

CITY OF NEWBURGH
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
123 Grand Street, Newburgh, New York 12550

Michele Basch, Chairperson
J.K. Gentile, Secretary
Phone: (845) 569-7383

MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting of October 10, 2023

The monthly meeting of the City of Newburgh Architectural Review Commission (“ARC”) was held on Tuesday, October 10, 2023, at 6:30 p.m. at the Activity Center, 401 Washington Street, Newburgh, New York 12550.

Members Present: Michele Basch, Chairperson
Michael Buonanno
Carson Carter
Kate Flanagan
Chris Hanson
Gregory Nato

Absent: James Kelly
Schnekwa McNeil

Also Present: Jeremy Kaufman, Assistant Corporation Counsel
J.K. Gentile, Secretary to the Land Use Boards

Meeting called to order at 6:33 p.m.

CONSENT AGENDA

AR 2023-101

Applicant: Adam Shayenfekr
Owner: Newburgh SHG 24 LLC
Location: 30 City Terrace

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-102

Applicant: Adam Shayenfekr
Owner: Newburgh SHG 117 LLC
Location: 32 City Terrace

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-103

Applicant: Adam Shayenfekr/ Newburgh SHG 132 LLC
Owner: Guy Larocca
Location: 204 Broadway

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2023-106

Applicant: Michael Mamiye
Owner: Nutopia 56 Dubois LLC
Location: 56-58 Dubois Street

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

Chris Hanson moved to approve the Consent Agenda as submitted.
The Chairperson seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

OLD BUSINESS

AR 2023-084

Applicant: Nathaniel Gooden, P.E./Caesar Engineering D.P.C.
Owner: Stephen Taya Property Development, LLC
Location: 193 North Miller Street & 192 Dubois Street

Returning for determination to construct a three-story residential property.

Michael Robinson and Nathaniel Gooden appeared before the Board.

Mr. Gooden gave an overview of the proposed design.

Mr. Robinson gave additional details on the proposed design and the proposed project.

Ms. Flanagan asked if the East End Historic District guidelines consider solar panels differently for new construction.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel referred to the East End Historic District guidelines for the Board.

Mr. Buonanno said he would have liked to have seen a greater deviation from the styles of the neighboring buildings.

Mr. Hanson recommended placing a cornerstone on the building with a date.

Mr. Carter asked the status of the proposed carport.

Mr. Robinson said the status of the proposed carport is not determined yet. He assumes a balustrade of solar panels.

Chris Hanson moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-067

Applicant: Jonathan Falcon
Owner: 22-24 Liberty LLC
Location: 22 Liberty Street

Returning for determination on a ratification of work performed, paint façade of brick building using colors from the Farrow & Ball Historic Color palette.

Jonathan Falcon appeared before the Board and presented the Farrow & Ball Historic color, “Nancy’s Blushes” No.278.

The Chairperson asked to confirm that the full façade will be repainted in the presented color.

Mr. Falcon confirmed.

Kate Flanagan moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-100

Applicant: Mercedes Toribio
Owner: Mercedes Toribio
Location: 65 Campbell Street

Returning for determination to restore front porch and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

Mercedes Toribio and Ted Miro appeared before the Board.

Ms. Toribio gave an update on the proposed project. She said they propose to remove the metal siding on the front porch, expose the cedar shakes, expose the trim, and paint.

The Chairperson asked the applicant to confirm the paint colors.

Ms. Toribio said HC-153 Marlboro Blue and HC-27 Monterey White.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the application as submitted.

Carson Carter seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-077

Applicant: Rochel Ellis-Smith
Owner: Amelia Realty LLC
Location: 8 Bay View Terrace

Application to install a new roof, install a new gutter system, install new siding, install a new porch, install new windows, install a new front door and paint.

Rochel Ellis-Smith appeared before the Board and gave an update of the proposed project.

The Chairperson asked which roof shingle has been selected.

Ms. Ellis-Smith said at the last meeting she presented photos from the neighboring properties that have asphalt roof shingles and that she would like to be afforded the same option. She said the type of asphalt shingle is shown on the submitted rendering.

Ms. Flanagan said submitting examples of historically inappropriate details from neighboring properties does not allow an applicant to be non-compliant with the East End Historic District guidelines.

The Chairperson referred to the East End Historic District guidelines regarding roofing materials.

Ms. Flanagan clarified that the existing roof shingle is slate, and the guidelines reflect that roof materials shall be replaced with a product that matches what is currently in place. Asphalt shingles are not appropriate for this application.

Mr. Carter recommended exploring examples of faux slate material roof shingles.

The Chairperson asked about the type of gutter system proposed.

Ms. Ellis-Smith said an aluminum gutter system.

The Chairperson asked about the type of siding proposed.

Ms. Ellis-Smith said smooth Hardie Plank.

The Chairperson asked about the siding color proposed.

Ms. Ellis-Smith said the color was submitted in earlier submissions.

The Chairperson asked about the type of windows proposed.

Ms. Ellis-Smith said Pella Lifestyle, aluminum-clad double-hung windows.

The Chairperson asked about the type of front door proposed.

Ms. Ellis-Smith said she provided the door spec in the earlier submission. She said it is a full oak door.

The Chairperson confirmed that the Board did not receive the door spec in an earlier submission. The Assistant Corporation Counsel requested the applicant to re-submit the door specification.

Mr. Carter said a door image was part of the September 2023 meeting submission, but it did not provide specifications. He requested details to demonstrate that the selected door will fit into the existing door opening.

Mr. Hanson asked if she proposed a salvaged door.

Ms. Ellis-Smith confirmed.

Ms. Flanagan asked for confirmation that the image is only an example but not the actual salvaged door.

Ms. Ellis-Smith confirmed.

Mr. Carter asked if the front door replacement is necessary.

Ms. Ellis-Smith said the existing front door is no longer viable as the house has been sitting vacant for ten years.

Mr. Carter asked about the front porch.

Ms. Ellis-Smith said the porch will be treated to resemble the Colonial historic style with four posts, ornate details, decorative pieces and 9-inch decorative rails at the top.

Mr. Carter said the second floor of the front porch is not historically accurate and demonstrated the differences by using a historic photo of the property.

The Chairperson asked the Board their concerns and comments regarding the application other than the roof shingles.

Mr. Buonanno requested an updated, comprehensive plan set submission with details and specification for each modification.

Mr. Nato said he is in favor of the windows, Hardie Board siding, gutters and leaders, salvaged door, and the porch with submission of the proportions.

Mr. Carter requested additional details and cut sheets for the porch. He said his concerns are the spindles, posts and the north elevation.

Mr. Hanson said is in favor of all that has been submitted except the roof shingles.

The Chairperson requested the submission of front porch details.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit the requested details.

AR 2023-096

Applicant:	Julian Mann
Owner:	46 Lutheran Street, LLC
Location:	46 Lutheran Street

Returning for determination to rebuild the front porch.

Julian Mann appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed front porch.

Mr. Mann submitted for review drawings with measurement and material specifications. He said there are no proposed plans to paint the wood, and seal coat only. He said architectural and stamped plans are forthcoming for submission to the Building Department to lend a clearer focus of the proposed design.

Mr. Hanson asked the applicant to confirm that there is no proposed bottom rail and that the spindles would extend to the bottom deck.

Mr. Mann said that is a design error on the drawings and that there is a proposed bottom rail. He said that the top spindles are also missing from the drawing.

Mr. Hanson said those details would need to be provided on the drawing for review and approval.

Mr. Mann asked the Board to review the proposed drawing with the spindles extending to the bottom deck. He said he had met with the Building Department to review what is existing, what is proposed, what would meet code and what is being considered for review by the Architectural Review Commission.

Mr. Hanson asked the applicant to describe the newel posts at the bottom of the rail.

Mr. Mann said he proposes architecturally appropriate handrails on top of the newel posts.

Mr. Carson asked the applicant to describe the posts.

Mr. Mann said he is proposing 6 x 6 historic, turned, pressure treated wood posts.

Ms. Flanagan said it appears the submitted drawings present design discrepancies that do not match the work proposed. She asked the Board if an approval can move forth with the missing details that is expected from other applicants.

The Chairperson said in consideration that architectural drawings are forthcoming, the applicant might want to consider a table of the application for review of the requested details. She asked for the Board's consensus regarding the requested details.

The applicant requested to table the application.

AR 2022-123

Applicant:	Thomas Wright
Owner:	Consolidated Spring
Location:	102 S. William Street

Returning for determination to install new sidewalks.

Thomas Wright appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson asked to confirm that the request is for brushed concrete and a concrete curb.

Mr. Hanson asked if the Board has approved concrete curbs in the past.

Mr. Carter said the Board has reviewed and approved brushed concrete with granite or blue stone curb.

Mr. Wright said the entire south side of William Street is a concrete curb.

Mr. Hanson said the City's intent is to maintain a Streetscape Standard of stone curbing.

Ms. Flanagan added that the city's Streetscape Standard revision is recent, and the Board has the responsibility of reviewing the variances.

Mr. Buonanno said the concrete curbing creates consistency within the stretch of the street.

Mr. Nato said the granite curbing is a small request in maintaining the historic integrity of the East End Historic District.

Mr. Carter said granite curbing is a reasonable request.

Mr. Hanson said he would abstain from vote given the City's activity of re-doing sidewalks in certain areas of the East End Historic District.

Kate Flanagan moved to approve the application as submitted.
Michael Buonanno seconded the motion.
The motion was denied 3-2 via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-093

Applicant: Jonathan Cedillo
Owner: Jonathan Cedillo
Location: 47 Liberty Street WH

Returning for determination to install new roof shingles.

The Applicant did not appear for the meeting.

The Board tabled the application to the November 2023 meeting.

AR 2023-082

Applicant: Sisha Ortuzar
Owner: 191 Washington Street LLC
Location: 191 Washington Street

Returning for determination to construct two new mixed-use buildings.

Kate Flanagan abstained from the vote.

Erik Cooney appeared before the Board and gave an update on the proposed materials.

Mr. Nato said the massing is handled well with the use of the setbacks and the materials of the upper floors.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the application as submitted.
Chris Hanson seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-054

Applicant: Jonathan Moss/Berg + Moss Architects, PC
Owner: 233 Broadway Newburgh LLC
Location: 233 Broadway

Returning for determination to construct a new, mixed-use building.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave a brief update on last month's presentation. He said he provided the building materials requested at the September meeting. The materials presented included stucco, metal paneling and thin brick.

Kate Flanagan moved to approve the application as submitted.
Gregory Nato seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-004

Applicant: Chris Berg/Berg + Moss Architects, PC
Owner: Yachtisse LLC
Location: 236 Liberty Street

Amendment to January 10, 2023 approved application.
Returning for determination on modifications made to the storefront.

Chris Berg and Erik Cooney appeared before the Board.

Mr. Berg gave an overview of the design updates. He said they incorporated historic details into the updated design with the historic photos provided by Mr. Kelly.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the revisions to the application as submitted.
Chris Hanson seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-099

Applicant: Chris Berg/Berg + Moss Architects, PC
Owner: Gallegos Contractors Corp.
Location: 49 Henry Avenue

Returning for determination to install new siding, install new windows, install new gutter, install new front entry door, restore front porch, restore retaining wall, repair/replace fascia, repair masonry and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the changes discussed by the Board at the last meeting.

Chris Hanson moved to approve the application as submitted.
Gregory Nato seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

NEW BUSINESS

AR 2023-091

Applicant: Reverend Dr. Mary Barber
Owner: St. Georges Church
Location: 105 Grand Street

Application to install new roof shingles, restore and reline gutters, install new metal flashing, install new downspouts, repair/replace wood cornice, install concrete drywell, install new fence and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

Dr. Mary Barber appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-105

Applicant: Eli Vaknin and Sam Satanovsky
Owner: Hudson Living LLC
Location: 45 Liberty Street

Application to install a new sign.

The Applicant did not appear for the meeting.

The Board tabled the application to the November 2023 meeting.

AR 2023-104

Applicant: Jonathan Moss/Berg + Moss Architects, PC
Owner: Orange Property Development LLC
Location: 25 City Terrace

Application to construct a new rear addition, install new windows, install new siding, install new fascia board, install new roof shingles, install new gutters and leaders, repoint and parge chimney, and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore and Colonial Williamsburg Historic Color palette.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Chris Hanson moved to approve the application as submitted.

Kate Flanagan seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-107

Applicant: Chris Berg/Berg + Moss Architects, PC
Owner: Bradley Brown
Location: 29 Bay View Terrace

Application to restore existing porch and construct new upper-level porch deck, install new porch columns, install new porch railings, install new door, and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore and Colonial Williamsburg Historic Color palette.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Carter said the porch modifications proposed will not match the adjoining porch. He said historically they have always matched.

Mr. Flanagan said if they were separate buildings it would not be a concern, yet the mixed matched look would not be historically accurate. She recommended treating the new addition in a modern way to not mimic a historic look.

Mr. Hanson said the Heights in the 1880's had double-decker front porches. He said there is no evidence of walk out windows on the second floor which provides proof that this house did not have a double-decker front porch originally. He asked if they are proposing a second-floor door.

Mr. Berg confirmed.

Mr. Hanson said that would be a significant architectural change.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Buonanno recommended treating the proposed addition to look distinctively different from the original footprint.

Mr. Nato said removing the window and adding a door change will alter the building significantly as it will not match the adjoining building.

Ms. Flanagan said the building is part of a pair, and the addition would change the historic façade of the building. She said it is not in keeping with the historic accuracy to change a window into a door.

Mr. Carter said he would agree if there were doors on both sides.

Mr. Hanson said changing the window into a door is a significant architectural change and this addition changes the continuous sill line.

The Chairperson said the architecture was not intended to be two separate-looking houses.

The applicant requested a table of its application for further review.

AR 2023-108

Applicant:	Christopher Damone
Owner:	245-249 Broadway Partners LLC
Location:	245 Broadway

Application to install temporary cement board barriers painted with a color within the Historic Color palette.

Chris Damone appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project. He said this is a temporary solution and there are plans to restore the storefront.

Ms. Flanagan asked why a temporary application would come before the ARC Board.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said temporality is not a Board consideration in the Guidelines.

Ms. Flanagan referred to the East End Historic District guidelines regarding the material proposed.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The applicant requested a table of its application for further review.

AR 2023-109

Applicant: Diana Mangaser
Owner: Diana Mangaser and Yoshihiro Sergel
Location: 90 Washington Street

Application to repair/restore front façade: brick, windows, doors, cornice, balconies, front steps and landing, and paint using colors from the Farrow & Ball Historic Color palette.

Diana Mangaser appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Ms. Mangaser said the exact application was approved by the Board two years ago and because work did not begin, the approval lapsed. She said there are no proposed changes from that original approval. She said she filed for an extension with SHPO.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Kate Flanagan moved to approve the application as submitted.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-110

Applicant: Diana Mangaser
Owner: Grace Lodge and Ethan Harrison
Location: 9 Henry Avenue

Application to enclose east side front porch.

Diana Mangaser appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Carter referred to a Sanborn image and said the porch was not original to the house.

The Chairperson referred to the East End Historic District guidelines.

Ms. Flanagan requested a version of the design that maintained the column.

Mr. Hanson requested the submission of a 3D rendering to review how the enclosure interacts with the porch.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit the requested details.

AR 2023-111

Applicant: Deborah Brown
Owner: Deborah Brown and Saul Brown
Location: 165 Grand Street

Application to install new windows, install new doors, install new gutter, repair/replace siding, repair/reinstall trim, restore/repoint chimney, repair/repoint brick, repair/restore front entry stairs, restore dormer and trim, and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore and Colonial Williamsburg Historic Color palette.

Chris Hanson recused himself from vote.

Saul Brown and Deborah Brown (available via telephone speaker) appeared before the Board.

Ms. Brown gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Buonanno asked if there are door and window specifications.

Ms. Brown said they propose installing a salvaged door but haven't found one yet. She said the window product will be Weathershield.

Ms. Flanagan requested the submission of a specification sheet for the windows. She said for the door, a photo if it is a salvaged door and a specification sheet if not a salvaged door.

Mr. Carter requested submitting the dimensions of the door sidelights and more details on the windows and doors.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit the requested details.

AR 2023-112

Applicant: Yisroel Ostreicher
Owner: Yisroel Ostreicher
Location: 55 Lander Street

Application to install new windows, install new door and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

Yisroel Ostreicher appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Nato said the proposed fiberglass door is not in keeping with the East End Historic District guidelines. He said wood doors are historically accurate.

The Chairperson asked about the plan for the first floor window.

Mr. Ostreicher said two, double-hung windows, brick to brick.

Mr. Carson requested submission of the window measurements and details and a door specification. He said to submit for the basement windows as well.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Benjamin Franczoz spoke in favor of the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit the requested details.

AR 2023-113

Applicant: Benjamin Franczoz
Owner: 115 First Street LLC
Location: 117 First Street

Application to request ratification of work performed: installation of new windows.

Benjamin Franczoz appeared before the Board and gave an overview of work performed.

The Chairperson said the windows installed are not permitted in the East End Historic District as they are made with a synthetic material.

Ms. Flanagan asked about the front door.

Mr. Franczoz said he will put back the original door and paint it.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Carter said the rear windows are visible from the street view.

Chris Hanson moved to approve a portion of the application as submitted related to the door, and excepting details regarding the windows. approval is subject to the following conditions:

- The original door will be returned, the door frame will be restored to fit the original door, and that will be referenced with measurements of the original door and 2021 google images that show the original frame.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 10:38 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted:

J.K. Gentile, Secretary