

CITY OF NEWBURGH
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
123 Grand Street, Newburgh, New York 12550

Michele Basch, Chairperson
J.K. Gentile, Secretary
Phone: (845) 569-7383

MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting of February 13, 2024

The monthly meeting of the City of Newburgh Architectural Review Commission (“ARC”) was held on Tuesday, February 13, 2024, at 6:30 p.m. at the Activity Center, 401 Washington Street, Newburgh, New York 12550.

Members Present: Michele Basch, Chairperson
Carson Carter
Kate Flanagan
Gregory Nato

Absent: Michael Buonanno
Chris Hanson
James Kelly
Schnekwa McNeil

Also Present: Jeremy Kaufman, Assistant Corporation Counsel
J.K. Gentile, Secretary to the Land Use Boards

Meeting called to order at 6:40 p.m.

Minutes of the September 12, 2023 ARC meeting

Kate Flanagan moved to accept the minutes from the September 2023 ARC meeting.
Gregory Nato seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

Minutes of the October 10, 2023 ARC meeting

Kate Flanagan moved to accept the minutes from the October 2023 ARC meeting.
Gregory Nato seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

Minutes of the November 14, 2023 ARC meeting

The Chairperson moved to accept the minutes from the November 2023 ARC meeting.
Kate Flanagan seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

Minutes of the December 12, 2023 ARC meeting

Gregory Nato moved to accept the minutes from the December 2023 ARC meeting.

Carson Carter seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

CONSENT AGENDA

AR 2024-011

Applicant: Jose Francisco Hidalgo
Owner: Jose Francisco Hidalgo
Location: 181 Liberty Street

Application to remove paint from brick façade.

AR 2024-012

Applicant: William Cappeletti
Owner: William V. Cappeletti
Location: 159 Broadway

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

Mr. Carter requested to make matter of record the specification of the colors selected for AR 2024-012: HC190 and SW-0050.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the Consent Agenda as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

OLD BUSINESS

AR 2023-134

Applicant: Phoebe Sudrow
Owner: Phoebe Sudrow
Location: 95 Liberty Street WH

Returning for determination to request ratification of work performed: installation of a retaining wall.

Phoebe Sudrow appeared before the Board and gave an update on the materials requested by the Board at the December 2023 meeting. She asked the Board's consideration to maintain the look as it is currently. She said the addition of a blue stone cap will appear out of place with the current interlocking blocks.

Ms. Flanagan referred to the East End Historic District guidelines regarding hardscaping.

Mr. Nato said the proportions of the caps are smaller and mimic the size and cadence of the lower block. He said a definite cap would create a better proportion to the block wall and be more in keeping with historic accuracy.

The Chairperson said the sidewalk is bluestone, the front steps are bluestone treads, and the cap would bring the look together. She said a long bluestone piece for the cap would be historically appropriate.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the application as submitted, subject to the following conditions:

- The concrete cap shall be replaced with a 12” x 48” x 2” thick Pennsylvania blue stone cap.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-077

Applicant: Rochel Ellis-Smith
Owner: Amelia Realty LLC
Location: 8 Bay View Terrace

Returning for determination to install a new roof, install a new gutter system, install new siding, install a new porch, install new windows, install a new front door and paint.

The Applicant did not appear for the meeting.

The Board tabled the application to the March 2023 meeting.

AR 2023-132

Applicant: Floyd Johnson
Owner: Muhammad M R Chowdhury and Halima Chowdhury
Location: 44 Farrington Street

Returning for determination to repair/replace the front stairway, install new front door, and new windows.

Floyd Johnson and Ali Shalian appeared before the Board.

Mr. Johnson gave an update on the details and specifications requested by the Board at the December meeting.

Mr. Carson said the building originally had a double door with a transom.

Mr. Johnson said he could not locate a historic photo indicating the original door.

Ms. Flanagan said a double door keeps with the architectural accuracy of the building.

The Chairperson said double doors fit the time and the architecture of the building. She requested a specification for the street-visible basement door.

Mr. Johnson asked about the Board's review of the front steps.

Mr. Carter said the front steps are not historically accurate of the building. He recommended researching historic porch details such as spindles, newels, and handrails.

The Chairperson recommended taking cues from the neighboring building.

Mr. Carter said the windows would have been 2/2 window style.

Mr. Carter said the mansard roof has been removed without proper approval and would like the treatment of the third-floor design considered.

Ms. Flanagan asked the applicant to consider the Board's shared concerns that the exterior of the building has been permanently altered.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit an updated design plan set and details.

AR 2023-122

Applicant: Chris Berg/Berg + Moss Architects, PC
Owner: Mid Hudson Film LLC
Location: 50, 50 ½, 52, 54 Liberty Street

Returning for determination to construct a new mixed-use building.

New York State Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation (SHPO) comment letter made a matter of record.

Andrew Schrijver and Chris Berg appeared before the Board.

Mr. Berg gave a brief overview of the design updates per Board review in January, considering comments received from the ARC and SHPO. He said SHPO's concerns are the bulk and height of the building, balconies, windows, finishes, and brick work. He said the addressed ARC comments include: modifying the roof to be contained within the volume itself making it un-visible from many perspectives, migrating the stair tower to the courtyard side of the building to simplify the façade, and emphasis of the bay windows.

Mr. Schrijver said the SHPO comments are pushing to recreate the past and they prefer to move the design into something more distinctive.

Mr. Carter asked if any consideration was given to turn the balconies into livable space and add open space to the roof.

Mr. Schrijver said an open space roof would require a six feet high elevator bulkhead, the entire roof would require general and ADA accessibility and a six-story building would change the fire code and the overall building cost.

Mr. Berg said there is an indoor/outdoor amenity space proposed on the fifth floor of the Johnes Street side.

Ms. Flanagan said the SHPO comments match the ARC's initial feedback. She said the guidelines on infill do allow for design flexibility. She recommended more reference to uniformity and fenestration, an alternative approach to the façade, reconsideration of the balconies, and using references to Newburgh red brick for color. She said the proposal is significantly large enough that it will change the experience of navigating the neighborhood. She said massing what was requires a deliberate conversation on the details.

Mr. Nato said a strictly brick design feels like a mass of a building that does not offer detail besides undulation and pediment. He said the current design has modernity and separates from the historic while taking cues from the past. He said he is in favor of the materials. He said the shadow study was helpful in reviewing the massing of the building.

The Chairperson asked if brick is proposed for the retail space.

Mr. Berg confirmed and said under HCR standards, the use of brick shall be real brick and not thin brick.

Mr. Carter recommended simplifying the fenestration and adding setbacks at the top level of the northwest corner. He said he is in fine with the height of the building.

Ms. Flanagan said she is not in favor of the height, especially next to the neighboring buildings and Washington's Headquarters. She recommends referring to the SHPO comments. She said she is not in favor of the balconies.

Mr. Nato said he is in favor of the materials and the colors presented in January.

The Chairperson said she is in favor of the height and materials. She recommends a variation of color and varying the stories, adding setbacks. She said the shadow study was helpful in reviewing the buildings impact.

Ms. Flanagan agreed with varying the color.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson held the public hearing open.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit the updated design plan set and requested details.

AR 2023-061

Applicant: 85 Renwick Street LLC
Owner: Sisha Ortuzar/85 Renwick Street LLC
Location: 85 Renwick Street

Amendment to November 14, 2023 approved application: Removing cornice and balconies, alteration of storefront signage band, modifying brick siding, and sidewalk material alteration.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the amendment request.

Mr. Carter asked if the east side changed from being all brick to brick and white Hardie board.

Mr. Berg confirmed the change to brick wrapping around one bay window section and then changing to white Hardie board.

Mr. Carter said he is in favor of the material change, yet to go from brick to white Hardie board is too stark of a contrast.

Ms. Flanagan recommended adding a third color and finishing the roof line.

The Chairperson said the white on the east side appears unfinished.

Mr. Berg said they could implement a color change and possibly a brick accent at the roof.

The applicant requested a table of its application for further review.

NEW BUSINESS

AR 2024-005

Applicant: Chris Berg/Berg + Moss Architects, PC
Owner: Roberto B LLC
Location: 2 Bay View Terrace

Application to enclose a rear porch.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of proposed project.

Ms. Flanagan referred to the East End Historic District guidelines regarding enclosed porches.

Ms. Flanagan said the side does not appear proportionally correct given the windows do not extend from the building wall to the porch column with a wood panel in between.

Mr. Nato said the proportions of the glazing do not seem appropriate. He recommended widening the muntins.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit the updated design plans and requested details.

AR 2024-006

Applicant: Malcolm Stevenson
Owner: Mary Hammett
Location: 38 Edward Street

Application to install a fence, a brick column, and steps.

Malcolm Stevenson appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Nato asked if there would be a gate.

Mr. Stevenson confirmed there will be a gate on the right side and a hinge on the brick column.

The Chairperson asked how far apart the front porch steps will be from the proposed walkway steps.

Mr. Stevenson said it will be a few inches away from the lattice.

Ms. Flanagan requested additional details on the fence and is not in favor of the fence height.

Mr. Carter recommended two symmetrical gate piers.

The Chairperson requested a fence and gate specification.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit the requested details.

AR 2024-007

Applicant: Michael Mamiye
Owner: Nutopia 23 Dubois LLC
Location: 23 Dubois Street

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette and request ratification of work performed: replace front entry stairs.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the project.

Mr. Carter said there are no turned newels like those of the surrounding buildings, the flat handrail is not historically accurate, the lattice work should fit under the porch, and the porch stairs should match the sides of the handrail.

The Chairperson was in favor of the color.

Mr. Nato recommended matching the rail with what exists at the top of the porch.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit the requested details.

AR 2024-009

Applicant: Emily Dalrymple/Fast Signs
Owner: NBNY 91 William LLC
Location: 49 Lander Street

Application to install a sign.

Todd Fitzgerald appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Carter said the sign is supposed to be placed within the sign band.

The Chairperson agreed.

The Chairperson asked for the sign material.

Mr. Fitzgerald said the sign material is aluminum composite.

Ms. Flanagan referred to the East End Historic District guidelines regarding signs.

Mr. Carter showed an example from a similar City of Newburgh sign within a narrow sign band.

The Chairperson recommended using a color within the Historic Color palette for the base color.

Mr. Fitzgerald said what is recommended is a blue panel over the black sign band with white matte vinyl overtop.

The Chairperson agreed.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit the requested details.

AR 2024-010

Applicant: Mark Gallagher/Huff n Puff Inc.

Owner: Carol Anderson

Location: 56 Bay View Terrace

Application to install new windows.

Mark Gallagher appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Carter asked if the new windows are being placed into the original wood frames.

Mr. Gallagher confirmed.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing..

Gregory Nato moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 9:19 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted:

J.K. Gentile, Secretary