

MINUTES
ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW COMMISSION
Meeting of December 10, 2024

The monthly meeting of the City of Newburgh Architectural Review Commission (“ARC”) was held on Tuesday, December 10, 2024, at 6:30 p.m. at the Heritage Center, 123 Grand Street, Newburgh, New York 12550.

Members Present: Michele Basch, Chairperson
Gregory Nato
Carson Carter
Kate Flanagan

Absent: Michael Buonanno
Chris Hanson
Schnekwa McNeil

Also Present: Jeremy Kaufman, Assistant Corporation Counsel
J.K. Gentile, Secretary to the Land Use Boards

Meeting called to order at 6:36 p.m.

OLD BUSINESS

AR 2024-074

Applicant: Philippe Pierre
Owner: 104 Washington St, LLC
Location: 104 Washington Street

Returning for determination to construct a new, mixed-use building.

Peter Wintermantel appeared before the Board. He said the applicant received a negative declaration pursuant to a SEQRA coordinated review at the Planning Board’s November 19, 2024 meeting and that there have been no changes since the last presentation to the ARC Board.

Kate Flanagan moved to approve the application as submitted.
Carson Carter seconded the motion.
The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-089

Applicant: Stephen DeGroat
Owner: Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh Inc.
Location: 125 Washington Street

Returning for determination on the western door.

Stephen DeGroat appeared before the Board. He said Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh was before the ARC Board in September of 2023 to install four front façade entry doors. He said three of the double doors were approved and the western door was tabled as a sidelight was proposed. He said the new proposal is a double door to match the other front entry doors.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the application as submitted.

Kate Flanagan seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2024-088

Applicant: Nils Fredrikson/Crozier Gedney Architects PC
Owner: Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh Inc.
Location: 225 Third Street

Returning for determination to install a new front door.

Nils Fredrickson appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the details requested by the Board at the November meeting.

Carson Carter moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-132

Applicant: Chris Berg/Berg + Moss Architects, PC
Owner: Muhammad M R Chowdhury and Halima Chowdhury
Location: 44 Farrington Street

Returning for determination to repair/replace the front stairway, install new front door and new windows.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the details requested by the Board at the November meeting. He said they propose to use simulated slate shingles, yet when an estimate is available, and if comparable to simulated, genuine slate shingles will be considered.

Mr. Carter asked to confirm that the flashing detail has not changed.

Mr. Berg confirmed.

Mr. Berg said the dormer windows had been updated with an arch and a narrower proportion to resemble what was originally there. He said they propose to install a new or salvaged pair of storm doors for the main entrance. He said he added the solid, four panel basement door detail for review.

Carson Carter moved to approve the application as submitted, subject to the following:

- The roof shingle material shall be either simulated slate or genuine slate material.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2023-123

Applicant: Chris Berg/Berg + Moss Architects, PC
Owner: The Foundry at Washington Park Condominium Association
Location: 70 Johnes Street

Returning for determination on window replacement.

Chris Berg, Damaris Mercado and Robert Szeli appeared before the Board.

Mr. Berg gave an overview of the updates to the elevations since the August meeting. He said the window proposal for Phase I & II had been simplified to include Weathershield aluminum clad wood windows in an Evergreen color. He said the windows will be uniform and the color is a slightly darker hue than the Phase III brown windows.

Ms. Mercado said the Evergreen color blends in with the current brown windows and any replaced green windows of Phase III. She said that the color contrast is not stark.

Mr. Szeli said much of the Phase III green windows that are currently there have faded in color.

Ms. Mercado said the windows were selected for the condo owners with safety and affordability as a priority. She said the 40-year-old windows no longer open, or slam shut upon whim.

Mr. Berg said all the revisions except the elevation on Edward Street have been simplified to 1/1 window style, including the windows with the half arches. He said the windows on Edward Street will match Phase III with the divided light.

Mr. Nato asked to confirm that the drawings depict the actual window styles.

Mr. Berg confirmed.

Mr. Carter asked if the proposal applies to the Edward Street façade up to the corner.

Mr. Berg said yes.

The Chairperson asked to confirm that the proposal is for an owner who wants to change their windows to do so in this window style to maintain uniformity.

Mr. Berg confirmed.

Ms. Flanagan said the ARC approval guidelines dictate an application must be vested within two years from the date of the approval, and that she would be comfortable only with an approval of this type that lasts for 2 years.

Ms. Szeli said they will re-apply to the ARC Board in two years to maintain the window approval.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the application as submitted, subject to the following condition:

- The approval shall last for 2 years.

Kate Flanagan seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2024-018

Applicant: **Floyd Johnson**

Owner: **Maria Rios**

Location: **196 Broadway**

Returning for determination to restore/renovate the storefront and second floor residential façade.

Floyd Johnson and Maria Rios appeared before the Board.

Mr. Johnson gave an overview of the details requested by the Board at the October 2024 meeting.

Kate Flanagan moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2024-063

Applicant: **Floyd Johnson**

Owner: **Theab Alshaikh**

Location: **124 Renwick Street**

Returning for determination to install new storefront door, install new storefront windows, and paint using colors from the Sherwin Williams Historic Color palette.

Floyd Johnson and Theab Alshaikh appeared before the Board.

Mr. Johnson gave an overview of the details requested by the Board at the October 2024 meeting.

Mr. Carter asked to confirm the proposed flashing material.

Mr. Johnson said white aluminum.

Kate Flanagan moved to approve the application as submitted, subject to the following condition:

- The flashing will be white aluminum material.

Carson Carter seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2024-064

Applicant: Floyd Johnson
Owner: 134 South Street LLC
Location: 134 South Street

Returning for determination to install new storefront door, install new storefront windows, and paint using colors from the Sherwin Williams Historic Color palette.

Floyd Johnson appeared before the Board.

Mr. Johnson gave an overview of the details requested by the Board at the October 2024 meeting.

The Chairperson asked what will come of the historic Israel Pharmacy sign.

Mr. Johnson said the sign is deteriorated and the owner has no plans to maintain the sign.

The Chairperson asked that the owner consider donating the sign for preservation.

Mr. Carson asked if the residential door transom will be preserved.

Mr. Johnson said yes.

Mr. Carter asked to confirm the proposed flashing material.

Mr. Johnson said white aluminum.

Kate Flanagan moved to approve the application as submitted, subject to the following condition:

- The flashing material will be white aluminum.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2024-080

Applicant: Chris Berg/Berg + Moss Architects, PC
Owner: 75 Grove LLC
Location: 190 Dubois Street

Returning for determination to construct a new 3-story, residential building.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the details requested by the Board at the October meeting.

Carson Carter moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2024-081

Applicant: John Rich
Owner: 133 North Realty Partners, LLC
Location: 133 N. Miller Street

Returning for determination to construct a new multi family dwelling on an existing vacant lot. John Rich appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the details requested by the Board at the October 2024 meeting.

The Chairperson asked about the material for the shutters.

Mr. Rich said the shutters would be made of wood.

The Chairperson said the plan reflects Marvin windows or equal. She asked what the proposed “equal” window would be.

Mr. Rich confirmed the windows would be Marvin clad 2/2 style windows with an exterior color of Cashmere.

Mr. Carter requested porch details: side profile, measurements and material specifications.

Mr. Carter requested skirt material details. Currently the plan shows the siding placed down to grade.

Mr. Carter requested details on the dormer windows. He said the proportion of the dormer windows is not in keeping with the size of the building.

Mr. Carter said historically the three-bay windows would line up with the dormer windows. He said the dormer windows do not show a relation to the bay window downstairs.

Mr. Nato agreed and said the symmetry and proportion layout of the surrounding properties do not relate to this proposed building. He said the windows over the front door disproportionately sit close to the side of the building. He said the mass of the bay windows dwarf the front entrance. He said the right-side elevation reflects the dormer windows extending far from the roofline.

Mr. Carter said if they propose the tradition of an old building to this new construction then the historic elements would need to be historically accurate.

Ms. Flanagan requested the submission of measurements, detailed cross section with dimensions, and additional views.

The applicant requested a table of the application.

AR 2024-089

Applicant: Eulogio Santiago
Owner: 10 Overlook Realty Partners LLC
Location: 10 & 12 Overlook Place

Application to construct a new, three-story building on a vacant lot.

Eulogio Santiago and William Lugo appeared before the Board.

Mr. Lugo gave an overview of the details requested by the Board at the October 2024 meeting.

Ms. Flanagan asked to explain the changes to the fenestration as requested at the last meeting.

Mr. Lugo said they addressed changes to the fenestration in the attic area only.

Ms. Flanagan said the lack of symmetry on the top floor remains.

The Chairperson, referring to the right lateral left elevation, said the expanse of space lacks symmetry.

Mr. Carter agreed.

Mr. Carter said the back porch does not tie in with the rear face. He said if they propose the tradition of an old building to this new construction then the historic elements would need to be historically accurate.

Mr. Nato recommends simplifying the window fenestration.

Ms. Flanagan asked about the decision to select a 6/1 window style.

Mr. Carter said 1/1 window style had been in an earlier submission.

Ms. Flanagan recommended returning to the 1/1 window style.

Mr. Nato recommended revisiting the valley as shown in the front elevation, reducing the amount of undulation. He said the current proposal creates an “M” in the roof line.

The applicant requested a table of the application.

AR 2024-091

Applicant: 7 Star Construction Service
Owner: Royal Mgmt Washington LLC
Location: 131 Montgomery Street

Returning from a consent agenda application for determination on installation of new siding material and paint color.

Larry Hartman appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the work performed.

Ms. Flanagan said she did not have an issue with the paint color.

Mr. Carter agreed. He said the siding installed is non-smooth siding, the dimension is different from the original and the window trim had not been preserved. The current work ongoing is not in-kind.

The Chairperson said the installed siding is not in keeping with the East End Historic District guidelines.

Mr. Nato agreed and said this is a significant historic house. He said the trim around the window should have been restored to maintain the historic integrity of the building.

Mr. Carter said he will send the historic drawings to the Land Use Board Secretary to forward as reference.

Ms. Flanagan requested a proposal to correct the work performed.

The applicant requested a table of the application.

AR 2024-071

Applicant: Percy Oblitas
Owner: Percy Oblitas
Location: 85 South Street

Returning for determination to install a new front door.

The applicant did not appear at the meeting. The Board tabled the application.

AR 2024-078

Applicant: Rachel Watts
Owner: Rachel Watts
Location: 84 Beacon Street

Returning for determination to install handrails on the front steps.

Rachel Watts and Patrick Christ appeared before the Board.

Ms. Watts gave an overview of the details requested by the Board at the October 2024 meeting.

Mr. Carter asked how the handrail will attach to the porch.

Mr. Christ said the handrail will attach to the plinth.

Mr. Nato asked if the rail brackets would be visible.

Mr. Christ said the brackets are small, stylized L-brackets that will be located underneath the handrail.

Mr. Carter asked if the stairs would stay the same.

Mr. Christ said the stairs would remain the same.

Carson Carter moved to approve the application as submitted.

Kate Flanagan seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

NEW BUSINESS

AR 2024-087

Applicant: Jorge Martinez
Owner: 23 Prince Street San Miguel LLC/Aurelia Vidal
Location: 180 Broadway

Application to install a new sign.

Jorge Martinez and Estefany Tinoco appeared before the Board.

Ms. Tinoco gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson asked if the new aluminum sign will be placed within the existing sign band.

Ms. Tinoco said yes.

Mr. Nato asked if the sign would be printed and attached.

Ms. Tinoco said yes.

The Chairperson asked if the applicant proposes lighting the sign.

Ms. Tinoco said lighting the sign is not proposed.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Carson Carter moved to approve the application as submitted.

Kate Flanagan seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2024-093

Applicant: Archie Brody
Owner: Archie Brody
Location: 70 Bay View Terrace

Ratification of work performed: Installation of a new window.

Archie Brody appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Ms. Flanagan asked for the total number of replaced windows.

Mr. Brody said three windows.

The Chairperson asked to confirm that those replaced windows are of vinyl material.

Mr. Brody confirmed.

The Chairperson read from the East End Historic District guidelines.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The applicant requested a table of the application.

AR 2024-094

Applicant: Obinna Ekweremuba
Owner: Obinna Ekweremuba
Location: 160 Lander Street

Application to install new windows.

Obinna Ekweremuba appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Carter asked to confirm the window material.

Mr. Ekweremuba said aluminum.

Ms. Flanagan asked if the current windows are original to the house.

Mr. Ekweremuba said yes.

Mr. Carter recommended an internal storm window that is cost and energy efficient.

Mr. Carter said the selected windows are not historically accurate given the false muntin.

Ms. Flanagan recommended preserving the historic window and installing an interior storm window, but if the windows require replacement to replace with a historically appropriate window.

Mr. Carter recommended researching SHPO and NYSERDA tax credits.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The applicant requested a table of the application.

AR 2024-095

Applicant: Chris Berg/Fifth Street Architecture
Owner: Rockland NY Equities LLC
Location: 36 Lutheran Street

Application to install new windows, install new front door, repair front porch, restore and stabilize existing chimney, replace and repoint masonry, repair/restore existing cornice and flashing, and install new lighting fixture.

Chris Berg appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Gregory Nato moved to approve the application as submitted.

Carson Carter seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

AR 2024-096

Applicant: Albert Mizrahi
Owner: Nutopia 40-42 City Terrace LLC
Location: 40-42 City Terrace

Application to install a new fence.

Albert Mizrahi appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project. He said he is seeking approval of a fence higher than the East End Historic District guidelines permit to safeguard the vacant property from garbage and safety issues.

Ms. Flanagan referred to the East End Historic District guidelines regarding fence height.

The Chairperson asked where the fence would attach.

Mr. Mizrahi said in between the two structures, the same position as the chain link.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

Carol Barnett spoke in favor of the application for reasons of safety and garbage that affect her neighboring property.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The applicant requested a table of the application.

AR 2024-097

Applicant: Matthew Sorrell/Sorrell Engineering, PLLC
Owner: Dajma Group Inc.
Location: 45 Liberty Street WH

Application to restore front porch, balcony, front entry stairs, retaining wall, trim, and sidewalk and paint using colors from the Historic Color palette.

Matthew Sorrell and Amjad Quaayem appeared before the Board.

Mr. Sorrell gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Carter asked if the rendering depicts an accurate measurement of the windows.

Mr. Sorrell said no. He said the windows and siding were not part of this application and said he would return with those details.

Mr. Carter asked about the upstairs balcony and missing its front railing and spindles.

Mr. Sorrell said that the balcony will be replaced.

Mr. Carter requested an upstairs balcony design and material specifications.

Mr. Carter asked about the plans for the rotted wood columns on the front porch.

Mr. Quaayem said he plans to replace the columns with the exact column style.

Mr. Carter requested a material specification for the columns.

Mr. Carter asked if the top step of marble remains.

Mr. Quaayem said the top marble step is no longer there.

Mr. Carter asked the status of the front retaining wall.

Mr. Sorrell said the front retaining wall was not stable and had been removed.

Mr. Carter requested the front retaining wall details.

Mr. Carter asked what type of material would be used to restore the front entry stairs.

Mr. Quaayem said pressure treated wood.

Mr. Carter asked if there are any proposed plans to paint the porch.

Mr. Quaayem said yes.

Mr. Carter requested a paint swatch within the Historic Color palette.

Mr. Carter asked if they plan to replace the railing on both sides of the front entrance steps.

Mr. Sorrell said wrought iron railings on both sides of the front entrance steps.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The applicant requested a table of the application.

Mr. Carter said historically there were double storm doors to the front entrance and asked if there are any proposed plans to replace them.

Mr. Quaayem said there are no plans to replace the double storm doors.

The applicant requested a table of the application.

AR 2024-098

Applicant: George Keyer
Owner: Catherine Blanche
Location: 95 Beacon Street

Application to install a new fence.

George Keyer appeared before the Board and gave an overview of the proposed project.

Ms. Flanagan asked for the proposed fence material.

Mr. Keyer said cedar.

Ms. Flanagan asked if the fence would be painted.

Mr. Keyer said no.

Ms. Flanagan asked the applicant to show the placement of the proposed fence.

Mr. Keyer, using the submitted placement of the fence on the property map, demonstrated the area where the fence will be placed.

Mr. Carter asked to confirm that the fence would jog in and out on the Bay View Terrace side.

Mr. Keyer confirmed and said a tree would be planted within the inward jog area.

Ms. Flanagan recommended starting the fence in alignment with the front of the building on the Beacon Street side, and the fence in the rear yard.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

The Chairperson requested submission of an updated drawing.

The applicant requested a table of the application.

AR 2024-099

Applicant: Dimitri Brand/Holesum Studio
Owner: Habitat for Humanity of Greater Newburgh Inc.
Location: 227 Third Street

Application to install new windows, install new doors, restore stairways, construct a new, wood bump out to replace existing, install new siding, rebuild corbels and fascia, remove bay window and patch, repair/repoint brick, and paint using color from the Historic Color palette.

Dimitri Brand and Stephen DeGroat appeared before the Board.

Mr. Brand gave an overview of the proposed project.

Mr. Carter asked what would be placed around the light well.

Mr. Brand said a wrought iron fence.

Ms. Flanagan requested a drawing to illustrate the material, the placement and how the fence will attach to the building.

The Assistant Corporation Counsel said the light well fence was not represented on this application. He said if the applicant wanted a vote on the fence, the applicant would either table to the next meeting for the fence details or vote on what is currently submitted and submit a new application for the fence at a later date.

Mr. DeGroat said they would submit a new application for the light well fence.

The Chairperson opened the public hearing.

There was no one present for or against the application.

The Chairperson closed the public hearing.

Kate Flanagan moved to approve the application as submitted.

The Chairperson seconded the motion.

The motion passed unanimously via roll-call vote.

With no further business to discuss, the meeting adjourned at 9:40 p.m.

Respectfully Submitted:

J.K. Gentile, Secretary