

CITY OF NEWBURGH
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
123 Grand Street, Newburgh, New York 12550

Michele Basch, Chairperson
J.K. Gentile, Secretary
Phone: (845) 569-7383

MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting of April 9, 2024

The monthly meeting of the City of Newburgh Architectural Review Commission (“ARC”) was held on Tuesday, April 9, 2024, at 6:30 p.m. at the Activity Center, 401 Washington Street, Newburgh, New York 12550.

Members Present: Michele Basch, Chairperson
Michael Buonanno
Carson Carter
Kate Flanagan
Chris Hanson
Gregory Nato

Absent: James Kelly
Schnekwa McNeil

Also Present: Jeremy Kaufman, Assistant Corporation Counsel
J.K. Gentile, Secretary to the Land Use Boards

Meeting called to order at 6:32 p.m.

CONSENT AGENDA

AR 2024-027

Applicant: Kai Wright and Jedd Flanscha
Owner: Kai Wright and Jedd Flanscha
Location: 39 Bay View Terrace

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

AR 2024-028

Applicant: Kerry Symon
Owner: Kerry Anne Symon
Location: 42 Liberty Street WH

Application to paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

The Chairperson clarified that for application #AR2024-028, the front double doors shall be painted in SW-2813, Downing Straw and the house cornice and porch cornice shall be painted HC-190, Black.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the Consent Agenda as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

OLD BUSINESS

AR 2023-131

Applicant: Alvin Moonesar
Owner: VIP Partners LLC
Location: 89 William Street

Returning for determination to request ratification of work performed: installation of a new fence.

Alvin Moonesar appeared before the Board and presented the requested sample of the brick veneer.

Mr. Moonesar said he proposed to use a combination of new veneer brick and recycled, cut brick. He said the cut brick will be used to fit into small spaces.

Mr. Carter said the textures of the new veneer brick and the recycled cut brick are visually different. He said the recycled, cut brick is historically accurate to the building.

Carson Carter moved to approve the application as submitted, subject to the following conditions:

- Cut, recycled brick shall be used for the entire veneer wall.
- Wood lattice shall be added to the plan set and installed underneath the porch.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-132

Applicant: Floyd Johnson
Owner: Muhammad M R Chowdhury and Halima Chowdhury
Location: 44 Farrington Street

Returning for determination to repair/replace the front stairway, install new front door and new windows.

Floyd Johnson appeared before the Board and said the owner requested more time to gather materials.

The applicant requested a table of the application.

AR 2023-077

Applicant: Rochel Ellis-Smith
Owner: Amelia Realty LLC
Location: 8 Bay View Terrace

Returning for determination to install a new roof, install a new gutter system, install new siding, install a new porch, install new windows, install a new front door and paint.

Rochel Ellis-Smith appeared before the Board. She proposed to rebuild the roof to its original design with no deviations as illustrated on the submitted elevations. She proposed using GAF Slateline in English Grey for the roof shingle material.

Mr. Carter asked if an updated plan set had been submitted.

Ms. Ellis-Smith asked that the Board should review the plan set submitted in February 2024.

Ms. Ellis-Smith referred to her specification submissions for the gutter system (Yankee gutter), windows (Anderson aluminum clad wood), siding (Hardie Board), door (Doorwin Wooden single front door with glass), porch restoration, and paint swatches (from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette).

Mr. Hanson asked about the window material.

Ms. Ellis-Smith said aluminum clad wood.

Mr. Hanson asked about the material of the fish scale siding.

Ms. Ellis-Smith said cement board.

Mr. Carter requested the submission of a plan set that includes measurements of all the elements being restored and the dimensions on the soffits, gutters, and slate roof, the location of the Azek casings, and the window measurements and profiles.

Mr. Nato recommended the applicant replicate the original details. He requested the second-floor porch door detail.

Ms. Ellis-Smith proposed an aluminum door that resembles the front entry door.

Mr. Buonanno asked to clarify details about the second-floor porch door and requested dimensional clarity for the porches.

Ms. Flanagan recommended the fish scale siding be a smooth texture.

The Chairperson asked about the porch design detail.

Ms. Ellis-Smith said her porch design was in response to the Board's recommendations regarding the 1800's era historic detail.

The Chairperson asked the applicant if she would consider a wood door for the second-floor porch instead of an aluminum door.

Mr. Carter asked the applicant if she still proposes to alter the rear roof pitch.

Ms. Ellis-Smith said she proposes to match the rear roof pitch to the front roof pitch.

Mr. Carter requested an updated comprehensive plan set with full measurements and exact specifications of all three sides of the house including: casings, Yankee gutter, fascia detail, all three doors visible from the street, windows, roof shingles.

Mr. Flanagan requested final specification sheets for all exterior materials with no options.

The applicant requested a table of the application.

AR 2024-013

Applicant: Mercedes Toribio
Owner: Mercedes Toribio
Location: 65 Campbell Street

Returning for determination to install new soffits and fascia.

Mercedes Toribio and Ted Miroe appeared before the Board.

Ms. Toribio gave an overview of the requested material specifications.

Chris Hanson moved to approve the application as submitted.
Carson Carter seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-122

Applicant: Chris Berg/Berg + Moss Architects, PC
Owner: Mid Hudson Film LLC
Location: 50, 50 ½, 52, 54 Liberty Street

Returning for determination to construct a new mixed-use building.

New York State Parks, Recreation and Historic Preservation letter dated April 2, 2024 was made a matter of record.

Andrew Schrijver and Chris Berg appeared before the Board.

Mr. Berg gave an overview of the revisions and presented material samples as requested by the Board at the March meeting.

The Chairperson asked about the durability of the material colors.

Mr. Berg said there are several factors that can age the color of the materials.

Mr. Hanson asked about the changes made to the storefront treatment.

Mr. Berg said they altered the second-floor storefront windows to match the first-floor treatment.

Mr. Carter asked to confirm the proposal to retain the first-floor green banding under the soffit.

Mr. Berg confirmed and said that detail brings unobtrusive color to the design.

Ms. Flanagan said the Lafayette Street entrance lost its distinctive look in this updated design plan and is not in favor of the signage.

The Chairperson said she prefers the storefront design from the February submission.

The Board discussed their preference of the storefront design.

Mr. Carter asked if they plan to propose solar panels.

Mr. Schrijver said they will propose solar panels on the Liberty Street side and possibly the Johnes Street side.

Mr. Hanson asked if they propose to position the solar panels in plain with the roof.

Mr. Schrijver confirmed, and they propose the addition of a panel skin to reduce panel glare.

The Chairperson requested an updated design plan set when the decision to use solar panels is finalized.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said a vote could not be rendered as SEQRA determination is pending pursuant to a coordinated review with the City's Planning Board.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson held the public hearing open.

Mr. Berg asked if the Anderson 100 series in vinyl material could be considered for the application.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel referred Mr. Berg to the East End Historic District guidelines for reference.

The application was tabled until next meeting.

AR 2023-061

Applicant: 85 Renwick Street LLC
Owner: Sisha Ortuzar/85 Renwick Street LLC
Location: 85 Renwick Street

Amendment to November 14, 2023 approved application:
Returning for determination on sidewalk material alteration.

A comment letter from the City Engineer's office was made matter of record.

Sisha Ortuzar and Chris Berg appeared before the Board.

Mr. Berg said they maintain their proposal for brushed concrete as the sidewalk surface, maintain the blue stone curbing on the Renwick Street side, and concrete infill to the curb cut at the top of the hill on the Liberty Street side.

Gregory Nato moved to balance of the amended application as submitted, subject to the following conditions:

- The sidewalk material shall be brushed concrete on Renwick Street and Liberty Street.
- The curbing material shall be concrete infill to the curb cut on the Liberty Street side.

Carson Carter seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

NEW BUSINESS

AR 2024-014

Applicant: Christopher Manzione
Owner: Christopher Manzione
Location: 412 Liberty Street

Application to replace front entry stairs.

Chris Manzione appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Carter asked if the masonry steps had already been removed.

Mr. Manzione confirmed.

Mr. Carter asked if he proposed to install wood rails instead of masonry.

Mr. Manzione confirmed.

Mr. Carter said masonry would be in keeping with what was original to the house.

Mr. Manzione said the porch is not original to the house. He said the brick used on the porch was different from the original brick used on the house.

Mr. Nato asked the year of the house.

Mr. Manzione said the year of the house is unclear. He said he assumes 1920.

Mr. Buonanno asked what is proposed for the spindle.

Mr. Manzione said 3 x 3 spindles with matching posts.

Mr. Nato requested details on how the rails meet the newel post.

Mr. Hanson requested dimensions for the rails.

Mr. Buonanno asked to verify that the dimensions meet code requirement, specification of the spindles and the paint color.

Mr. Hanson requested railing details, the distance between the spindles and to demonstrate how the newel posts terminate.

Ms. Flanagan asked if the number of stairs is changing from four shallow stairs to six.

Mr. Manzione confirmed. He said he will be capping the stairs with bluestone.

The Chairperson requested a precise drawing with details, dimensions, and specifications.

Mr. Carter asked if the sides will be bluestone.

Mr. Manzione said the sides will be concrete.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The applicant requested a table of the application.

AR 2024-018

Applicant: **Floyd Johnson**
Owner: **Maria Rios**
Location: **196 Broadway**

Application to restore/renovate the storefront and second floor residential façade.

Maria Rios and Floyd Johnson appeared before the Board.

Mr. Johnson gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson asked to confirm that the second-floor brick façade will be painted yellow as shown on the rendering.

Mr. Johnson said the second-floor façade will be painted Sherwin Williams Pearl Gray.

The Chairperson asked how they propose to remove the existing paint on the brick.

Mr. Johnson said they propose power wash.

The Chairperson referred to the East End Historic District guidelines regarding the proper removal of paint on masonry.

The Chairperson asked if they propose to remove the faux brick on the sides of the storefront.

Mr. Johnson said the faux brick will remain.

The Chairperson asked what type of door will replace the side residence entrance door.

Mr. Rios said they will maintain the metal door that exists.

Mr. Carter asked if they propose to restore the transom.

Mr. Johnson said he had not decided on that detail.

Mr. Carter asked what is underneath the rolling security gate.

Mr. Johnson was not certain.

Mr. Carter requested photos of what is currently underneath the rolling security gate.

The Chairperson requested an updated drawing with window and door opening dimensions.

Mr. Carter said the window specification submitted is a vinyl window material and requested researching an appropriate material.

Ms. Flanagan said the proposed sign does not fit with the proportions of the building.

Mr. Carter recommended taking a cue from the neighboring buildings sign band.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Mr. Carter said if it is proposed to use window dividers, the window muntins must be a wood or metal material and not a snap-in grill.

The applicant requested a table of its application.

AR 2024-019

Applicant: Kyle LaPaitra
Owner: Estate of Robert B. Blake/
William and Clementine Hollopeter, Executors
Location: 121 Chambers Street

Application to repair/restore the front porch.

Kyle LaPaitra appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the project.

Mr. Hanson asked if the metal porch railing will be reused.

Mr. Lapaitra said he proposed to replace the porch railing with the exact metal railing.

Mr. Hanson said if there is a need to replace the porch railing, a wood material would be historically appropriate.

Mr. Lapaitra said the adjoining house has metal porch railings and spindles. He said he will repair and not replace the metal porch railings and spindles.

Mr. Carter said the plans reflect maintaining the existing wood running trim. He asked about the plans for the damaged running trim parts.

Mr. Lapaitra said he has all the existing pieces and proposes repair to the damaged running trim parts.

Mr. Carter asked if the gutter that runs behind the lally column and into the porch will remain in the same position.

Mr. Lapaitra said he proposes to move the gutter to the far left of the porch.

Mr. Carter said the plans call for a new reinforced concrete first step. He recommended maintaining that original blue stone first step as well as the bluestone on the sidewalk.

Mr. Lapaitra said the first bluestone step and the bluestone sidewalk will not change.

Mr. Carter asked if the existing columns would remain.

Mr. Lapaitra said he will not change the columns.

The Chairperson asked what will be placed in front of the basement.

Mr. Lapaitra said wood lattice.

The Chairperson asked if the lattice will be painted black.

Mr. Lapaitra said the lattice will be painted white and the trim will be painted black.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Carson Carter moved to approve the submitted application subject to the following conditions:

- All existing porch components shall be documented prior to work performed.
- All existing porch components shall be restored, including the spool spindles, porch columns, and railing.
- The gutter system shall be re-located to the south side of the porch.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2024-020

Applicant: Eudora Johnson
Owner: Eudora Johnson
Location: 110 Benkard Avenue

Application to install a new fence.

Eudora Johnson and Tyrone Finney appeared before the Board.

Mr. Finney gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Chris Hanson moved to approve the application as submitted subject to the following conditions:

- The fence gate shall be 5 feet high, wood material and on plain with the front of the house on the driveway side.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2024-021

Applicant: Shawndra Rose
Owner: Shawndra Rose
Location: 152 Washington Street

The Applicant did not appear for the meeting.

The Board tabled the application to the May 2024 meeting.

AR 2024-022

Applicant: Sean Kearney/Kearney Realty & Development Group
Owner: City of Newburgh
Location: 137 Smith Street, 140 Montgomery Street, and 146 Montgomery Street

Application to construct two new, mixed-use buildings.

A.J. Coppola appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Hanson requested a rendering from the Water Street side and South Street side looking up Montgomery Street. He asked about the space between the buildings.

Mr. Coppola said the courtyard is not large and is made up of hard surface material. He said the civil engineer is proposing a walkway system to access the buildings down South Street.

Mr. Hanson requested more details regarding the courtyard.

Mr. Carter recommended less vertical banding between the windows. He requested adding distinction to the South Street corner designated as the restaurant space. He recommended alternating the design between the units on the Smith Street elevation to simplify the massing.

Mr. Nato said he prefers the style of Smith Street to the Montgomery Street style. He said the Smith Street style compliments the architecture of the neighboring properties.

Ms. Flanagan said she appreciates the scale of Montgomery Street. She recommended simplification of style.

Mr. Carter asked if they propose amenity space on the roof.

Mr. Coppola said no. He said there will be two bulkheads.

The Chairperson asked if they propose solar panels.

Mr. Coppola said yes.

The Chairperson asked about a 1/1 window style.

Mr. Carter said a single divided window style would also be an interesting consideration.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson held the public hearing open.

The applicant requested a table of its application.

AR 2024-023

Applicant: Chris Berg/Berg + Moss Architects, PC
Owner: Shaw Building, L.P.
Location: 24 Johnes Street

Application to construct a new apartment building and renovation of an existing 2-story building.

Chris Berg and Hilary Levitt appeared before the Board.

Ms. Levitt gave an overview of the proposed project for Edward Street construction.

Mr. Berg gave an overview of the proposed design for Edward Street construction.

Mr. Carter requested a revised treatment of the door and window units on the Edward Street side.

Mr. Carter requested wrapping more brick around the corners.

Ms. Flanagan the window setbacks match the neighboring buildings.

Mr. Buonanno said he is in favor of the massing and esthetics.

The Chairperson said she is in favor of the massing.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson held the public hearing open.

Ms. Flanagan requested additional detail to the roofline.

Mr. Hanson agreed.

The applicant requested a table of its application.

AR 2024-024

Applicant: Andrew Schrijver
Owner: 189 Lander LLC
Location: 189 Lander Street

Application to install a new roof, install new windows, install new doors, install new lighting, restore/repoint masonry and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

Andrew Schrijver and Chris Berg appeared before the Board.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Carson Carter moved to approve the application as submitted.

Chris Hanson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2024-025

Applicant: Alvin Moonesar
Owner: 31 Benkard Avenue LLC
Location: 31 Benkard Avenue

Application to install new doors, install new front entry stairs and railings, install new façade woodwork, restore/repair/replace windows, restore/repair storefront window frames, restore/repair/replace windowsills, restore/repair cornice, repair/replace roof structure, repair/repoint chimney, restore/repair façade shingle siding, repair/repoint masonry, repair rear deck and paint using colors from the Benjamin Moore Historic Color palette.

Martin Estrella and Alvin Moonesar appeared before the Board.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said the applicant was before the ARC for a renewal application. He said an application was approved years ago and the approval expired.

Mr. Moonesar gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Carter asked if the front entry door is inset.

Mr. Moonesar confirmed.

Mr. Hanson asked if the storefront iron columns still exist.

Mr. Moonesar said that is unknown.

Mr. Moonesar said the main residential staircase will be replaced with a brick base, 2" bluestone cap and iron railing.

Mr. Carter asked if the first-floor side window opening will remain its original size.

Mr. Moonesar confirmed.

Mr. Carter recommended wrapping the signage band around the side with a flashing detail to prevent water damage to the window.

Mr. Hanson asked why the main residential staircase landing is so large.

Mr. Moonesar said to match the neighboring property.

Mr. Carter said the proposed storefront door is not historically accurate and recommended adding a glass paneled door.

Mr. Moonesar said the first floor is being converted into an apartment and a glass door would not be appropriate for security and privacy concerns.

Mr. Nato asked if the storefront windows would remain.

Mr. Moonesar said yes.

Ms. Flanagan would like confirmation that the approval to convert from a two-family to three-family back in 2018 was vested.

Mr. Moonesar said construction had stopped in 2018 yet they were able to secure a framing, plumbing, and rough electric inspection in 2019. He said they recently submitted an Informational report, and the Building Inspector ruled the ARC as the land use board necessary to bring the property into compliance.

Ms. Flanagan said a storefront treatment would not be a historically appropriate interpretation for a ground floor apartment.

Mr. Carter requested a photo of the main residential salvaged door with measurements.

Mr. Carter said the main residential stairway assembly is not in keeping with the building. He recommended removing the deck and adding additional steps leading up to the door with a small rail.

Mr. Estrella agreed with that recommendation.

Mr. Carter recommended removing the green window bay shingles, taking a cue from the window bays at 27 Benkard Avenue.

Mr. Carter asked about the rear decks. He said the architectural drawing does not show how the rear decks are being supported and requested additional detail.

Mr. Carter asked if they proposed plans to restore the fence.

Mr. Moonesar said not on this application.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson requested submission of additional details for the main residential door, front to the side cornice and drip cap, investigate what is under the green shingles on the bay windows, the main residential stairway, proposed plan on masonry cleaning, and how the rear decks will be stabilized.

Mr. Carter asked if there was a lighting plan.

Mr. Moonesar said there was no exterior lighting proposed.

The applicant requested a table of its application.

AR 2024-026

Applicant: Yasimin Kunz
Owner: Yasimin Kunz Hickey
Location: 196 Grand Street

Application to install a fence.

Yasimin Kunz and Michael Campbell appeared before the Board.

Ms. Kunz gave an overview of the proposed project. She said the fence is proposed for the north and east side of the property and that no fence is proposed for the front of the property.

Mr. Carter asked if the fence will be dog eared or flat top.

Ms. Kunz said flat top.

Mr. Hanson asked if they propose to install a gate.

Ms. Kunz said they do not propose a gate.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the application as submitted subject to the following conditions:

- The fence shall be six feet in height, made of wood, and flat on top.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 10:40 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted:

J.K. Gentile, Secretary