the Project Architect for the level of details provided in the drawing.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Kelly moved to approve the application as submitted.
Mr. Hoekema seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2020-40

Applicant: Brian Pringle & Jessica Pringle
Owner: Brian Pringle & Jessica Pringle
Location: 11 Bush Avenue

Returning for a determination on the driveway and shed.

Jessica Pringle, property owner, appeared before the Board.

The property owner gave a brief review of the application and said a revised plan was submitted for consideration. She said the revised driveway will be 60 feet by 8 feet, widen towards the rear and setback by two feet from the property line. She withdrew the request for the shed and said she will return at a later date with a different proposal for the shed.

The Applicant discussed the submitted photographs of the property with the Board.

Ms. Des Cognets asked for the proposed material of the driveway.

The property owner said the driveway will be made out of asphalt and flower beds will be added to make the driveway more aesthetically pleasing.

Mr. Kelly asked if the Applicant had any photographs of the original driveway for consideration.

The property owner said she does not have an original photograph available.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Brian Flannery, 5 Norton Street, said the guidelines for the shed may be found on page 7 of the Colonial Terraces District Design Guidelines.

There was no one else present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Ms. Des Cognets said she is not in favor of the proposed material for the driveway.

Mr. Kelly said he is not in favor of the material either.

Mr. Wilkinson suggested installing a driveway with permeable pavers instead.

The Chairperson read the driveways section of the Colonial Terraces District Design Guidelines and said the proposed material is acceptable for installation. She said the Applicant should be given the option to install a strip driveway instead of an asphalt driveway.

The property owner said all of the other buildings have asphalt driveways installed on their property and said she will make the driveway aesthetically pleasing.

The Chairperson asked for the aesthetic details of the driveway.

The property owner said she will build flower beds and install plants along the sides of the driveway and install treated wood with a rounded edge along the outline of the driveway. She said a stone walkway will also be added from the driveway to the doorway.

The Chairperson confirmed the Applicant will install pavers for the stone walkway.

Mr. Kelly said Belgian blocks or 19th century or early 20th century bricks would be preferable instead of the pavers.

The Chairperson moved to approve the application subject to the following conditions:

- Install a new driveway from the front of the building towards the rear of the building;
- Install Belgian blocks or bricks (19th or early 20th century) on the outline of the driveway with plantings;
- Install a matching stone walkway from the driveway to the doorway;
- Applicant must submit a separate ARC application for the shed later.

Mr. Hoekema seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

With no further business to discuss, the meeting was adjourned at 9:10 p.m.

Respectfully submitted,

Omar E. Balbuena-Palma
Secretary to the Land Use Boards