

CITY OF NEWBURGH
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
123 Grand Street, Newburgh, New York 12550

Michele Basch, Chairperson
J.K. Gentile, Secretary
Phone: (845) 569-7383

MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting of March 14, 2023

The monthly meeting of the City of Newburgh Architectural Review Commission (“ARC”) was held on Tuesday, March 14, 2023 at 6:30 p.m. at the Activity Center, 401 Washington Street, Newburgh, New York 12550.

Members Present: Michele Basch, Chairperson
Michael Buonanno
Carson Carter
Kate Flanagan
James Kelly (arrived 6:38 p.m.)
Chris Hanson (arrived 6:42 p.m.)
Gregory Nato

Absent: Schnekwa McNeil

Also Present: Jeremy Kaufman, Assistant Corporation Counsel
J.K. Gentile, Secretary to the Land Use Boards

Meeting called to order at 6:36 p.m.

Minutes of the February 14, 2023

Minutes not available for review. Tabled for next month.

CONSENT AGENDA

AR 2023-027

Applicant: Newburgh SHG 97 LLC
Owner: Newburgh SHG 97 LLC
Location: 90 Overlook Place

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-028

Applicant: Newburgh SHG 100 LLC
Owner: Newburgh SHG 100 LLC
Location: 97 Overlook Place

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-029

Applicant: Newburgh SHG 101 LLC
Owner: Newburgh SHG 101 LLC
Location: 98 Overlook Place

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-030

Applicant: Newburgh SHG 102 LLC
Owner: Newburgh SHG 102 LLC
Location: 100 Overlook Place

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-031

Applicant: Newburgh SHG 58 LLC
Owner: Newburgh SHG 58 LLC
Location: 101 Overlook Place

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-032

Applicant: Newburgh SHG 103 LLC
Owner: Newburgh SHG 103 LLC
Location: 84 Overlook Place

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-033

Applicant: Newburgh SHG 37 LLC
Owner: Newburgh SHG 37 LLC
Location: 99 Overlook Place

The Board discussed that the submitted color for AR2023-27, AR2023-28, AR2023-29, AR2023-30, AR2023-31, AR2023-32, AR2023-033, “OC-65 Chantilly Lace”, is not a color within any Historic Color Palette.

The Chairperson moved to remove applications AR2023-27, AR2023-28, AR2023-29, AR2023-30, AR2023-31, AR2023-32, and AR2023-033 from the Consent Agenda for this month and table the applications for revised submittals.

Kate Flanagan seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-034

Applicant: Eli Vaknin
Owner: 43 Liberty LLC
Location: 43 Liberty Street

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

The Chairperson moved to approve the Consent Agenda for application AR-2023-034 as submitted.

Kate Flanagan seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

OLD BUSINESS

AR 2022-001

Applicant: Washberth McKnight
Owner: Washberth McKnight
Location: 178 Broadway

Returning for determination on a request for ratification of an installed sign.

Applicant was not present for the meeting.

Application tabled.

AR 2021-023

Applicant: Mike Brooks
Owner: Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh
Location: 157 N. Miller Street

Amendment to 4/13/21 approved application.

Substituting approved porch columns to porch support bracket.

Applicant was not present for the meeting.

Application tabled.

AR 2022-120

Applicant: David Fishel
Owner: David Fishel
Location: 199 South Street

Returning for determination on the southeast hood over doorway.

James Kelly recused himself from vote.

James Kelly appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed hood.

Mr. Nato asked if a color has been selected.

Mr. Kelly said a color has not been determined and the application will return to the Board for review of that detail.

Mr. Hanson asked if it will be a standing or flat seem.

Mr. Kelly said a flat seem.

Mr. Carter asked if there will be recessed lighting.

Mr. Kelly said lighting also has not been determined and the application will return to the Board for review of that detail.

Chris Hanson moved to approve the application as submitted.

Kate Flanagan seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-010

Applicant:	Tiffany Buxton
Owner:	TiffanyMichelle Design, LLC
Location:	117 Lander Street

Returning for determination to install new roof shingles, new gutter system, new siding, new lighting, new windows, new front entrance door, new front entrance stairs, new front entrance stair handrails and restore/repoint brick.

AR 2023-011

Applicant:	Tiffany Buxton
Owner:	David Herring, III
Location:	119 Lander Street

Returning for determination to install new roof shingles, new gutter system, new siding, new lighting, new windows, new front entrance door, new front entrance stairs, new front entrance stair handrails and restore/repoint brick.

Juante Rich appeared before the Board for applications AR 2023-010 and AR 2023-0011 and gave an overview of the details for both applications requested at the February 2023 meeting.

Mr. Kelly asked if the applicant would consider half round gutters for historic authenticity.

Mr. Rich said yes.

Mr. Carter asked if the front entrance steps will be skim coated.

Mr. Rich said they will be a brownstone color.

Mr. Carter asked about the placement of the uplighting under the windows.

Mr. Rich said the applicant likes the location of the lighting under the windows for additional lighting and aesthetics.

Mr. Hanson said the uplighting might be disruptive to the residents inside and add reflective light. He suggested moving the placement of the lighting in between the windows.

The Chairperson agreed and added that placing the lighting in between the windows will illuminate the beauty of the brick.

Mr. Nato said the placement of the lighting under the windows may not be historically appropriate for the style of the house.

Ms. Flanagan referred to the East End Historic Guidelines regarding lighting.

For application AR 2023-010 - 117 Lander Street

Chris Hanson moved to approve the application as submitted, subject to the following amendments:

- The gutters shall be of same material and dimensions as submitted, but will be half round in style.
- The façade-mounted lighting will feature four light fixtures in total (not six as submitted), with the configuration being one fixture flanking each side of the front door and one fixture each mounted flanking in between the second and the third-floor windows.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

For application AR 2023-010 - 119 Lander Street

Chris Hanson moved to approve the application as submitted, subject to the following amendments noting the window configuration on the parlor floor is different from 117 Lander Street application.

- The gutters shall be of same material and dimensions, as submitted but will be half round in style.
- The façade-mounted lighting will feature four light fixtures in total (not six as submitted), with the configuration being one fixture flanking each side of the front door and one fixture each mounted flanking in between the second and the third-floor windows.

James Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-137

Applicant: Rene Gonzalez Orta
Owner: 129 3rd Street of Newburgh LLC
Location: 66 Campbell Street

Returning for determination to install new windows, new front door, new side door, new fascia, new balusters, new siding, new gutters, new floor tiles and concrete ramp on front entry porch and repair/repoint brick.

James Gibbons and Rene Gonzalez Orta appeared before the Board.

James Gibbons gave an overview of the requested revisions and details from the December 2022 meeting.

Mr. Kelly asked why an “Arts & Crafts” style was selected for the front door.

Mr. Gibbons said that type is more readily available.

Mr. Kelly said the “Arts & Crafts” style is not historically accurate. He recommended a simple wood door with glazing at the top and a paneled bottom, installing a Yankee Gutter system and eliminating the second step on the corbel in keeping with the historic accuracy.

Mr. Hanson asked to confirm the window style.

Mr. Gibbons said aluminum clad Pella window with simulated grills.

Mr. Nato recommended peeling back the front door infill and examining the true opening of the front door.

Ms. Flanagan requested additional details for the rear addition.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit additional details.

AR 2023-006

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Jonathan Moss
Owner: Newburgh SHG 8 LLC
Newburgh SHG 9 LLC
Newburgh SHG 10 LLC
Location: 150-156 Broadway

Returning for determination to construct a new 5-story infill mixed-use building in an existing vacant lot.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed changes made to the plan and requested views and details since the January 2023 meeting.

Mr. Carter asked if there were samples of the aluminum footed cornice.

Mr. Berg said he did not have a sample, but it will be a heavy gage aluminum.

Mr. Carter asked if they plan to use the same type of cornice on the window surrounds as they have for the storefront windows.

Mr. Berg said yes.

Mr. Berg presented a sample of the brick.

Mr. Hanson asked if it is a cement brick.

Mr. Berg said it is a clay brick with a finish.

Mr. Buonanno asked if they are proposing windows on the West side that look out at the adjacent building.

Mr. Berg said yes.

Mr. Buonanno asked if there are provisions for an easement with the adjacent building.

Mr. Berg said the owner owns both properties.

Mr. Buonanno asked the applicant to speak on the plans for the sidewalks.

Mr. Berg said the City has plans for the corner bump-out. He said there are plans for a deeper tree pit with the Planning Board. He said he is looking for a variance from the ARC to use brushed concrete.

The Chairperson asked to explain why Johnston Street ground floor appears to be different in style from the Broadway side.

Mr. Berg said the Johnston Street side hosts the loading dock and lobby entrances and the Broadway side will be retail only entrances.

Mr. Carter asked about the lighting plan.

Mr. Berg said he will return to the Board with the lighting detail.

Ms. Flanagan requested corbel details and design elements.

The Chairperson requested lighting details and a sample of the metal being used on the face of the storefront.

Mr. Kelly requested drawings presenting the building banding.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit additional details.

AR 2022-125

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Chris Berg
Owner: Guy R. Larocca
Location: 211 Broadway

Returning for determination on demolition of an existing 3-bay garage and 1 story office.

The Board called into record AR2023-012 to be discussed in tandem with the demolition portion of this application.

AR 2023-012

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Chris Berg
Owner: Guy R. Larocca
Location: 211 Broadway

Application to construct a new, mixed-use building.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the changes requested at the February meeting.

Mr. Hanson asked if the brick will have a sheen.

Mr. Berg said no, it will have a matte finish to resemble the Newburgh historical brick.

Mr. Nato said the revision to the Ann Street side design feels more cohesive to the Broadway side.

The Chairperson agreed and said the added lighting and brick helped.

Mr. Hanson said he thinks the Ann Street side could use more street appeal. He suggested placing a sidewalk café in the rear.

The Chairperson said any street appeal addition would have to be upstairs as the ground floor is occupied as a parking garage.

Ms. Flanagan said although discussion on the new construction is relevant in determining approval of the demolition of the existing, sufficient material has not been presented to approve the demolition.

The Chairperson said, in her opinion, these garages proposed for demolition are not of historic importance to the Broadway or Ann Street landscape. She said street appeal does need to be considered for the Ann Street side to encourage foot traffic.

Ms. Flanagan said the proposed infill building is significantly taller and it aesthetically overshadows the immediate adjoining buildings. She referred to the East End Historic District guidelines regarding height.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson held the public hearing open.

Discussion by the Board regarding the new building:

Mr. Kelly suggested deeper, more pronounced design setbacks and step-ups on the Ann Street side to offset the height.

Mr. Carter said he likes the design. He suggested the addition of more windows on the ground floor of the Ann Street side.

Mr. Nato said this design is an interesting, creative addition to the past.

Mr. Buonanno said he likes the overall massing and direction of the building. He said he would like to see the dimensions of the setbacks. He said he likes the idea of a mural on the Ann Street side.

Mr. Hanson said the design is good. He said the design successfully deals with achieving the balance of height. He said you do not notice the massing until you are in front of the building.

The Chairperson said she agrees with Mr. Nato and Mr. Hanson. She said the design plan is moving in the right direction.

The applicant requested a table of both application to submit additional details.

AR 2023-004

Applicant:	Berg + Moss Architects / Chris Berg
Owner:	Newburgh SHG 90 LLC
Location:	128 First Street

Returning for determination to repair/ replace cornice, fascia and edge flashing on rear and side façade, repair/restore masonry window arches and sills, repair and paint existing fire escape, stabilize and repoint chimney, restore/repair cornice on front façade, repair existing leader of front façade, repair awning and brackets, repoint the existing brick, install new metal railing, restore existing masonry steps, install new rear side and front entrance doors, repair and replace masonry, install new and/or restore windows.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the requested details from the February 2023 meeting.

Mr. Kelly asked if there is a mansard roof under the front entrance hood and will the hood remain as is.

Mr. Berg said the hood is in good condition and there are no plans to remove the hood.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the application as submitted.

Carson Carter seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2022-122

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Chris Berg

Owner: Konranbloom LLC

Location: 158 Montgomery Street

Amendment to 11/21/22 approved application.

Substituting custom casement windows with Pella aluminum clad wood windows. Adding new wood composite trim to match Montgomery Street elevation.

Chris Berg and Roberto Brambilla appeared before the Board.

Mr. Berg gave an overview of the proposed window changes.

Mr. Brambilla added that they propose to reproduce the front façade window woodwork details on the rear windows.

Mr. Hanson asked to confirm that the proposal for the east facing windows will be pane glass windows, 4/1 window style.

Mr. Brambilla said yes.

The Chairperson asked if these east facing windows are fixed windows.

Mr. Brambilla said yes.

The Chairperson asked to confirm that the side windows open.

Mr. Brambilla said yes.

Mr. Carter asked if they take material off from the first floor and discover historic material would the intention be to replicate the historic material.

Mr. Brambilla said yes.

The Chairperson moved to approve the application as submitted.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

NEW BUSINESS

AR 2023-021

Applicant: Pastor Robert McLymore
Owner: Life Restoration Church, LLC
Location: 136 First Street

Application to ratify installation of new windows.

Pastor Robert McLymore and Mary McLymore appeared before the Board.

Pastor McLymore gave an overview of the proposed project. He said certain windows had been vandalized over the years and they were replaced with windows he believed were previously approved by the ARC and match the windows in other areas of the building.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said the applicant submitted into record an ARC approval letter from 2004 for the installation of vinyl windows on the 1st and 2nd floor. He said recently the applicant installed the same type of vinyl windows on the 3rd floor without a permit, which resulted in a stop work order being issued.

Mr. Kelly referred to the history of the building and what would have been the original windows. The remaining 3rd floor windows are Pittsburgh steel, most likely installed in the 1930's and not original to the 1876 building.

Mr. Buonanno asked how many more windows are left to install.

Pastor McLymore said 13 or 14 windows.

The Chairperson clarified that the application before the Board is only for the windows already installed and not for replacement of the remaining 13 to 14 windows.

Ms. Flanagan said this is an application to request ratification of work performed on the 3rd floor windows. She said that because the work was performed without going through the process, the ability to weigh the 2004 letter against making the exemption to install vinyl windows is difficult.

Mr. Hanson asked if the work performed without an ARC review or permit was because the installation was an extended repair in kind and the windows were approved in the past.

Pastor McLymore said he was unaware of the process. He said if this installation is not approved and the windows must be removed, the windows openings will have to be boarded up due to financial constraints.

Mr. Nato asked if there are any remaining historic windows.

Pastor McLymore said yes.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Buonanno inquired about economic hardship.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel referred to City Code 300-41.

Mr. Buonanno said he would vote for ratification with an understanding moving forward windows will be installed with prior approvals.

The Chairperson agreed. She recommended pursuing an economic hardship application if the Board should vote no on the ratification application.

The Chairperson moved to approve the application as submitted.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion was denied 6-1 via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-022

Applicant: Carson Carter
Owner: Over Eager, LLC
Location: 120 First Street

Application to repair the wood siding, restore the original wood stoop and entryway, restore/repair existing rear porches, install new wood fence and gates, restore existing wood windows, install new wood shutters and reset the bluestone sidewalks and granite curbing.

Carson Carter recused himself from vote.

Carson Carter and Jeff Wilkinson appeared before the Board.

Mr. Carter gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Carter and Mr. Wilkinson gave an overview of details.

Mr. Hanson asked if the current windows are the original windows.

Mr. Carter said the current windows are from the 1900s.

Mr. Carter said he is requesting approval to install a fence height of 5'4".

Ms. Flanagan said she would approve the fence variance because the existing fence is higher.

The Chairperson asked about the color proposed for the façade.

Mr. Carter said the façade will be a cream color.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

James Kelly moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-023

Applicant: Izzy Ostreicher
Owner: Chayim E. Lerner
Location: 168 South Street

Application requesting ratification of work performed: painting using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson requested removing from the front façade the satellite dish, the exposed wires and to close the electrical box.

Chris Hanson moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-024

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Jonathan Moss
Owner: Newburgh SHG 98 LLC
Location: 94 Overlook Place

AR 2023-025

Applicant: Berg + Moss Architects / Jonathan Moss
Owner: Newburgh SHG 99 LLC
Location: 96 Overlook Place

Application to repair and repoint brick, install new wood and glass front door, install new windows, install new lighting, repair cornice and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

Chris Berg gave an overview of the proposed projects. He preferred to present the applications together because a similar design is proposed for the side-by-side attached buildings.

For application AR2023-024 94 Overlook Place

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson moved to approve the application as submitted with the exception of the selected paint color “Chantilly Lace” which is not within the Historic Color Palette.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

For application AR2023-025 96 Overlook Place

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson moved to approve the application as submitted with the exception of the selected paint color “Chantilly Lace” which is not within the Historic Color Palette.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-026

Applicant: Niemotko Architects PC / David Niemotko

Owner: Eldz Property LLC

Location: 199 Chambers Street

Application to install new windows.

Sebastian Carlton appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Carter asked about the plan for the storefront window.

Mr. Carlton did not have that detail available.

Mr. Hanson, referring to the rear elevation, if that is a wall or an extension.

Mr. Carlton said the building extends all the way back to grade.

The Chairperson asked if the proposed windows are of vinyl material.

Mr. Kelly said the windows have been installed.

Mr. Carlton said their architectural firm was just hired and is unaware of the prior installations.

The Chairperson asked for drawings reflecting the original measurements of the windows to be replaced (to the full brick opening) and the window specifications.

Mr. Carter asked if they should propose to replace the front entry door and a sign for the storefront that those details would need to be submitted for ARC review and approval.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit additional details.

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 10:31 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted:

Approved:

J.K. Gentile, Secretary

Michele Basch, Chairperson