

CITY OF NEWBURGH
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
123 Grand Street, Newburgh, New York 12550

Michele Basch, Chairperson
J.K. Gentile, Secretary
Phone: (845) 569-7383

MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting of March 12, 2024

The monthly meeting of the City of Newburgh Architectural Review Commission (“ARC”) was held on Tuesday, March 12, 2024, at 6:30 p.m. at the Activity Center, 401 Washington Street, Newburgh, New York 12550.

Members Present: Michele Basch, Chairperson
Michael Buonanno
Carson Carter
Kate Flanagan
Chris Hanson
Schnekwa McNeil (arrived at 6:37 p.m. / departed at 10:10 p.m.)
Gregory Nato

Absent: James Kelly

Also Present: Jeremy Kaufman, Assistant Corporation Counsel
J.K. Gentile, Secretary to the Land Use Boards

Meeting called to order at 6:34 p.m.

CONSENT AGENDA

AR 2024-017

Applicant: Brian Lutter
Owner: BSR 86 Beacon LLC
Location: 86 Beacon Street

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

The Chairperson moved to approve the Consent Agenda as submitted.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

OLD BUSINESS

AR 2023-131

Applicant: Alvin Moonesar
Owner: VIP Partners LLC
Location: 89 William Street

Returning for determination to request ratification of work performed: installation of a new fence.

Alvin Moonesar appeared before the Board and gave an update on the materials requested by the Board at the December 2023 meeting.

Mr. Carter asked if the lattice under the porch is of vinyl material.

Mr. Moonesar said yes, the lattice material is vinyl.

Mr. Carter said a material of this type is not permitted in the East End Historic District under these circumstances. He said the rendering shows a space between the lattice and the ground and requested that the lattice material meet the ground.

Mr. Moonesar said he will change the lattice material to a wood material and will bring the lattice material to meet the ground.

Mr. Carter requested a sample of the brick veneer.

Mr. Nato, Mr. Buonanno and Mr. Hanson agreed with the brick veneer sample request.

Mr. Hanson reiterated to remove the space between the lattice and the ground and asked Mr. Moonesar to confirm that the sonic tubes will not be visible.

Mr. Moonesar agreed the sonic tubes will not be visible.

Mr. Carter asked if the paint color is changing.

Mr. Moonesar said no.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit the requested updates and details.

AR 2023-059

Applicant: Jessica Kuhn & Gary Quiggle
Owner: Jessica Kuhn & Gary Quiggle
Location: 116 First Street

Returning for determination to replace the front entry stairs.

Jessica Kuhn, Gary Quiggle and Chris Berg appeared before the Board.

Mr. Berg gave an update on the materials requested by the Board at the July 2023 meeting.

The Chairperson asked if the stone half step will remain.

Ms. Kuhn confirmed.

Mr. Hanson asked if the newel post will terminate at the last step as it currently exists.

Ms. Kuhn confirmed.

Chris Hanson moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-010

Applicant: **Tiffany Buxton**
Owner: **TiffanyMichelle Design, LLC**
Location: **117 Lander Street**

Amendment to March 14, 2023 approved application: substitute approved window shape.

AR 2023-011

Applicant: **Tiffany Buxton**
Owner: **David Herring, III**
Location: **119 Lander Street**

Amendment to March 14, 2023 approved application: substitute approved window shape and request exemption to replace the non-functioning chimney.

Tiffany Buxton, Todd Buxton and David Herring appeared before the Board for applications AR 2023-010 and AR 2023-0011.

Ms. Buxton gave an overview of the proposed amendment.

The Chairperson asked about the window shape from the inside of the window.

Ms. Buxton said square shaped with a filler wood piece creating the arch.

Ms. Flanagan asked if the original, historic window shape was arched or square.

Ms. Buxton said when they purchased the property the windows were square with an arch filler.

She said she proposes to maintain the arch look using an arch filler.

Mr. Carter confirmed that historically the windows would have been arched shaped.

Mr. Hanson said adhering to the historic shape maintains the integrity and consistency of the neighboring properties.

Ms. Buxton disagreed and said that there are several properties with square-shaped windows within the neighboring properties. She said the RUPCO properties in the area introduced a modern appearance to the street.

Mr. Nato said to maintain historic preservation in the East End Historic District, window replacement shall be replaced with a historical accurate window.

The Chairperson referred to the East End Historic District guidelines regarding windows.

Mr. Hanson recommended the applicant contact the State Historic Preservation Office for assistance.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit additional details.

Tiffany Buxton, Todd Buxton and David Herring appeared before the Board for application AR 2023-0011.

Ms. Buxton said for the original application in 2023 the chimney was to remain, be reconstructed, restored and repointed. She said recently the chimney was in a stage of collapse. She said the contractor removed the chimney in response to a 911 call/Fire Department response.

Mr. Buxton said when they purchased the building, the mantels and the chimney flue were missing from the second floor down. He said the chimney supports had been removed rendering the chimney unsafe.

Mr. Hanson asked to confirm the roof structure would be supporting the weight of the brick.

Mr. Buxton confirmed.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit additional details.

AR 2023-088

Applicant: Philip Toscano, Architect
Owner: Headache LLC
Location: 99 Montgomery Street

Amendment to September 12, 2023 proposal: repair eaves and rebuild chimney extension.

Dana Trezza and Madeline Trezza appeared before the Board.

Mr. Trezza gave an overview of the proposed amendment.

The Chairperson asked about the current depth of the Yankee gutter.

Mr. Trezza said four inches. He said they propose to add another four inches to the depth.

Mr. Carter said historically a Yankee gutter would have been that deep.

Mr. Hanson asked about the total number of leaders.

Mr. Trezza said one leader on each corner of the main house, one per side.

The Chairperson said the proposed amendment is not disturbing the appearance of the building and is important for long term preservation.

Mr. Carter asked how far the copper drip edge extends down.

Mr. Trezza said less than an inch.

The Chairperson asked about the proposed changes to the chimneys.

Mr. Trezza said the proposed changes requested are to dismantle and rebuild the chimneys located on the two extensions that were affected by a fire. He said there is deterioration of the mortar joints, the chimneys are leaning, and it is unsafe.

Mr. Hanson asked if the existing caps will be preserved.

Mr. Trezza said they will attempt to preserve. He said the caps are brownstone and are currently cracked.

Ms. Trezza asked if the proposed chimney height appears correct on the south elevation.

Mr. Nato said the chimney height would need to be higher than the cupola.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the amended application as submitted.

Carson Carter seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-132

Applicant: Floyd Johnson
Owner: Muhammad M R Chowdhury and Halima Chowdhury
Location: 44 Farrington Street

Returning for determination to repair/replace the front stairway, install new front door, and new windows.

Floyd Johnson and Ali Shalian appeared before the Board.

Mr. Johnson gave an update on the details and specifications requested by the Board at the February meeting.

The Chairperson asked how they propose to address the changes made to the newly constructed third floor of the property. She said the top line of the building has been altered significantly.

Mr. Johnson said a building permit was submitted to rebuild a new roof area.

Mr. Hanson said the building is no longer a Second Empire Victorian as the soffit to the mansard slate roof, angled with two dormer windows, has now been removed. He said it does not meet the classification of a Second Empire Victorian anymore.

Mr. Johnson said they were given permission to rebuild the roof after the fire. He said they are attempting to rebuild the roof to what it was.

Ms. Flanagan asked the applicant to consider that the work was performed without ARC review. She asked the reason the third floor was not rebuilt to what it was before the fire.

Mr. Johnson said it would have been unreasonable. He said it would have been helpful if the project was stopped before they were finished because they were never told to apply to the ARC.

Mr. Carter said the building permit submitted with the ARC package does not include exterior work.

Mr. Buonanno asked if drawings were submitted to the Building Department or was the permit only to rebuild the roof to stabilize the building.

Mr. Johnson said the permit was to rebuild the roof.

Mr. Hanson said what appears from review of the submitted building permit is an alteration made to the building that was not permitted.

Mr. Nato said what is currently there is not historically accurate. He recommended seeking assistance in recovering the original details. He requested architectural drawings. He requested the drawings that were submitted to the Building Department.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel asked if the drawings that were submitted to the Building Department were submitted to the ARC in support of the applicant's position.

Mr. Johnson said no.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel asked the Board if they would like copies of the building permit application submitted for review.

The consensus of the Board was a submission of the building permit application made after the fire.

The Chairperson referred to the East End Historic District guidelines regarding roofs.

The applicant requested a table of its application.

AR 2024-006

Applicant: **Malcolm Stevenson**
Owner: **Mary Hammett**
Location: **38 Edward Street**

Returning for determination to install a fence, a brick column and steps.

Mr. Stevenson appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the details requested by the Board at the February 2024 meeting.

Ms. Flanagan asked when the variance for the fence height was approved.

Mr. Stevenson said in 2019.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel asked the applicant if he received a building permit and whether any work was performed in connection with that approval.

Mr. Stevenson confirmed both.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said that the approval would have vested.

Carson Carter moved to approve the application as submitted.

Gregory Nato seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-122

Applicant: Chris Berg/Berg + Moss Architects, PC
Owner: Mid Hudson Film LLC
Location: 50, 50 ½, 52, 54 Liberty Street

Returning for a determination to construct a new mixed-use building.

Andrew Schrijver and Chris Berg appeared before the Board.

Mr. Berg gave an overview of the design updates per Board request at the February 2023 meeting.

Mr. Buonanno asked if all the balconies had been removed.

Mr. Schrijver confirmed. He said the design plan set needs to be updated to reflect that detail.

Mr. Carter said the design reflects a significant improvement. He asked about the Hardie Board color variation on the Liberty Street side.

Mr. Hanson said he likes that design detail and the northwest corner roof treatment.

Mr. Carter said there is a note that the final design roof drainage is to be determined and asked for further information.

Mr. Berg said they propose a six-inch rectangular gutter two thirds of the way down, through the storefront façade and into the sidewalk bioswales.

Mr. Schrijver said on the courtyard side water will be captured into a retention tank underneath the parking lot.

Mr. Carter requested additional details on the gutter system.

Mr. Carter asked about the green banding on the soffit.

Mr. Berg said that detail incorporates a little bit of color into the design.

Mr. Carter asked if they would increase the size of the upper terrace doorway.

Mr. Schrijver said they would consider it.

Ms. Flanagan asked to confirm that all the windows proposed will be in 2/2 window style.

Mr. Schrijver confirmed.

Ms. Flanagan requested a material and color sample of the siding located at the top of the building.

She said she appreciates the massing on the northeast corner of the building. She recommended adding banding to the roofline to ease the transition between the two parts of the building.

Mr. Schrijver said the parapet will have a cap and that he could extend the line of the gutter.

The Chairperson said she likes the direction of the design and is in favor of the window style.

Mr. Buonanno recommended maintaining the window color on the Johnes Street storefront corner and addressing the garage window details to add consistency with the first floor windows.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Marjorie DeJesus spoke in favor of the application.

Mercedes Toribio spoke in favor of the application.

Lisa Silverstone spoke in favor of the application.

The Chairperson held the public hearing open.

Ms. Flanagan recommended adding detail to the storefront doors.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit the updated design plan set and requested details.

AR 2023-061

Applicant:	85 Renwick Street LLC
Owner:	Sisha Ortuzar/85 Renwick Street LLC
Location:	85 Renwick Street

Amendment to November 14, 2023 approved application:

Removing cornice and balconies, alteration of storefront signage band, modifying brick siding, and sidewalk material alteration.

Sisha Ortuzar and Chris Berg appeared before the Board.

Mr. Berg gave an overview of details requested by the Board at the February meeting. He said they propose brushed concrete for the sidewalk surface. He said they propose to maintain the blue stone curbing on the Renwick Street side. He said the concrete curb on Liberty Street is in good condition up to the curb cut at top of the hill. He said they propose concrete for that area to be consistent with the rest of the curbing.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said a comment letter from the City Engineer's office is pending for the Board's review.

Kate Flanagan moved to approve the amended application as submitted, excepting details regarding the sidewalk material alteration.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2024-005

Applicant: Chris Berg/Berg + Moss Architects, PC

Owner: Roberto B LLC

Location: 2 Bay View Terrace

Application to enclose a rear porch.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an update on the details requested by the Board at the February meeting.

Carson Carter moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

NEW BUSINESS

AR 2024-004

Applicant: Lisa Silverstone/Safe Harbors of the Hudson, Inc.

Owner: Safe William Street Partners LLC

Location: 69 William Street

Application to construct a new, mixed-use building.

Lisa Silverstone, Bryan Tooze, and Joseph Frewer appeared before the Board.

Mr. Tooze gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said the existing site is one singular parcel. He said at the last presentation there was discussion about demolition of the existing buildings on the site and replacement with one contiguous building. He said the applicant appears to have revised the application to subdivide the existing parcel into three separate parcels and build a series of structures that have one harmonious theme, but they will be three separate and distinct buildings on three separate parcels.

Mr. Tooze agreed and said each building is now separated with separate utilities.

Mr. Carter spoke in favor of the direction. He asked if they would consider carrying the red brick colors into the storefront floor of the infill construction.

Mr. Hanson asked if the thick framing of the storefront window treatments on the resurrected building could match the glass on the infill construction.

Mr. Carter asked if they would consider a similar treatment of framing underneath the window instead of masonry on the resurrected buildings for the infill construction.

Ms. Flanagan said she is in favor of the design and there is enough differentiation between each of the buildings as its own entity.

Mr. Nato said he is in favor of the direction and the treatment of the storefront setback.

Mr. Buonanno asked about the energy efficient window material.

Mr. Tooze said the window shall be aluminum clad double hung wood windows. He said they are proposing a PVC energy efficient infill.

Mr. Tooze said they are pursuing Historic tax credits.

Mr. Hanson said he is in favor of the building height.

The Chairperson said she is in favor of the design, treatment, the differentiation of the new and the old, and the use of solar panels.

Ms. Flanagan asked if they brought the red brick through the storefront on the infill building, would they also consider adding the band element that the resurrected buildings have.

Mr. Hanson said he appreciated how quickly the team turned around changing the design to restore and preserve the existing buildings.

Ms. McNeil spoke in favor of the direction.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said a vote could not be rendered as SEQRA determination is pending, but the Board should give any additional feedback so the applicant can incorporate it into an update plan set.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Marjorie DeJesus spoke in favor of the application.
Mercedes Toribio spoke in favor of the application.
Sisha Ortuzar spoke in favor of the application.

The Chairperson held the public hearing open.

The applicant requested a table of its application.

AR 2024-013

Applicant: Mercedes Toribio
Owner: Mercedes Toribio
Location: 65 Campbell Street

Application to install new soffits and fascia.

Mercedes Toribio and Ted Miroe appeared before the Board.

Ms. Toribio gave an overview of the project.

Mr. Carter said vinyl, synthetic material for the soffit, is not permitted in the East End Historic District under these circumstances. He recommended a material that is flat, with no texture.

Mr. Nato asked if they propose to remove the brackets.

Mr. Miroe said they are not removing the brackets.

Mr. Nato recommended addressing the drip guard to avoid further water damage.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit the requested details.

AR 2024-008

Applicant: Marjorie DeJesus
Owner: Marjorie DeJesus-Geter
Location: 67 Beacon Street

Application to install a new fence.

Marjorie DeJesus appeared before the Board.

Ms. DeJesus gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Carson Carter moved to approve the application as submitted.
Chris Hanson seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2024-014

Applicant: Christopher Manzione
Owner: Christopher Manzione
Location: 412 Liberty Street

Application to replace front entry stairs.

The Applicant did not appear for the meeting.

The Board tabled the application to the March 2024 meeting.

AR 2024-015

Applicant: Chris Berg, R.A., /Berg + Moss Architects, PC
Owner: P.S. 6 Liberty St., LLC
Location: 1 Liberty Street

Application to rebuild existing retaining wall and regrade site and opening of front cellar window wells.

Chris Berg and Thomas Dodd appeared before the Board.

Mr. Berg gave an overview of the proposed project to correct the existing damage.

Mr. Dodd said water penetration throughout the basement was the cause of the damage and likely the reason why they infilled the window wells and blacktopped against the windows. He said they replaced the lintels and exposed the windows, restoring it back to its original historic design.

Mr. Hanson asked if the stone lining was removed.

Mr. Dodd said the stone lining was removed.

Mr. Nato asked about the material of the retaining wall.

Mr. Dodd said a blue stone veneer, a mix between poured concrete and blue stone.

The Chairperson recommended a blue stone cap on the retaining wall.

Mr. Nato asked the height of the wall at the highest.

Mr. Dodd said four feet and tapers down.

Mr. Carter said there are blue stone caps that sit on the north end.

Mr. Dodd said they will maintain those as well as recycle the bluestone sidewalk pieces.

The Chairperson asked how they propose to incorporate the existing pieces with new material.

Mr. Dodd said they would maintain the original stonework by the stairs and then mix as the wall tapers off to the side.

The Chairperson asked if they would consider rebuilding with new stone only.

Mr. Dodd said probably not, as the expense is too great.

Mr. Hanson requested additional details on the stone wall and how the two materials meet.

Mr. Buonanno recommended compiling an inventory of original material.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson held the public hearing open.

Ms. Flanagan reiterated the request for additional details on the retaining wall, architectural drawings of the retaining wall, and specifications sheets for the materials. -

The applicant requested a table of its application to submit the requested details.

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 10:20 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted:

J.K. Gentile, Secretary