

MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting of October 12, 2021

The monthly meeting of the City of Newburgh Architectural Review Commission (“ARC”) was held on Tuesday, October 12, 2021 at 6:30 p.m. using Zoom videoconference.

Members Present: Michele Basch, Chairperson
Christopher Hanson
James Kelly
Jeff Wilkinson
Reggie Young

Absent: Kate Flanagan

Also Present: Jeremy Kaufman, Assistant Corporation Counsel
J.K. Gentile, Secretary to the Land Use Boards

Meeting called to order at 6:37 p.m. Mr. Wilkinson arrived prior to application AR 2021-006. Mr. Young left the meeting prior to application AR 2021-95.

Minutes of the September 14, 2021 Meeting

The Chairperson moved to approve the minutes from the September 14, 2021 meeting as submitted. Chris Hanson seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll call vote.

CONSENT AGENDA

AR 2021-094

Applicant: Aubrey Nurse
Owner: Aubrey Nurse
Location: 139 Chambers Street

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

Chris Hanson moved to approve Consent Agenda.
The Chairperson seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

OLD BUSINESS

Newburgh SHG (Various Applications)

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Chris Berg
Location: Newburgh SHG (Various Sites)

Amendment to previously-approved applications with respect to window brand.

Request to substitute previously-approved “‘Weathershield Signature Series aluminum clad double hung windows’ to ‘Pella, Architect Series, aluminum clad, wood windows’.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the substituted window type. He said the window sizes, type, and design approved at each project site would remain the same. The only change was the window manufacturer.

Mr. Kelly asked if the proposed substitution can accommodate the same custom size as the previously approved window, and whether it can accommodate true, divided light.

Mr. Berg said everything can be accommodated with the new window brand.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Reggie Young moved to approve the substituted window brand.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-006

Applicant: Erik Cooney
Owner: 56 Chambers, LLC
Location: 56 Chambers Street

Returning for determination to replace all 27 existing street facing windows and storefront detail.

James Kelly appeared before the Board on behalf of the applicant and therefore recused himself from Board discussion and vote.

Mr. Kelly gave an overview of the proposed revisions.

The Chairperson asked if the windows have snap-in grills.

Mr. Kelly said the grills are in between the thermal pane.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson held the public hearing held open.

The Chairperson moved to approve a portion of the application, as follows:

- Painting of the building in kind.
- Restoration of the Yankee gutter in kind
- Restoration of the soffits and corbels in kind
- Case the windows with a brick molding
- Restoration of storefront in kind

The applicant shall return for modification of the garage, spandrel beam above storefront, lighting, signage and brick repointing.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-035

Applicant:	Alina Preciado
Owner:	Alina Preciado
Location:	394 Liberty Street

Returning for determination of new front façade.

Nadia Tarr appeared before the Board on behalf of the owner/applicant and gave an overview of the project.

The Chairperson asked for clarification on the paneling color as Iron Grey.

Ms. Tarr confirmed.

The Chairperson asked for clarification of the front door color as black.

Ms. Tarr confirmed and added the windows are also going to be black.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Chris Hanson moved to approve a portion of the application, as follows:

- Replace the front door with the door specified in the application
- Install Hardie Plank siding on all sides of the house
- Paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette

Reggie Young seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-086

Applicant: Dawn Liberi
Owner: Dikenga Properties, LLC
Location: 250 Liberty Street

Returning for determination of trim around front entrance door.

Dawn Liberi appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the project.

Mr. Hanson requesting a drawing with detail on how the trim meets the door.

The Chairperson asked about the trim thickness.

Ms. Liberi said three-quarters inch.

Mr. Hanson said the materials submitted appear insufficient for him, or someone at the Building Department, to know exactly what was approved.

Mr. Wilkinson agreed.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Judy Thomas spoke in favor of the application.
Carson Carter agreed that drawings should be required.
Dan Gilbert spoke in favor of the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson requested submission of a rendering.

The Chairperson tabled the application for a detail drawing of the door trim.

AR 2021-095

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects, LLC / Chris Berg
Owner: Aamir Mumtaz
Location: 10 Dubois Street

Application to install a fence.

Chris Berg and Aamir Mumtaz appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the project.

Mr. Young asked if the green space will be available for the tenants of 14 Dubois Street.

Mr. Mumtaz confirmed and said the space will be maintained.

The Chairperson asked how high the fence is.

Mr. Berg said 6 feet high.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel reviewed fence guidelines.

The Board agreed the fence was appropriate under the circumstances.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Jeff Wilkinson moved to accept the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-095

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects, LLC / Chris Berg
Owner: Aamir Mumtaz
Location: 14 Dubois Street

Application to restore/repoint brick façade, new stucco finish to south façade, install new wood windows and doors and install new lighting.

Chris Berg and Aamir Mumtaz appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the project.

Mr. Wilkinson asked if the basement floor masonry openings are all existing.

Mr. Berg confirmed.

Mr. Wilkinson said the basement floor fenestration is not in line with the first, second, and third floor fenestration. He recommended elaboration details on the masonry openings.

Mr. Kelly asked if the egress window will be brought down to meet the width requirements.

Mr. Berg confirmed.

Mr. Kelly asked if the windows will be 1/1 'Weathershield'.

Mr. Berg confirmed.

Mr. Hanson asked if the stucco on the south side was an aesthetic decision.

Mr. Berg confirmed and added it also protects against water penetration.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson asked the applicant to locate the lighting and doors and confirmed the basement door is the only door to change on the final plan.

Chris Hanson moved to accept the application as submitted.

James Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-104

Applicant:	Raymond Staffon
Owner:	General Traffic Equipment Corp.
Location:	259 Broadway

Application to request ratification of previously installed building addition.

Raymond Staffon and Darcy Sarsfield appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the project.

The Chairperson asked what the structure is made of.

Mr. Staffon said it is a wood structure.

Mr. Kelly asked if it is a completed project.

Mr. Staffon said yes.

The Chairperson asked when was the structure built.

Mr. Staffon said 2019.

Mr. Kelly asked if it could be seen from the street.

Mr. Staffon said the roof line can be seen.

The Chairperson asked what material the roof is made of.

Mr. Staffon said asphalt shingles.

Mr. Kelly requested the height and dimensions of the addition.

Mr. Wilkinson requested a façade drawing.

The Chairperson agreed and requested views from Broadway and Ann Street.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson moved to keep the public hearing open.

The Chairperson moved to table the application for drawings and additional views.

James Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-093

Applicant:	Mark Ellison
Owner:	Mark Ellison
Location:	255 Broadway

Application to install a greenhouse, wood deck and cable railing system to rear elevation and reface second floor rear elevation brick with stucco.

Mark Ellison appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the project.

Mr. Wilkinson asked if the greenhouse addition will cover the rear 3 windows and protrude out 10 feet.

Mr. Ellison confirmed.

Mr. Wilkinson asked about the greenhouse materials.

Mr. Ellison said double-glazed, Low E clear glass was engineered to get solar performance and open up the entire back to the size of the opening.

Mr. Hanson said the rear is far back from the road and not easily seen from Ann Street.

Mr. Kelly asked if the applicant will be restoring the Yankee gutter soffit.

Mr. Ellison said the non-performing Yankee gutter is partially falling off. He plans to replace it with a large capacity gutter in the future.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Judy Thomas spoke in favor of the project.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Chris Hanson moved to accept the application as submitted.

James Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-097

Applicant: Adam Geiger
Owner: Jacolies Joseph
Location: 419 Grand Street

Application request ratification of a previously installed fence.

Applicants did not appear. The Board tabled the application.

AR 2021-091

Applicant: Luigi Muccitelli
Owner: Richard Dee
Location: 100 Courtney Avenue

Application to request ratification of a previously installed siding.

Richard Dee, Luigi Muccitelli, Michael Guadagno and George Pappas appeared before Board.

Richard Dee gave an overview of the project. Mr. Dee said the siding was put on February 2021 and it was approved by the Building Department as an emergency measure due to water leakage through broken siding. The applicant claimed he was told by a code officer that the color was not correct and would need to be painted.

Mr. Wilkinson asked what color is being submitted.

Mr. Dee said Graphite Grey.

Mr. Hanson asked if the material installed is vinyl siding.

Mr. Dee confirmed.

Mr. Kelly asked what kind of shingles were underneath.

Mr. Dee said nailed on Inselbric that was taken down before the owner bought the house. The owner left the old boards on that were underneath and painted over them.

Mr. Kelly said he would have liked to see the clapboard restored. The vinyl siding hides the architectural details.

Mr. Dee said the painted over boards were separating and creating water damage.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson held the public hearing open.

The Chairperson moved to table the application for more information on the siding.

James Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-098

Applicant: Earl Russell Hopper
Owner: Earl Russell Hopper
Location: 10 Grand Street

Application to replace mansard roof, replace flat roof and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

Earl Russell Hopper appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the project.

Mr. Wilkinson asked for clarification of whether the roof would be restored or replaced.

Mr. Hopper said replaced with rolled asphalt.

Mr. Wilkinson asked if the applicant is restoring the slate shingles.

Mr. Hopper said he is replacing with GAF Slateline Shingles.

Mr. Kelly said the existing slate is polychrome, scallop style shingle with different shapes and colors. He asked if the GAF shingle would replicate what exists now.

Mr. Hopper said it will look as close to slate as possible.

Mr. Wilkinson said the slate should be restored, not replaced with an alternative, as it is too important a building.

Mr. Hopper said the roof needs to be replaced, as the patch work done over the past 15 years is no longer holding. he said the cost to replace the shingles with slate is too expensive for his budget.

Mr. Hanson asked if the applicant has explored Historic tax credits.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson held the public hearing open.

The Chairperson moved to table the application for additional research and information.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-099

Applicant:	John Lease III
Owner:	North Plank Development Co LLC
Location:	396 Liberty Street

Application to paint using colors from the Sherwin Williams Historic color palette and remove faux-shutters from the front facade.

John Lease appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the project.

Mr. Hanson asked if the shutters are plastic.

Mr. Lease confirmed.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Chris Hanson moved to accept the application as submitted.
The Chairperson seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-101

Applicant: Odalis Gonzalez
Owner: Odalis Gonzalez
Location: 1 Norton Street

Application to request ratification of a previously installed paved driveway.

Odalis Gonzalez appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the project.

Mr. Hanson said the sidewalk has been paved over. He suggested bringing the driveway into compliance by putting the concrete sidewalk back into the path.

Ms. Gonzalez said they researched that option but the estimate was very expensive.

Mr. Hanson said the cobblestone drain has also been disrupted.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Carson Carter spoke against the application.
Brian Flannery spoke against the application (comment sent via email)

The Chairperson held the public hearing open.

The Chairperson moved to table the application for additional research to bring driveway into compliance.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-102

Applicant: Fidelity Real Estate Management / Eli Vaknin
Owner: Mana Tree II, LLC
Location: 226 Montgomery Street

Application to replace corbels in kind, replace roof where needed in kind, repair chimney and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

Eli Vaknin and Dan Gilbert appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the project.

The Chairperson asked if there will be real slate on the front façade but not on the sides.

Mr. Vaknin confirmed.

Mr. Kelly asked if the sides would be asphalt shingles.

Mr. Vaknin confirmed.

Mr. Wilkinson asked why they would not consider all sides in slate.

Mr. Vaknin said the cost was prohibitive.

Mr. Hanson asked for a slate sample.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson held the public hearing open.

James Kelly moved to approve a portion of the application, as follows:

- Replace roof with EPDM material
- Repair chimney in kind
- Repair corbels in kind
- Repair Yankee gutter in kind
- Paint trim using colors from the Benjamin Moore color palette.

The applicant shall return for a determination on the slate roof, and flashing detail.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-103

Applicant:	Vera Best
Owner:	Vera Best
Location:	206 Liberty Street

Application to install new windows, replace existing siding and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic color palette.

Vera Best appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the project.

Mr. Hanson asked if the first floor would be wood sided and the existing windows remain.

Ms. Best confirmed.

Mr. Kelly asked if work has already started.

Ms. Best said yes, but the vinyl siding installed will be removed and replaced.

Mr. Wilkinson recommends painting only given the amount of work involved in re-siding.

Mr. Hanson recommends restoring the 3rd floor windows given the unique style/shape.

Mr. Kelly asked if any of the façade windows have been removed.

Ms. Best said she is not aware; she has just taken over managing the property.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Judy Thomas spoke in favor of the application.

The Chairperson moved to close the public hearing.

The Chairperson moved to approve the painting of the building in kind and table the remainder of the application.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-089

Applicant:	Juan Galaviz
Owner:	JNI Realty Corp.
Location:	159 Liberty Street

Returning for determination to replace windows, repair and paint siding, replace commercial entrance door, recondition/repaint bricks, paint window moldings. Painting using colors from the Sherwin Williams Historic color palette.

Navia and Juan Galaviz appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the project.

Mr. Hanson asked for confirmation that the first floor windows will be replaced with a single pane of glass.

Ms. Galaviz confirmed.

The Chairperson asked about the type of door.

Ms. Galaviz could not confirm.

Mr. Hanson requested submission of the door type and a specification sheet.

Mr. Hanson asked if they are still looking to replace the second and third floor front façade windows.

Ms. Galaviz confirmed, as currently the windows are broken and do not close correctly or lock.

The Chairperson recommended more research on the door and the cost.

Mr. Hanson said the first floor needs further review, keeping the existing windows and doing a simple cut glass repair.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson moved to keep the public hearing open.

Chris Hanson moved to approve 6, front façade windows on the second and third floors, type only, as submitted in the original application, and table the balance of the application.

James Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 10:58 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted:

Approved:

J.K. Gentile, Secretary

Michele Basch, Chairperson