

MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting of August 8, 2023

The monthly meeting of the City of Newburgh Architectural Review Commission (“ARC”) was held on Tuesday, August 8, 2023, at 6:30 p.m. at the Activity Center, 401 Washington Street, Newburgh, New York 12550.

Members Present: Michele Basch, Chairperson
Michael Buonanno
Carson Carter
James Kelly
Schnekwa McNeil
Gregory Nato

Absent: Kate Flanagan
Chris Hanson

Also Present: Jeremy Kaufman, Assistant Corporation Counsel
J.K. Gentile, Secretary to the Land Use Boards

Meeting called to order at 6:35 p.m.

Minutes of the July 11, 2023, ARC meeting

Carson Carter moved to accept the minutes from the July 2023 ARC meeting.
The Chairperson seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

CONSENT AGENDA

AR 2023-086

Applicant: Barbara Hamilton
Owner: Barbara Hamilton
Location: 31 Liberty Street WH

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

James Kelly moved to approve the Consent Agenda as submitted.
The Chairperson seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

OLD BUSINESS

AR 2023-056

Applicant: Yanikza Jimenez
Owner: Ashley David Brun & Yanikza Jimenez
Location: 24 Courtney Avenue

AR 2023-068

Applicant: James H. Ray
Owner: James H. Ray & Margaret M. Ray
Location: 22 Courtney Avenue

Returning for determination to restore the front porches.

Applications AR2023-056 and AR2023-068 called into the record together as the properties share an attached porch.

Yanikza Jimenez, James Ray and Margaret Ray appeared before the Board.

Ms. Jimenez gave an overview of the details requested at the July 2023 meeting.

Mr. Kelly asked for the material proposed for the spindles and the posts.

Ms. Jimenez said wood.

AR 2023-056 **24 Courtney Avenue**

Gregory Nato moved to approve the application as submitted.
Carson Carter seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-068 **22 Courtney Avenue**

Carson Carter moved to approve the application as submitted.
James Kelly seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2021-036

Applicant: Kearney Realty and Development Group
Owner: City of Newburgh
Location: 15 South Colden Street

Amendment to 8/12/21 approved application.
Modifications made to the construction of a new apartment building with restaurant.

A.J. Coppola appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the updates made to the plan since the 8/21/21 approved application. He said on the first floor they moved the required community room from the rear of the building to the front as per HCR comments. He said they added a 2nd and 3rd floor portion that is recessed back behind the restaurant.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the application as submitted.
Michael Buonanno seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-065

Applicant: Paula Donaldson/SheWorksShe
Owner: Raynard Shorter & Shaniqua Williams
Location: 296 Grand Street

Returning for determination to install new roof and Yankee gutters.

Paula Donaldson appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the details requested at the July 2023 meeting.

Mr. Kelly asked if the window casing product will match the original.

Ms. Donaldson confirmed and said the color scheme will match the original.

Mr. Carter asked if there is a submitted specification sheet for the indented cornice round.

Ms. Donaldson said she did not submit a cut sheet.

The Chairperson requested the submission of a cut sheet from the manufacturer.

Mr. Carter asked about the type of flashing proposed and paint colors.

Ms. Donaldson presented the paint colors.

Mr. Kelly requested a spec sheet for the ridge cap and pyramidal ridge cap, with materials.

Ms. Donaldson said the material type will be copper.

Mr. Carter asked if the pattern of the slate will mimic the original pattern.

Ms. Donaldson confirmed.

Mr. Nato asked the applicant to confirm that the current renovation work proposed is the flat roof, the sloped roof, and the round windows as measured from the roof to the bottom of the brackets.

Ms. Donaldson confirmed.

Mr. Nato asked if there are plans to return for window replacements.

Ms. Donaldson confirmed.

Mr. Carter asked about the existing chimneys.

Ms. Donaldson said they propose to restore the chimneys and not replace.

Mr. Nato asked about the existing skylight.

Ms. Donaldson said the existing skylight will remain.

Carson Carter moved to approve the application subject to the following conditions:

- Submission of cut sheets for the trim work
- Submission of specification sheets for the ridge cap and material
- Chimneys (2 total) shall be restored and not removed
- Copper skylight shall be restored and not removed

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-064

Applicant:	Jonathan Moss/Berg + Moss Architects, PC
Owner:	Zeqir Hakanjin
Location:	405 Grand Street

Returning for determination to install new windows, install new siding, install new roofing shingles, replace front entrance stair treads, restore existing retaining wall, brick repointing and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

Jonathan Moss appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the details requested at the July 2023 meeting. He asked the Board if it preferred the retaining wall be removed to match the adjacent property and the neighboring properties.

Mr. Kelly asked if the retaining wall is a necessary site/engineering feature.

Mr. Moss said no. He said the owner proposes to reclad it or remove it.

Mr. Carter asked if the dormer attic windows could be restored to 1/1 window style.

Mr. Moss said the dormer attic windows are fire rescue windows and cannot be 1/1 window style.

Mr. Kelly asked for the material of the stoop steps and railings.

Mr. Moss said the steps will be brick with lime wash and the railings will be black painted pipe rail.

Gregory Nato made a motion to approve the application subject to:

- The retaining wall shall be removed as part of any proposed scope of work.

Michael Buonanno seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-063

Applicant:	John Waters
Owner:	The City of Newburgh
Location:	123 Renwick Street

Returning for determination to install new windows, repair window framing, repair storefront doors and transom, restore existing cast iron columns, install new entry door, repair wood paneling, repair windowsills and lintels, repair cornice, repair roof, remove roll down gate, brick repointing and painting using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

Kristine Magliano appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the details requested at the July 2023 meeting.

Mr. Carter asked to confirm the height of the gate.

Ms. Magliano said 6 feet high.

Mr. Carter said the height is higher than the streetscape standard.

James Kelly moved to approve the application subject to the following condition:

- The fence shall be 5 feet in height (instead of 6 feet, as originally proposed).

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

NEW BUSINESS

AR 2023-058

Applicant: Yuliexis Perez
Owner: Yuliexis Perez
Location: 8 Mill Street

Returning for determination to install new front deck.

Yuliexis Perez and Natalia Garcia-Perez appeared before the Board.

Ms. Garcia-Perez gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Kelly asked for the material of the railings.

Ms. Garcia-Perez said pressure treated wood.

Mr. Carter asked if the spindles are staying.

Ms. Garcia-Perez confirmed.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the application as submitted.

James Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-066

Applicant: Paula Donaldson/SheWorksShe
Owner: Minnie McDuffie, Estate/c/o Sadie Stanley
Location: 152 Johnston Street

Application to install a new roof and Yankee gutters.

Paula Donaldson appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Nato asked if they are proposing to repair or replace the Yankee Gutters.

Ms. Donaldson said they propose to repair.

Mr. Kelly asked if they are proposing to replace the corbels.

Ms. Donaldson confirmed, replacement with pressure treated wood.

Mr. Carter asked if the chimneys would remain.

Ms. Donaldson confirmed.

The Chairperson asked if the brick will be repointed.

Ms. Donaldson said yes.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

James Kelly moved to approve the application subject to the following conditions:

- Brick repair shall be performed, and using the following treatment:
 1. D2 cleaner or gentler
 2. Application of a lime wash
 3. Repointing in kind with soft lime mortar in classic Newburgh red

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-072

Applicant:	Richard Heffernan
Owner:	Newburgh SHG 83 LLC
Location:	79 Lander Street

Application to request ratification to remove paint from brick and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

Richard Heffernan appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the project.

Mr. Carter asked to confirm that the work has been performed.

Mr. Heffernan said partial work has been completed. He said he was unaware of the permit process for painting until the Department of Code Compliance issued a stop work order.

Mr. Carter asked if the plan included paint removal before re-painting.

Mr. Heffernan said they scraped the paint off and primed the brick.

Mr. Carter asked for the paint type.

Mr. Heffernan said Kilz latex.

Mr. Carter said that type is not appropriate for the historic soft brick.

The Chairperson requested the submission of a narrative detailing the technique used to remove the paint, the type and brand of the primer, a specification sheet of the type of breathable paint.

Mr. Kelly recommended the use of a mineral silicate, lime wash paint.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit the requested details.

AR 2023-073

Applicant: Jad Haddad/Stenger, Diamond & Glass LLC
Owner: 100 Courtney Avenue LLC
Location: 100 Courtney Avenue

Application to remove vinyl siding, scrape, clean and repair existing clapboard, repair or replace fascia and bracket and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

Jad Haddad, Esq. appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the current submission.

Mr. Carter asked for the paint colors.

Mr. Haddad said the building will be HC-17 Monterey White and the trim HC-185 Charleston Brown.

Mr. Kelly asked how the water penetration issue would be treated, as he recalled that being the original reason the applicant appeared before the ARC in its first application.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said the Department of Code Compliance would address the issue in connection with the building permit process.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Carson Carter moved to approve the application as submitted, subject to the following conditions:

- Clapboard shall be painted in HC-186 (Charleston Brown)
- Trim shall be painted in HC-27 (Monterrey White)

James Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-074

Applicant: Greg Sgromo
Owner: Liberty Corners, LLC
Location: 41 Liberty Street

Modifications to 9/20/18 approved application; roof top terrace, side door, standing seam on front bay window and roof.

Greg Sgromo and Dina Schnellinger appeared before the Board.

Mr. Sgromo gave an overview of the proposed modifications.

Mr. Carter asked if a top rail on the deck is proposed.

Mr. Sgromo confirmed.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

James Kelly moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-075

Applicant: Dmitry Pavlov
Owner: Dmitry Pavlov
Location: 146 Third Street

Application to request ratification to install a retaining wall.

Yulia Ovchinnikova appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the work performed.

Mr. Carter asked if the wall could be parged with some material to aide in the design.

Mr. Kelly said that would not work as it is not a mortared material. He said the material is a keystone Versa-Lok system.

Mr. Kelly asked if the design could include capping the wall in bluestone.

Mr. Carter agreed and also recommended landscaping to assist in design appeal.

Mr. Nato asked for the distance of the retaining wall from edge of the sidewalk.

Ms. Ovchinnikova said approximately one foot.

Mr. Carter reiterated Mr. Kelly's question and asked the applicant if they would consider capping the wall with bluestone.

Ms. Ovchinnikova said no because all the materials have been purchased already. She said she would add plantings in front of the retaining wall.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

James Kelly moved to approve the application as submitted, subject to the following condition:

- The retaining wall height shall be no greater than the current cap height on the west side, front façade of the property.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed 4-2 via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-076

Applicant:	Thomas Wright
Owner:	Consolidated Spring
Location:	102 S. William Street

Application to remove roll-down gate, restore window bays and install new windows.

Justin Catania appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Austin DuBois spoke in favor of the application.

Sisha Ortuzar spoke in favor of the application.

Greg Sgromo spoke in favor of the application.

Eli Vaknin spoke in favor of the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson moved to approve the application as submitted.

James Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-077

Applicant: Rochel Ellis-Smith
Owner: Amelia Realty LLC
Location: 8 Bay View Terrace

Application to install a new roof, install a new gutter system, install new siding, install a new porch, install new windows, install a new front door and paint.

Rochel Ellis-Smith and Jean Valmont appeared before the Board.

Ms. Ellis-Smith gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson asked about the proposed modifications for the roof.

Ms. Ellis-Smith said there is significant structural damage to the roof. She said the entire roof will be replaced. She said the rear bump out is not original to the home. She said she proposes to demolish the rear dormer roof, increase the head space in the attic and add a flat roof for the rear portion.

Mr. Kelly asked to confirm that the current roof material is slate.

Ms. Ellis-Smith confirmed.

Mr. Kelly said for historical accuracy he recommends double-hung, 1/1 style, wood windows instead of the proposed casement windows. He recommended replacing the roofing material with either slate or imitation slate, using colors and shape that matches what is existing.

Mr. Carter recommended referring to historic photos of the property to assist in keeping with historic accuracy.

Mr. Nato recommended preserving what is already existing and improve on that.

Ms. Ellis-Smith asked if pursuing the proposed bump-out is in keeping with historic accuracy.

The Chairperson referred to the East End Historic Guidelines regarding the bump out.

Ms. Ellis-Smith asked if it would be appropriate to add one-story to the bump out while maintaining the gabled roof as is.

Mr. Carter said to determine if this proposal meets the criteria of the East End Historic District guidelines it must be reflected in the plans for review.

Ms. Ellis-Smith asked if she could remove the recessed, 26' x 64' windows on the north side.

Mr. Kelly said if the windows are not visible from the street the decision to remove is not within the ARC purview, but a ruling from the Department of Code Compliance would be required.

Mr. Kelly said the proposed front entry door is not historically accurate.

Mr. Carter asked if the original front door was found in the house.

Ms. Ellis-Smith said no.

Mr. Carter said the proposed porch is not historically accurate as there are too many spindles.

Mr. Kelly recommended selecting thicker spindles in wood material.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit the requested details.

AR 2023-078

Applicant:	James Kelly
Owner:	Judy K. Thomas
Location:	32 Benkard Avenue

Application to install new windows, restore/rebuild soffit, and gutter, rebuild second story bay window, replace corbels, replace copper flashing pilasters, and replace spandrel hood.

James Kelly recused himself from vote.

James Kelly appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Carter asked if the brick pilaster on the west side is original.

Mr. Kelly said no.

Mr. Carter asked for the proposed material of the drip edge.

Mr. Kelly said copper.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Austin Dubois spoke in favor of the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson asked if this application will be reviewed by SHPO.

Mr. Kelly confirmed.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the application as submitted.

Carson Carter seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-079

Applicant:	Austin Dubois
Owner:	Austin Dubois
Location:	7 Benkard Avenue

Application to construct a 3rd story addition.

Austin Dubois appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson asked if the proposed addition will be higher than adjacent building to the East.

Mr. Dubois said yes, by a few feet.

Mr. Buonanno asked if there are proposed changes to the original building.

Mr. Dubois said no.

Mr. Kelly said this proposal appears to meet the requirements of the East End Historic Guidelines.

Mr. Carter said the bulkhead door makes the building appear inordinately tall.

Mr. Nato agreed.

Mr. Carter asked to consider a spiral staircase to the back to help reduce the height.

The Chairperson said the addition is set back in the rear.

Mr. Buonanno asked if the bulkhead could be enclosed in glass to reduce the appearance of height.

Mr. Carter said there is going to be a height rise from the Liberty Street perspective.

Mr. Carter asked for a discussion on the vertical window in the proposed addition.

Mr. Kelly said it differentiates it as a modern addition.

The Chairperson agreed.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the application as submitted, with the option to construct the bulkhead as submitted or to construct the bulkhead in glass.

James Kelly seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-080

Applicant: Josh West/Oculus Inc.
Owner: Newburgh SHG 5 LLC
Location: 230 Broadway

Application to install a new roll-down gate and new door.

The Applicant did not appear for the meeting.

The Board tabled the application to the September 2023 meeting.

AR 2023-081

Applicant: Prince Holman
Owner: JQ Real Estate Ventures LLC
Location: 38 Lander Street

Application to install new door, new roof shingles, new light fixtures, new wood window trim, new wood shakes, new treads, wood posts & railing on front stairway and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

Carson Carter recused himself from discussion and vote.

Prince Holman appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson asked what roof shingles currently exist.

Mr. Kelly said confirmed that the shingles are architectural shingles.

Mr. Kelly recommended replicating the porch at 36 Lander Street and sourcing a historic front entrance door.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

James Kelly moved to approve the application as submitted.

Michele Basch seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-082

Applicant:	Sisha Ortuzar
Owner:	191 Washington Street LLC
Location:	191 Washington Street

Application to install new door, new roof shingles, new light fixtures, new wood window trim, new wood shakes, new treads, wood posts & railing or front stairway and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

Sisha Ortuzar appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Kelly asked how many storefronts are proposed.

Mr. Ortuzar said four commercial spaces that will be divided into smaller spaces.

Mr. Kelly said the proposal is a well-designed apartment house.

Mr. Nato said the design is sensitive to the streetscape and serves as an anchor for the corner and future neighborhood.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Greg Sgromo spoke in favor of the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson asked if a green roof could be considered.

Mr. Ortuzar said they would consider if it can make financial sense.

Mr. Kelly asked if the original Perkins & Will color scheme design could be maintained.

Mr. Carson asked about the plans for the stone wall on the Washington Street side.

Mr. Ortuzar said they propose to plaster with solid concrete.

Mr. Buonanno recommended a solar array with the amount of flat roof space. He said the massing is well thought out. He requested submission of additional detail on the materials and color selections. He said he agreed with brushed concrete sidewalks and granite curbing.

Mr. Nato agrees with brushed concrete and granite curbing.

Mr. Kelly agreed with brushed concrete with concrete curbing.

Ms. McNeil liked the overall concept of the project.

The Chairperson also preferred brushed concrete with granite curbing and suggested pursuing available grants for solar.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit the requested additional material details.

AR 2023-083

Applicant:	Eli Vaknin and Wiktoria Staromiejska
Owner:	Eli Vaknin and Wiktoria Staromiejska
Location:	145 North Miller Street

Seeking approval to demolish the existing structure and construct a new structure.

Eli Vaknin, Wiktoria Staromiejska, Greg Sgromo, P.E. and Jon Moss appeared before the Board.

Mr. Vaknin gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Sgromo gave an overview of the current conditions and structural deficiencies of the building. He said there is no actual foundation. He said there is not one piece of wood that is not rotted out by carpenter ants. He said there are no windows remaining.

Mr. Moss agreed and said the timber frame is bent, and the braces and tongue and groove are absent.

Mr. Carter asked if they could preserve some of the materials, particularly the front entry door.

Mr. Moss said the door is unsalvageable.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Buonanno asked why they propose 6/6 window style on the façade and 1/1 window style for the rear.

Mr. Vaknin said it aides in the addition of light in front.

Mr. Carter asked if they would consider keeping continuity with the window style on all windows and incorporate the historic door.

James Kelly moved to approve the application as submitted, subject to the following conditions:

- Windows shall be 6/6 style on the north and south elevation.
- The side lights and transom of the front entrance shall be refurbished or replicated to match the current configuration and style.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimous via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-084

Applicant:	Nathaniel Gooden, P.E./Caesar Engineering D.P.C.
Owner:	Stephen Taya Property Development, LLC
Location:	193 North Miller Street & 192 Dubois Street

Application to construct a three-story residential property.

Michael Robinson, Nathaniel Gooden, and Nick Caesar appeared before the Board.

Mr. Gooden gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Kelly said switching the bay windows to the outside with a flat brick section in the middle of the conjoined buildings would be historically accurate. He said the Arts and Crafts door is not historically accurate.

Mr. Carter said the rear design does not lend itself to the character of Dubois Street. He said the rear appears too contemporary.

Mr. Nato said the door is not historically accurate. He asked for the material in the center stripe.

Mr. Caesar said a vertical timber wood.

Mr. Nato said the color is not enough of a contrast.

The Chairperson said the middle modern portion needs a stronger contrast from the historic style side brick portions.

The Chairperson said to consider placing a roof over the rear parking area for added green space,

much like a terrace. She said it would aide as a visual buffer for Dubois Street.

Mr. Carter said the rear windows are out of proportion with the neighboring windows on Dubois Street. He recommends matching the rhythm of the façade windows.

Mr. Carter recommended permeable pavement for the parking lot.

The Chairperson referred to the East End Historic Guidelines regarding new construction.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

James Kelly moved to approve the application as submitted.

Michele Basch seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-085

Applicant:	George Keyer
Owner:	Courtney NY LLC
Location:	177 Grand Street

Application to restore front porch, restore fence and paint using a color from the Sherwin Williams Historic Color palette.

George Keyer appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

James Kelly moved to approve the application as submitted.

Michele Basch seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 10:38 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted:

J.K. Gentile, Secretary

Approved:

Michele Basch, Chairperson