

MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting of August 10, 2021

The monthly meeting of the City of Newburgh Architectural Review Commission (“ARC”) was held on Tuesday, August 10, 2021 at 6:30 p.m. at the Activity Center, 401 Washington Street, Newburgh, New York 12550.

Members Present: Michele Basch, Chairperson
Kate Flanagan
Tom Friedrich
Christopher Hanson (arrived at 6:40 p.m.)
James Kelly
Jeff Wilkinson
Reggie Young

Also Present: Jeremy Kaufman, Assistant Corporation Counsel
J.K. Gentile, Secretary to the Land Use Boards

Meeting called to order at 6:35 p.m.

Minutes of the July 13, 2021 Meeting

Reggie Young moved to approve the minutes from the July 13, 2021 meeting as submitted.
James Kelly seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll call vote.

CONSENT AGENDA

AR 2021-077

Applicant: Hector Nolasco
Owner: Hector Nolasco
Location: 118 Broadway

Application to paint using colors from the Sherwin Williams Historic Color palette.

The Chairperson moved to approve the Consent Agenda.
Kate Flanagan seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

OLD BUSINESS

AR 2021-0019

Applicant: Flor E. Romano
Owner: Flor E. Romano
Location: 352 Third Street

Returning for determination on ratification of a previously-installed fence.

Flor Romano and Brian Magana appeared before the Board. Ms. Romano's son, Brian Magana, assisted Ms. Romano with English/Spanish translation.

The Applicant explained to the Board at the March 9, 2021 ARC meeting that a fence was necessary because she had a special needs child, and her homeowner's insurance company required that the entire property be fenced in.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said staff confirmed with local insurance agents that this was not a typical requirement as a condition of receiving a homeowners insurance policy. He said staff contacted the applicant and suggested calling the local insurance agents, some of which had Spanish-speaking customer service representatives available to assist. He said when presented with this information, the applicant acknowledged the fence was not an insurance requirement, but that she merely preferred the fence for her son's safety.

Mr. Wilkinson asked for confirmation that the fence is of vinyl material and encompasses the entire front yard.

Mr. Romano confirmed.

Mr. Wilkinson confirmed the house is located in the Colonial Terraces.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There were no comments from the public.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson moved to accept the application to ratify the existing fence.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion was defeated 7-0 via roll call-vote.

AR 2021-036

Applicant: Kearney Realty and Development Group/Sean Kearney
Owner: City of Newburgh
Location: 15 S. Colden Street

Returning for determination on construction of a new, 4-story, 67-unit apartment building with restaurant.

Sean Kearney and A.J. Coppola appeared before the Board.

Mr. Coppola gave an overview of the presentation from the July 13, 2021 for the Board members that were not present at that meeting. The design changes included:

- Visualization study completed for SHPO.
- Rendering angles from Water Street, Renwick Street and South William Street.
- Facade changes.

Ms. Flanagan said she had no comments.

Mr. Friedrich said he had no comments.

Mr. Wilkinson requested detail for the arches on the two entranceways on the east side of the building, and window fenestration on the north and south elevations.

Mr. Hanson agreed.

Mr. Kelly asked for detail on the design of the rear building.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Torrance Harvey spoke in favor of the application.

Bill Fioravanti spoke in favor of the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Chris Hanson moved to accept the application as submitted, and including the following additions::

- Window fenestration shall include 3 windows per floor on both the north and south elevations (18 windows total)
- Rear building design elevation shall match the façade detail and fenestration of the front and side facades
- Both entranceways on east façade shall include brick soldiering over the arched entranceways

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed 6-1 via roll call vote.

AR 2020-107

Applicant: Alina Preciado
Owner: Alina Preciado
Location: 394 Liberty Street

Returning for determination on the front door and the porch.

Applicant was not present.
Application tabled.

AR 2021-074

Applicant: Colin Jarvis
Owner (17 Johnston): City of Newburgh
Owner (19 Johnston): The Newburgh Ministry, Inc.
Location: 17 Johnston Street and 19 Johnston Street

Seeking approval to demolish the existing structures on both premises and to construct a new structure.

Colin Jarvis, Lee Lasberg, Frank Cerbini and Don Petruncola appeared before the Board.

Mr. Petruncola presented comment letters with exhibits, supplemental information that address the concerns/comments expressed at the July 13, 2021 meeting, and supplemental information relevant to the City's zoning code.

Mr. Petruncola gave an overview of the building's structural stability and the exterior deterioration that has taken place over years of neglect, as well as the damage suffered from the August 2, 2021 fire.

A memo from the Code Compliance Supervisor, dated August 3, 2021, was made a matter of record.

Mr. Petruncola presented a site development plan. He said the re-use of the existing row houses is not spatially efficient for the needs of the Newburgh Ministry's objectives. Not only would renovation be costly but it would be an inefficient allocation of space.

Mr. Jarvis gave an overview of the Newburgh Ministry's project objective of providing affordable housing for low income residents in consideration of the economic hardship criteria in the City Code related to demolition.

Mr. Lasberg presented a preliminary budget estimate reflecting cost to renovate the building prior to fire (estimate would need to be revised post fire). Mr. Cerbini also presented a cost analysis.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel gave an overview of the historic district demolition process and pointed the Board to sections 300-40(E) and 300-42(B) of the City Code. He said economic analysis is within the Board's purview to consider in reviewing current status of the building and the feasibility of rehabilitation. He said any vote for tonight would be on demolition of the existing buildings only and not on the future design schematic for a proposed building.

Mr. Hanson said the purpose of the ARC is to protect restorable historic homes. He expressed his concern regarding the location to develop the project.

Mr. Cerbini said any new buildings need to be on, or adjacent to, the existing Newburgh Ministry building as part of its funding project.

Ms. Flanagan said her consideration to demolish is based on the fact that the buildings are not intact.

Mr. Friedrich said he is not in a position to opine on rehabilitate or demolish at the moment.

Mr. Wilkinson had concerns about the presented cost of rehabilitation. He also said the existing building is listed as a contributing to the historic district. He said the 6-floor replacement building is out of scale with the neighborhood.

Mr. Kelly suggested exploring other options.

Mr. Young reiterated the Board is here to preserve existing buildings.

The Chairperson agreed.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Julius Williams spoke in favor of the application.

Regina Wilson spoke in favor of the application.

Torrance Harvey spoke in favor of the application.

(Mr. Hanson left the meeting)

Carson Carter asked about alternative sites across the street.

The Chairperson moved to hold open the public hearing and table the application for further review.

Reggie Young seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-006

Applicant: Erik Cooney
Owner: 56 Chambers, LLC
Location: 56 Chambers Street

Returning for determination to replace all 27 existing street facing windows and garage doors.

Erik Cooney appeared before the Board and gave a brief review of project's status.

Mr. Cooney referenced the storefront and the top floor window photos requested at last ARC meeting.

Mr. Kelly said historically the storefront always had two narrow doors. Mr. Kelly asked if there was still a wall in the middle of the storefront.

Mr. Cooney said there is no longer a wall.

Mr. Wilkinson asked if the garage was removed.

Mr. Cooney confirmed.

Ms. Flanagan asked to see storefront detail.

The Chairperson asked if Mr. Cooney is eliminating the inset door and flattening the surface of the two windows.

Mr. Cooney said the windows will be inset like the door.

Mr. Young asked for additional material and detail.

Mr. Kelly asked for detail of the paneling and overview of the storefront detail.

Mr. Wilkinson asked for 1/4" scale drawing of the façade storefront, with additional clarity on the door submission and cut sheets.

Mr. Young asked for clarity on what was approved for the windows at last meeting.

The Chairperson asked the applicant to submit storefront and window detail to the next meeting.

The Chairperson moved to table the application.

Reggie Young seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

NEW BUSINESS

AR 2021-078

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Chris Berg
Owner: Rip Rap LLC
Location: 326 Liberty Street

Application to paint using colors from the Sherwin Williams Historic color palette, install new windows, new doors, and new lighting.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the project.

Mr. Berg said this was a previously-approved application, but the application expired. The applicant did not vest its building permit within 24 months of the last approval. He said the project has already received approval from SHPO and NPS.

Mr. Wilkinson noted that the application reflects “paint brick façade.” He said that detail is incorrect, and that only the wood siding will be painted.

Ms. Flanagan asked about the accent lighting.

Mr. Berg said they will not add lighting, and that details is being removed from the application.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson moved to close the public hearing.

The Chairperson moved to accept the application as submitted with the amendments;

- Only the wood façade shall be painted (i.e. not the brick façade)
- Lighting detail shall be removed from the application

James Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-079

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Chris Berg
Owner: PS 6 Liberty Street, LLC
Location: 1 Liberty Street

Application to paint using colors from the Sherwin Williams Historic color palette, install new windows and doors and install new lighting.

Mr. Berg said this was a previously-approved application, but the application expired. The applicant did not vest its building permit within 24 months of the last approval. He said the project has already received approval from SHPO and NPS.

Mr. Berg said the front entrance doors will be pulled back and inset by 4 or 4 ½ feet.

Mr. Young asked if the missing stone from the wall on the Liberty Street side will be restored.

Mr. Berg confirmed it will be restored.

Ms. Flanagan asked about the entry stair railing being in the middle of the stairway.

Mr. Berg confirmed this detail and also noted a handicapped-accessible entrance on the Renwick Street side.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson motioned to close the public hearing.

Kate Flanagan moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-080

Applicant:	Sims Foster
Owner:	Foster Supply Hospitality
Location:	48, 52, 64 Grand Street

Application to convert structures into hotel and event space.

Matthew Milnamow and James Diana appeared before the Board.

Mr. Milnamow gave an overview of the proposed project and made specific mention of the two proposed ideas for a rooftop bar on the Masonic Temple or on the YMCA buildings.

Mr. Wilkinson asked for clarification regarding the rooftop bar.

Mr. Diana said they are propose an elevator addition to the south side alley of the Masonic Temple. The line of sight from street front will be maintained and out of sight.

Mr. Young asked if the elevator tower is about 30 feet back from the façade.

Mr. Diana said a little less.

Mr. Wilkinson asked about the main entry connector.

Mr. Milnamow said the YMCA building already has a 3-story stair tower addition. The front façade would be removed and replaced from the tower addition.

Mr. Kelly asked the height of the YMCA building.

Mr. Milnamow said 12 feet.

Mr. Kelly said he would like to preserve the proportions of the YMCA building from Grand Street.

Mr. Young asked what the new addition face material.

Mr. Milnamow said brick in the same color.

Mr. Wilkinson said he would like to see traditional masonry restoration notes.

Mr. Milnamow said very little repointing work has to be done.

The Chairperson referred to the Historic District Guidelines regarding building addition styles.

Mr. Wilkinson asked if there is significant rooftop equipment, to propose how they can screen the rooftop bar.

Mr. Milnamow said there is minimal rooftop equipment.

Ms. Flanagan said her only concern is the proposed additional floor on the YMCA, it seems disruptive to the structure.

Mr. Wilkinson asked for a massing model.

Mr. Kelly agreed with Ms. Flanagan and Mr. Wilkinson.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Bill Fioravanti spoke in favor of the application.

The Chairperson held the public hearing open.

The Chairperson moved to table the application.

Kate Flanagan seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-081

Applicant: Deborah and Saul Brown
Owner: Deborah and Saul Brown
Location: 165 Grand Street

Application to remove 2 chimneys and restore 2 chimneys (4 chimneys total) and relocate and replace the fence.

Deborah and Saul Brown appeared before the Board and Mrs. Brown gave an overview of the project.

Mr. Wilkinson suggested lowering the chimney and few feet and capping with blue stone.

Mr. and Mrs. Brown agreed with this suggestion.

Mr. Kelly said the chimneys are a significant feature of the building.

Ms. Flanagan asked if the fence will be the same material and how far it would be set back.

Mr. Brown confirmed the fence will be the same material. They proposed moving the fence back about 40 feet from the existing location.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson moved to approve the fence portion of the application as submitted and table the remained of the application.

Reggie Young seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-082

Applicant: Elijah Albert
Owner: Elijah Albert
Location: 405 Liberty Street

Application to install stair railings.

Elijah Albert appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the project.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson motioned to close the public hearing.

James Kelly moved to accept the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

DISCUSSION ITEM

Proposal for the installation of additional telecommunications equipment on the rooftop of the existing building located at 70 Dubois Street. Applicant is T-Mobile Northeast, LLC.

Mr. Kelly requested addition detail for size and street view rendering.

The remainder of the Board agreed.

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 10:34 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted:

Approved:

J.K. Gentile, Secretary

Michele Basch, Chairperson